This electronic thesis or dissertation has been downloaded from the King's Research Portal at https://kclpure.kcl.ac.uk/portal/



## Can Discourse Analysis Contribute to a Theology of Preaching A Case Study of Four Senior Anglican Clergy

Chapman, Ann Beatrice

Awarding institution: King's College London

The copyright of this thesis rests with the author and no quotation from it or information derived from it may be published without proper acknowledgement.

#### END USER LICENCE AGREEMENT



Unless another licence is stated on the immediately following page this work is licensed

under a Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial-NoDerivatives 4.0 International

licence. https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc-nd/4.0/

You are free to copy, distribute and transmit the work

Under the following conditions:

- Attribution: You must attribute the work in the manner specified by the author (but not in any way that suggests that they endorse you or your use of the work).
- Non Commercial: You may not use this work for commercial purposes.
- No Derivative Works You may not alter, transform, or build upon this work.

Any of these conditions can be waived if you receive permission from the author. Your fair dealings and other rights are in no way affected by the above.

#### Take down policy

If you believe that this document breaches copyright please contact <u>librarypure@kcl.ac.uk</u> providing details, and we will remove access to the work immediately and investigate your claim.

Download date: 15. Jan. 2025

# This electronic theses or dissertation has been downloaded from the King's Research Portal at https://kclpure.kcl.ac.uk/portal/



**Title:**Can Discourse Analysis Contribute to a Theology of Preaching A Case Study of Four Senior Anglican Clergy

#### Author: Ann Beatrice Chapman

The copyright of this thesis rests with the author and no quotation from it or information derived from it may be published without proper acknowledgement.

#### END USER LICENSE AGREEMENT



This work is licensed under a Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial-NoDerivs 3.0 Unported License. http://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc-nd/3.0/

#### You are free to:

• Share: to copy, distribute and transmit the work

Under the following conditions:

- Attribution: You must attribute the work in the manner specified by the author (but not in any way that suggests that they endorse you or your use of the work).
- Non Commercial: You may not use this work for commercial purposes.
- No Derivative Works You may not alter, transform, or build upon this work.

Any of these conditions can be waived if you receive permission from the author. Your fair dealings and other rights are in no way affected by the above.

#### Take down policy

If you believe that this document breaches copyright please contact <u>librarypure@kcl.ac.uk</u> providing details, and we will remove access to the work immediately and investigate your claim.

## **Kings College London**

### **Research Based Thesis**

For the Degree of Doctor of Theology and Ministry

## **DThMin:**

Can Discourse Analysis Contribute to a Theology of

Preaching: A Case Study of Four Senior Anglican

Clergy

## **Ann Beatrice Chapman**

**Department of Education and Professional Studies** 

**July 2012** 

#### Acknowledgements

Over the time that this thesis has taken to develop and come into existence my family and friends have been very patient with me. They have listened to my ideas and developments with interest, support and encouragement. Some have not realized that they have been hearing my ideas in the raw. For all of you I would like to say thank you. Others have paid a more direct role and to them I would like to say a special thank you, especially to the congregations that have participated some times willingly and sometimes unknowingly.

This thesis has opened up a whole new way of thinking for me, which has changed how I work. There are two very extraordinary people, without whom it would never have been completed. First of all I want to thank my primary supervisor, Professor Celia Roberts. She has taken me from an intuitive understanding of language to recognition that there is so much more to language than I ever knew was possible in a very short time and has worked extremely hard to get me here. Without her patience and encouragement this work would not exist except in the recesses of my mind. Then there is Christine, a remarkable woman whose patience is beyond understanding. Without her the thesis would still be just words on a page. She taught me so much about the art of coherent writing at the same time as giving me confidence in what I was trying to do. Thank you Christine.

Can Discourse Analysis Contribute to a Theology of Preaching: A Case Study of Four Senior Anglican Clergy.

#### **Abstract**

The work of the educationalist Paulo Freire recognizes the importance of relationship and participation in the process of learning. This thesis is an inquiry into the nature of preaching a sermon and the potential impact different modes of the delivery can make. It uses the work of Rose and Bourdieu to form a framework into which the development of relationship and participation can be placed. This thesis aims to break new ground by demonstrating the value of using Discourse Analysis as a powerful tool to be used in the preparation and delivering of sermons.

The performances of sermons by four senior Anglican clergy are examined using different forms of discourse analysis. The main tool used here is James Paul Gee's approach to linguistic analysis of narrative. The thesis examines the different methods and language presented in the case-study sermons and the similar strategies that are used in different ways to maintain authority whilst encouraging listeners to participate. It also takes into account the social nature of language. Not only are the texts scrutinized but also the performance. The ensuing discussion attempts to understand how each preacher uses poetic and rhetorical performance strategies and linguistic techniques to draw listeners into participation. It also considers if they overcome the tension between equality and authority in order to enable listeners to experience the mystery of God.

This deliberation considers how preachers demonstrate their underlying purpose of

preaching by comparing their strategy with Rose's four categories of preaching. The culmination of the thesis is the recognition that homiletics would benefit from an understanding of discourse analysis and performance.

## **Contents**

Title Page	1
Acknowledgements	2
Abstract	3
Chapter 1 Introduction	7
2 Literature Review	19
3 Methodology	44
4 Homiletics and Discourse Analy	rsis 55
5 Thematic Analysis	129
6 Conclusion	166
Appendices	176
Bibliography	247

## Appendices

<b>Appendix 1:</b> The Archbishop of Canterbury's text as verse	176
marked with lines, stanzas and strophes	
2: The Dean of Ripon Cathedral's text as verse	185
marked with lines, stanzas and strophes	
3: The Dean of Ripon Cathedrals sermon showing	200
the mainline theme	
4: The Archbishop of York's text as verse	203
marked with lines, stanzas and strophes	
5: The Archbishop of York's sermon: a 'reading'	218
of the focused material for each stanza	
<b>6:</b> The Bishop of Knaresborough's text as verse	222
marked with lines, stanzas and strophes	
7: The Bishop of Knaresborough's mainline themes	233
8: A comparison of the four sermons	236
9: Further biographical details on the four senior clergy	240
10: Areas covered in the DThMin Programme	243

#### Chapter 1

#### Introduction

The major focus of this thesis is the use by the discipline of homiletics of the sociological material found in discourse analysis. Using discourse analysis to discover the sociolinguistic context behind sermonic language offers new insights for the teaching of homiletics. Ultimately it raises the question: what is happening when a sermon is preached? The research undertaken here seeks to put aside the 'point of writing' of a sermon and to examine its delivery and the different linguistic and discourse structures used to create a performance The work of many scholars both in theology and in the field of linguistics have been studied in order to provide a structure within which to use discourse analysis as the major tool. The aim of the thesis is to advance the understanding of the methods that can be used to aid the preacher to communicate more effectively with her/his congregation and, therefore, hopefully to enable both her and her listeners to move forward together *in their faith*.

A sermon is a fundamental part of any act of worship. Its purpose is to enable those taking part to draw closer to God. Those who preach most weeks, navigating between stories past and present, are in a unique relationship to their listeners, helping to shape their theology by recalling God's past revelation in Scripture and reflecting on the possibilities of his involvement in the present. The words that preachers use and how they relate to their listeners is essential to how those listeners grasp the mystery of God and recognize God's participation in their lives.

The radical educationalist Paulo Freire believed that the relationship between teacher and student is crucial to learning. His pioneering view was that through the right kind of education, avoiding authoritarian teacher-pupil models and based on the actual experiences of the students and continual shared investigation, every human being, no matter what their status, could develop a new awareness of self, freeing them to be more than passive objects responding to uncontrollable change (Freire, 1993). The question is: does this approach to teaching have any relevance for those who deliver sermons? If the purpose of preaching is to enable listeners to understand how faith relates to their everyday life then Freire's relational view of teaching offers preachers a place to begin.

While this relational dialogic informs the theme of this thesis, Freire's work is used only as a starting point to introduce this notion. The main analytical framework is taken from the work of Rose. Creating a community of learning where preachers and listeners learn together (discussed in Chapter 2) opens up the prospect of creating a local theology, rather than merely emulating that of the preacher.

#### 1.1. The History and Reason for Sermons: Divine and Human Relationships

An examination of the history of the development of the sermon demonstrates that it is slowly moving in a similar direction to the approach of Freire. In the Anglican Church in 1549 the first Book of Common Prayer service reinstated daily prayer services focussed on the reading of scripture but without the provision of a sermon. However, as time passed, the combination of Morning Prayer, litany and ante-communion, which

-

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> See later in section 1.2.1

had become the staple Sunday morning diet of most English parish churches, was usually accompanied by a lengthy sermon. This also became the practice for Evening Prayer. With the later addition of hymns, this basic Sunday pattern persisted well into the twentieth century. At the turn of the twentieth century liturgical books and studies were introduced and these helped to shape more formal worship in many churches. Books were expected not to be used as the Book of Common Prayer but to provide guidance in the ordering and conduct of worship. Provision was also made within the Church of England for a third service to be held on a Sunday, supplementary to the statutory services of Morning and Evening Prayer.<sup>2</sup>

By 1985, the Report of the Archbishops' Council on the Inner Cities, *Faith in the City*, pointed to a need for more informal and spontaneous acts of worship in Urban Priority Areas. The ensuing work on informal structures suitable for use in Anglican churches reached a milepost in 1989 with the report *Patterns for Worship*. The same report put in a plea for the language of worship to become more concrete and less philosophical with an appropriate use of meaningful symbols. These proposals represented a huge step forward, but whatever the structure of the liturgy; the expectation was that a sermon would be preached (*New SCM Dictionary of Liturgy and Worship*, 2002, p. 481). In seeking to justify the need for the sermon in whatever form, it is important to recognize that preaching is a dual event – divine and human in harmony – and duality is the pattern of the understanding of God in the Christian tradition. God is revealed through the visible and the audible (cf. Genesis 1) and is then fulfilled in Jesus:

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> For more details of this period of preaching history see O.C. Edwards Jr, (2004) *A History of Preaching*. Nashville, TN: Abingdon Press.

'In Jesus, the witness to God of the visible creation and the audible Torah come together in perfect harmony ..... Thus the Scriptures ground our preaching ministry not only in the historical narrative of the evolution of God's speech, but also in the grand story of how his self-communication is at the very heart of his work in creating and redeeming the world' (Stephen I. Wright, 2010, p. 104).

In the first chapter of the book of Genesis God's only activity is speaking. On this basis it is probably reasonable to assume that humanity is a speaking image of a God whose word is powerful and central to his relationship with the created world (Wright, 2010). Consideration of this level of connection between the 'Word of God' and sermonic language will be developed further in Chapter 2. In the biblical narrative words are the instrument of humanity's creation and downfall. Understanding the use and misuse of words is therefore essential to the revelation of God, because the Christian tradition suggests Jesus brought God's word into action by how he lived his life and how he willingly died. As Wright notes, since Jesus' performance of this 'Word' continues the narrative of God's work with humanity demonstrated in Scripture (2010, p. 104), on this basis it is also probably reasonable to suggest that preaching is the emulation of this performance making it essential that preachers understand the power of words and how they are performed.

The recognition of the importance of words in liturgy was confirmed when a Service of the Word, born out of the Patterns of Worship report was finally authorised by the Anglican Church in 1993 (and reauthorized in 1999 to take account of the provisions of Common Worship). It is unique as a Church of England service, since it consists principally of a menu of essential elements that must be included in any service of the word together with notes and directions, which allow for a wide range of optional elements and local variation within a common structure. Thus the structure may be used

to construct a variety of forms of service, from an informal family or all-age worship to regular patterns of daily prayer.

#### 1.2. Theology of Preaching and Discourse Analysis.

#### 1.2.1 The Relationship of Preacher and Listener

Educational and scriptural evidence emphasises the significance of the relationship between preachers and listeners as well as recognition of the power of words. Since the rationale behind a sermon is to enable listeners to experience the mystery of God it is important to examine the theology of preaching. A theology of preaching takes as its starting point the development of the ministry of the Word of God through the Scripture. This word is mediated via Jesus Christ at work by means of his Holy Spirit in the world and through creation. Revelation comes out of the community of faith even as God continues to take the initiative and to be in control of his own self-revelation (Wright, 2010, p. 104). In order that preachers are aware of this revelation they need to be more fully aware of themselves and the impact their history has on the meaning of the words that they use. This will be further discussed in Chapter 2 but if preaching is a three-way conversation, then lucidity comes when each participant is clear about his or her involvement.

Most preachers expect/hope that their listeners will meet with God as they listen to the sermon. However, this meeting is as mysterious as God and it is not open to analysis, so any evaluation of preaching needs to acknowledge this additional facet within the sermon. In addition, there are many other unquantifiable influences on the development of the theological stance of a congregation. As will be discussed later, each person has a

unique way of responding to a sermon, accepting some of the premises and rejecting those that do not resonate with them. To ensure that preachers are clear about their role in the conversation mentioned above discourse analysis enables them to place themselves within the language that they use. This level of clarity creates the possibility of discovering the divine within a sermon.

When communication is working well these understandings are processed, at least partly, below the level of consciousness. For example, as Deborah Tannen proposes, meaning in language comes from a complex of relationships both internal to the listener and external to the speaker. She suggests these two relational patterns correspond respectively to patterns of repetition of incidents in prior experiences; a stone is understood as a stone because of previous experiences of a stone. Reflecting Bakhtin's views on dialogue between different languages Tannen recognizes a dialogical relationship between an utterance and one that has gone before, conveying meaning by association (Bakhtin, 2008, p.76; Tannen, 2007, p.9).

In order to analyse a sermon from the perspective of the preacher, J. Randall Nichols (1980) states that preachers should create an environment that encourages listeners to make their own connections between their lives and the 'good news of the gospel'.

Allen Bell (1997) takes this a step further. He considers text from the perspective of the listener and, recognizing the power of words, appreciates that speakers need to attune their speech to the perceived norm for their listeners. The impact of this shift from preacher to listener depends on the relationship between speaker and hearer and to some extent on the relationship a speaker has with him or herself.

As Freire's work suggests, teaching (or preaching) carries not just a literal message but subliminal messages of identity, social relations, and culture. This means that preachers cannot "hide" themselves from their listeners and, as André Resner Jn. (1994) acknowledges, they cannot fail to project themselves when they speak. Preachers implicitly disclose something of themselves, their relationship to their listeners, and their expectations of those listeners. Those who flourish are those whose language creates an atmosphere in which listeners can recognize themselves and, therefore, make connections with their own experiences. This suggests that preachers will, in a sense, preach as many sermons as there are people listening, because the meaning of the words is located in the space between listeners and the preacher (Wright, 2010, p.41).

As noted above, scholars have identified that the meanings of words are dependent on the relationship that speakers and hearers have with themselves, their context and with each other. This notion of meaning is taken up by G. Long (Interpretation 44, 1991) in the recognition that the meaning of a biblical text is dependent on the imagination of listeners. Lucy Atkinson Rose takes this notion of connection between preachers and listeners further and proposes an additional view of preaching (1997, p.1). She uses the term 'conversational' and describes it as 'communal, heuristic and non-hierarchical'. It grows out of a desire to answer the question, 'what is the purpose of preaching?'

Reflecting on existing praxis, Rose formulates a new understanding of the purpose of preaching that validates her own experiences at the same time as 'reimaging' and 'enriching' homiletics. Rose suggests that preachers and their listeners are colleagues sitting around the same table, where believing is the main focus. Conversational preaching aims to nurture both divine-human conversations between believers and the

Word as found in scriptural texts, and human-human conversations. After discussing the 'why' of conversational preaching Rose examines the new 'whats' and 'hows' that have grown out of the 'why' (1997, pp. 2-4). Rose's views, which will be discussed later, form the theological framework for the thesis.

#### 1.2.2 Using Discourse Analysis

As members of the community of faith how can preachers know where their words end and 'revelation' begins? Since sermons are constructed of language in interaction, a more specific set of theories and methods are needed that focus on language and its use as a topic. The aim of this thesis is to examine possible tools that a preacher can use that will enable the listener to get closer to God. One of these tools is Discourse Analysis. Discourse analysis is the study of the use of language in communication and the impact it has on how listeners receive, understand and respond to what is being said. This thesis will use discourse analysis to examine material from three basic positions: the theological; the homiletic and the linguistic.

When preachers preach listeners interpret what they have heard and that interpretation is a combination of the structural properties of the text, the way the text is delivered or performed, creative inferences drawn on the basis of context and of previous experiences. Words carry a myriad of different meanings depending on both the contexts brought in and brought about in the interaction of speaker and listeners. Discourse analysis takes into account all these different layers of meaning, recognizing that they do not work in parallel but in conjunction. Language is an intricate, semiotic system that has been developed for social communication. As such, it is a combination of language, intentions and situations as well as a combination of the syntax and

semantics of a language. The specific environment in which discourse occurs is another factor in the interpretation. Language only has meaning within a context and it is also itself context creating (Duranti and Goodwin 1992)

Discourse analysis is an interdisciplinary study and, although linguistics and anthropology are fundamental, discourse analysis also incorporates a range of disciplines including the subjects of Sociology, Education and Psychology. It is concerned with not only written texts but also spoken texts that may indeed have been originally written texts. The analysis of the spoken texts reflects a difference in focus from the subjects listed above. This type of analysis differs from them as it is interested in the total of the language mechanisms and strategies that operate in discourse. Texts are embedded in social and cultural practices, shaping and being shaped by them, hence the importance of context. So, discourse analysis is concerned with the ways in which sociocultural and ideological practices take effect in language, particularly in the language of texts. (Georgakopoulou and Goutsos, 2001, pp. iix, 1-8).

Although some research has been undertaken on the language of preachers and how it is understood, generally little attention has been given to the contribution that discourse analysis can make to an understanding of the theology of preaching (Wright, 2010, p.62). This thesis aims to contribute towards addressing that balance. In order to provide a framework for analysis, this research draws on the work of several scholars such as the critical theorist, Pierre Bourdieu; the critical discourse analyst Norman Fairclough (2001) and the sociologist Erving Goffman(1981) whose work centres on interaction as an 'order' in its own right and the performative work that speakers do in managing social interaction. It will also include the linguist Dell Hymes and the discourse analyst

James Paul Gee (1991) whose analytic methods for studying narrative are particularly relevant to this thesis.

#### 1.2.3 Four Case Studies

The purpose of this thesis is to consider how discourse analysis might contribute to a theology of preaching a sermon. What, if anything, can it bring to the question of whether a sermon can enable those listening to experience the revelation of God?<sup>3</sup> This thesis also seeks to demonstrate that by recognizing the multi-faceted layers that combine to produce the language of a sermon, preachers will be able to modify their text to enable their listeners to find their own theology.

The case studies of four senior Anglican clergy provide the opportunity to analyse their work, thus raising questions about the 'how' of preaching. These senior clergymen were chosen because of their experience as preachers:

- The Archbishop of Canterbury, Rowan Williams, preaches to Her Majesty the Queen along with members of the royal family, senior politicians, military leaders and service personnel at St Paul's Cathedral.
- 2. The Bishop of Knaresborough, James Bell, preaches to ordained clergy with some lay workers and members of their churches at Ripon Cathedral.
- The Archbishop of York, John Sentamu, preaches to the congregation of a village church, along with school children and local dignitaries at St Andrew and St Mary Church in Paull,

-

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>3</sup> For an elaboration of this point see Chapter 2

4. The Dean of Ripon Cathedral, Keith Jukes, preaches to an ecumenical group in the open air on a village green in Bainbridge Wensleydale.

The sermons analysed are of very different context, style, content, and performance and this illustrates the range of design and delivery that comes under the broad category of 'preaching a sermon'. Despite the variations in context of the sermons there is a consistency of thematic features within them all, although each one uses the resources of language and interaction in different ways and with a different balance. Discourse analysis uncovers the complex strategies used by all the preachers. It creates an opportunity for preachers to recognize hidden meaning and purpose behind their choice of sermonic language. With this knowledge preachers will be empowered to be more critical of the words that they choose. As has been previously mentioned, language is contextual whilst at the same time creating context. This unique way of using discourse analysis in homiletics offers preachers a tool, that will enable them to be more clear about the context that they are aiming to create and, therefore, more able to engage their listeners and discern revelation (see section 2.1.4) The use of a tool such as discourse analysis is needed because, as is frequently clear, many preachers do not interact with their listeners in a way that would optimise the listeners' understanding of and growth in their faith. While discourse analysis has been used for analysing the text of the Bible despite extensive searches in relevant publications, it appears not to have been applied to sermons.

The analysis of each sermon is based on the literature reviewed in Chapter 2. The methodology outlined in Chapter 3 is used in Chapter 4 to analyse the case studies.

Chapter 5 builds on Chapter 4 by taking the themes identified there and recognizes the

similarities and differences in their use by each of the preachers, demonstrating how the four senior Anglican clergy achieve linguistic distinctiveness. The final chapter draws conclusions about the possible contribution that discourse analysis can make to a theology of preaching and to the future of homiletics.

#### Chapter 2

#### Literature Review

The focus of this chapter is a review of relevant sources of the different approaches to the theology of preaching. These publications, to a greater or lesser extent, provide the springboard for the research embodied in the primary source case studies in later chapters. The publications of Lucy Atkinson Rose; Pierre Bourdieu; Deborah Tannen; and Dell Hymes are of particular importance in forming a framework within which to position the following research and findings of this thesis. The study draws on linguistics and discourse analysis when there is a relevant connection to the homiletic studies. In order to provide a coherent structure for the review of secondary sources, most of the works will be discussed in groups under the umbrella of homiletics (the art of writing and/or preaching a sermon), with particular focus on: Preaching a Sermon; Towards a Community; The Uses of Language, Textual Analysis and Interaction; Performance; and Community of Learning; and Style.

#### 2.1 Preaching a Sermon

As discussed earlier, there are many different views as to the purpose of a sermon and also to the delivery. Lucy Atkinson Rose (1997) suggests that there are three generally accepted dominant voices in the field of homiletics: the traditional or classic view; the kerygmatic view; and the transformational view. In addition, Rose proposes that there should be a fourth voice; the conversational view. Each of her views focuses on the relationship between preachers and listeners. This focus raises the fundamental question

of how preachers can enable listeners to engage with the performance and what affect the preacher's language has on the comprehension and, therefore, the development of the faith of the listeners. When preachers deliver a sermon they use a series of different methods and language depending on several factors including: the scripture upon which they are focusing; to whom they are speaking; and what, in Rose's view, they believe is the purpose of the sermon. Using the works of other scholars as well as Rose, her four 'views' are discussed here in some detail in order to establish the theological basis upon which this study will move forward.

#### 2.1.1 The Traditional or Classic View of Preaching

The traditional view of preaching supports the idea that the sermon's purpose is to instil and transmit Christian beliefs (Rose, 1997, p.14). The primary task of preachers is to persuade their listeners and effect agreement on a particular interpretation of doctrine and way of behaving as well as to challenge heresy. This view suits those who believe preachers to be the authority on interpretation of Scripture and the way of life for the community of faith (1997, p. 21). One of the problems of this approach, which Rose identifies, is that it separates preachers from listeners, creating a sense of the preacher as the sender of information and the listener as the receiver (1997, p.22). This, in turn, implies a one-directional movement of the truth from preacher to listener. The impact of this, Rose notes, is to suggest that a sermon gives answers and that words always convey objective reality. She also maintains that, in this approach, the emphasis is on rationality and clarity. As a result, imagination and the mysterious or indefinable are given only a minor status within the sermon (1997, p.30-33).

J.R. Nichols is a proponent of this view and examines the design of a sermon from the point of view of the preacher (1980, p. 25). Nichols suggests that while preachers should have some basic understanding and empathy for where the listeners are in terms of their capacity to think reflectively and abstractly, the priority is then to lead the congregation progressively beyond their present situation (1980, p. 39). He holds that the strategic stance of preachers should always be one of being slightly in advance of their listeners, in order to take them forward. Apart from listening and accepting, listeners do not take an active role in the performance of the sermon.

#### 2.1.2 The Kerygmatic View of Preaching

Kerygma theory goes beyond the traditional view of persuasive discourse, by promoting the understanding of preaching as eventful discourse. Rose claims that the concerns of the kerygmatic theory broaden the classic view to include the nature of language in general. It assumes that preachers' words facilitate God's Word so that a sermon mediates God's saving activity. This continues the link between preaching and communication established in the traditional theory but in this case it is God who is the communicator and, therefore, responsible for self-revelation. This is a major difference because in the traditional theory every word of the preacher is capable of delivering the reality of God. In the kerygmatic interpretation however, preachers should convey the actual content of the gospel as proclaimed by the apostles and make its fundamental importance and truth clear. Rose believes that this approach, rather than drawing preacher and listener closer together, widens the gap between them. God speaks in the sermon so preachers are co-workers with God, but God is responsible for communicating divine revelation to those listening and the results are also God's responsibility. The listener, therefore, again takes a largely passive role.

The position of the kerygmatic approach is that whilst the meaning of language changes, God's Word remains constant. However, as Rose argues, there is little certainty that language in the Bible reflects divine reality because the meanings of words shift, complicating translation and making it a difficult task (1997, p.55). The problem therefore with a kerygmatic view of preaching is the dislocation between words and their meaning (1997, pp.38, 43-48). The idea of the unchanging *kerygma*, however, causes some difficulty. How can preachers know the word of God for any occasion?

An example of the kerygmatic approach is to be found in Karl Barth's understanding of homiletics that preaching must conform to revelation because God wills it (Barth, 1991). Barth assumes preachers are drawn into this event, which becomes a constituent part of their own existence (1991, p.50). When they listen to the self-revealing will of God they then have full authority, which rests on both that of the church given at ordination, and on God. It is Barth's opinion that preaching is a theological concept which arises in the faith of the preacher, and which can only point to divine reality (1991, p.46).

#### 2.1.3 The Transformational View of Preaching

A transformational view expresses the generally held belief that a sermon should be an encounter that transforms the listener. It emphasises the preacher's responsibility to enable a change in the listeners' values, worldviews or reality. However preaching is the experience that demonstrates new ways of being in the world and is, therefore experiential. Preachers come down from their pedestal and stand under the Word along

with the congregation, inviting them to participate in the event. It is transforming but the listeners are still the receivers though they are now more active than in the classic and kerygmatic approaches (Rose, 1997, pp59-61). Preaching is no longer grounded in theology or biblical theology. Rather it is in the interpretation of texts, that have the power to shape meaning in the interpreter and theology no longer defines truth; the shift is to hermeneutics from epistemology (Rose, 1997, pp. 62-66). Proponents of this view suggest preachers recognize that the connection between biblical text and today's world is poetic and metaphorical. They know that the meaning for today is not lying there in the text but is given only when the interpreter brings together the two poles of yesterday and today allowing the spark of imagination to jump between them (Wright 2010).

Elements of Rose's transformational view of preaching are also reflected in the publications of the linguist and literacy specialist, Walter J. Ong (2010), particularly in his notion of orality generating meaning. In this view Rose suggests sermonic language shapes consciousness because it reflects a construct of reality; change one and the other is also changed. Ong, however, does not deal with the issues of separation between speaker and listener or the limited nature of language that take Rose to a new understanding of sermonic language. Ong suggests most developments in society have themselves been affected by the move from 'orality to literacy' (2010, p.172). He emphasises that while the religious traditions of mankind have their origins in the distant oral past, as writing developed they were embedded in the development of sacred texts (2010, pp.175, 176). This notion is found also in Tostengard's suggestion that text is 'a living language voice in search of a hearer, a voice which seeks to break upon us from beyond' (Tostengard, The Spoken Word, 1989, p.81 in Rose 1997, p.67).

It is generally agreed that the text of a sermon is, effectively, a speech, that is prepared word for word and written down. Writing it is a creative production demanding appropriate language from the point of view of content as well as expression; form and content must not be separated (Barth, 1991, p.119). The shape of a sermon is not a description of the way the content of the sermon is set out; it is a description of the process of communication between preachers and listeners. Starting from the proposition that text is used to denote written speech, Ong, following Barth, contends written texts generate meanings when they are 'read' aloud and because of this the visual presentation element is secondary to spoken language (2010, p.8).

The transformational view of preaching has the conviction that language shapes human consciousness and so has the power to change perceptions. As will be discussed in detail below (Section2.5) words are performative. The focus is on the mystery of God, which demands language that is imaginative, ambiguous and evocative (Rose, 1997, p.67). Because the transformational view of preaching recognizes that language shapes human consciousness, listeners will have their theological consciousness shaped by the theological language of their preacher. Ronald J. Allen develops this idea, suggesting that the purpose of the sermon for preachers is to interpret a biblical text from the perspective of their theological assumptions, typically manifesting characteristics of the theological tradition to which they belong (2008, p.89). Allen calls preachers to relive the occurrences that gave rise to the text and to construct a similar experience for their listeners (2008, pp. 6, 7).

-

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>4</sup> Implicit in a performative word is the action that it denotes

G. Long displays a transformational approach when he proposes that there are two distinct elements in the production of a sermon; the preacher turns towards the ancient text, extracting its internal meanings and then states the implications of those meanings for the particular context (Interpretation 44, pp.341-355). He agrees with Nineham who found between any ancient text and any contemporary application of that text stands an act of imagination on the part of the interpreter. So if transformational preaching assumes consciousness is shaped by language then Allen is correct and the theological context affects the preachers' language. Long and Nineham take this a step further by proposing that the preachers' interpretation of the Bible must be affected by their imaginations, which are conditioned by their context, which affects their theology.

In the 1970s Fred B. Craddock discussed the changing role of preachers, suggesting that a preacher should be someone who listens to and experiences the Word of God in relationship to and alongside listeners (1974, pp. 35,43,83). Engaging listeners in active participation, both during and after the sermon is preached, encourages them to actively reflect on it and come to their own life transforming conclusions. Craddock directly challenges the distance between preacher and listener (1974, p.19). He expects a sermon is not about God but about the listeners' lives in relation to God and words are performative at the same time as reflecting the listeners' world (1974, 80). Each of the views of preaching mentioned in this section moves towards closing the gap between preachers and listeners. As will be seen, these views are used in the primary research into the case studies. However, as the next section will demonstrate, there is more to be done in order to bring the preacher and listener together.

#### 2.1.4 The Conversational View of Preaching

Unlike the traditional, kerygmatic, and transformational views that accept a gap between preacher and listener, a conversational view of preaching begins with the involvement of preacher and listeners. In addition, it emphasizes not only the local community but also that group's place within the wider Christian community and the world. The conversational view of the purpose of preaching describes what may be happening when a community of faith is gathering around the Word and refocusing its central conversations. It is about shared focus, interpretation, discernment, and direction finding. These encourage the Church to recognize itself as a priesthood of all believers. At a specific time preaching can be part of the confirmation and endorsement of a particular church's values as it seeks to live in accordance with the gospel. Fundamental exchanges between God's people are fostered at the same time as acknowledging that these conversations are all inclusive (Rose, 1997, p.98).

Rose's conversational view of preaching suggests that, unlike traditional sermonic language which is clear and precise, conversational sermonic language is able to generate multiple meanings inviting listeners to formulate their own, 'by choosing words, old and new, that opens up the richness and depths of life's myriad experiences and faith's hidden treasures' (Rose, 1997, p.111). It is very important for preachers, therefore, to understand that they have no control on listeners' response and that the sermon's reality is not simply theirs but also that of the listeners. A sermon, therefore, should communicate a process of thinking that enables those listening to understand themselves and their lives more clearly (Rose, 1997, p.9). Preacher and listeners become partners in a conversation that includes God in the midst of community (Rose 1997, p.98).

David Schlafer also stresses that preaching is a sacred conversation and believes this perspective is an essential starting point in any theology of preaching (1994, p. xvi). He adds another layer to Rose's transformational view by postulating that a sermon is a tripartite conversation between preacher, listeners and God. In addition, within a sermon can be found the voices of the scripture, the culture in which it is immersed and the liturgical patterns of the worship. Schlafer believes preaching is an open-ended conversation and uses the example of the Society of Friends to make the point that a sermon 'is brought to birth through the shared efforts of the participants who enter a very spacious conversation'. He suggests that preachers should engage their listeners by creating a connection with themselves and their text that would open up the opportunity for everyone to learn and contribute. Schlafer claims that this kind of participation enriches the individual and deepens the bond between preacher and listeners (1994, pp.123-129). The studies of Rose and Schlafer provide a helpful structure in regards to the research in this thesis.

So, in summary, all of the voices around the homiletic table can be recognized in the view of Ong: that when a text is 'read' aloud meaning is generated between speaker/preacher and listeners. If reading a text generates meaning, it is possible that using a particular language generates a particular meaning and, therefore, reveals the possibility that sermonic language can point to the different purposes of preaching mentioned above. However, the three dominant voices, in Rose's view, each demonstrate difficulties in the position of the preacher in relation to the listeners. For example, the classic and kerygmatic views maintain a distance between preacher and listener that does not maximise the opportunities for spiritual growth and understanding; but in human terms, is based more on the power and authority of the preacher. The

transformational view lessens the gap between listener and preacher but just seeks to transform, while the conversational view opens up the opportunity for preacher and listener to travel together as community and, in human terms, maximise the potential for a growth of understanding and faith. Discourse analysis, in this thesis, will be used to identify to what extent Rose's conversational approach is found within the four case studies. In order to ascertain the best ways for a preacher to establish the conversational approach, the details of the delivery need to be identified. Features such as performance (see section 2.4) and style (see section 2.6) are important. The work of Bourdieu is helpful here, particularly his views on community that are elaborated upon in the following section.

#### 2.2 Towards a Community

The major focus of the work of Pierre Bourdieu (2010) is not homiletics but some of what he says is very relevant to the direction of this study. Even though not all his views are adopted for use here, it is necessary to examine them, albeit at an overview level, in order to gain as wide a picture as possible of recent research. Bourdieu analyses how people conduct their lives in relation to one another and to major social institutions. He is a critical theorist who is trying to understand inequality and whose opinions on *field* and *habitus* lead to a critique of power created within a particular field. *Field* in Bourdieu's terms is always critically charged as a place where power and equality (or the lack of it) are played out. He says the whole content of communication (and not just

-

<sup>5</sup> Bourdieu uses the word *field*, to denote a space, for example, a political or a religious space. The field is an autonomous universe, a kind of arena in which people play a game that has its own unique rules and these differ from the game played in other fields. The people who are involved in the game have specific interests, which are not defined by their mandators (i.e. those whom a person represents in the game). The people who serve the interests of their mandators well are those who serve their own interests by serving others; it is to their advantage and it is important that it should be so for the system to work. (1991, p. 215) He also uses the word *habitus*, which represents a set of dispositions that incline people to act and react in certain ways. (2010, p. 12-14).

the language used) is unconsciously modified by the structure of the relationship between the speakers (2010, p26). In the case of this study, 'field' is the structure of the relationship between preachers and listeners and the issues of power and inequality within that relationship. These issues have all been noted, although not yet fully explored, as existing within the first three views that Rose presented.

Bourdieu believes the similarities and differences that characterize the social conditions of the individual's life are reflected in the habitus. They may be homogeneous, but not totally deterministic, across individuals from similar backgrounds. These dispositions are durable and ingrained such that they endure through the life history of the individual. They operate in a way, that is at a pre-conscious level and, hence, not readily amenable to conscious reflection and modification. The habitus of preachers' projects who they are and what they think and believe about themselves and their faith. Bourdieu's notion of 'field' as a place where power and equality are played out intimates that preachers may be aware of 'the game' and seek to maintain their position in the case of a service of worship by how they lead the service and preach a sermon. Traditionally their position has been an historic, ecclesiastical one equally in the perception of listeners as well as preachers. However, Bourdieu acknowledges the content of communication can be modified by the structure of the relationship between speaker and listeners. Discourse analysis can be used as a tool to discover this content. So if preachers' dispositions give them a 'feel for the game', with the aid of discourse analysis they should be able to identify how much their language reflects those dispositions and how much technical competence they exercise in order to modify their relationship with listeners.

Bourdieu suggests the dispositions that make up habitus of an individual are 'generative' and 'transposable' in the sense that they are capable of generating a multiplicity of practices and perceptions in fields other than those in which they were originally acquired. This provides the individual with a sense of how to act and respond in the course of their everyday lives. As the experiences of the individual are built on and internalised, this sense of knowing how to behave changes as habitus relates to the context (2010, p.13).

Bourdieu develops his argument and suggests that words can be viewed as a currency that creates a linguistic market (2010, p. 51).<sup>6</sup> This study illustrates how preachers can use that market to deposit the 'treasure' of their words and build up linguistic capital for themselves. If this capital increases their reputation as 'good' they become accepted as worthy speakers. Bourdieu further claims that utterances are not only signs to be understood and deciphered; but are also signs of both 'wealth', intended to be evaluated and appreciated, and of 'authority', intended to be believed and obeyed (2010, pp. 66-67). He maintains that it is very rare in everyday life for language to function as a pure instrument of communication. Linguistic practice is inevitably associated with information about the manner of communicating that is about the 'expressive style', which then takes on a social value and symbolic efficacy. These concepts will be developed further in the case studies in Chapter 4.

The works of Bourdieu and Rose epitomise the tension faced by all preachers in the Anglican Church: Bourdieu's view of institutional authority and legitimate language on the one hand and Rose's view of connection, solidarity and equality on the other.

.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>6</sup> Words are part of a wider conception of symbolic economy i.e that language is one of several kinds of symbolic capital which are given particular value within stratified society

Because Bourdieu's work centres on the power play within any field, religious or otherwise, his work can only be used to a limited extent here. However, since preachers may not be aware of this tension, Bourdieu's 'power play' theory does help to reveal its presence. Although by using Rose's conversational view of preaching it is possible to reduce inequalities and asymmetries within a community, Rose also acknowledges that all preachers carry the institutional authority given to them at their ordination as well as the intellectual knowledge and position any priest has in the church.

#### 2.3 The Uses of Language, Textual Analysis and Interaction

Norman Fairclough, a critical discourse analyst, has developed a textual analysis that has some consonance with Bourdieu's analytical approach. Fairclough suggests the nature of language representations is dependent on the social relations and struggles out of which they are generated (2001, p.20). People internalise what is socially produced within a particular community and use this internalised 'members' resources' to engage in their social practice. Fairclough believes these internalised resources give the forces that shape society a vitally important foothold in the individual psyche, but that the effectiveness of the foothold depends on it not being generally apparent.

Fairclough also contends an utterance is not simply 'decoded' but an interpretation is arrived at through an active process of matching features of the utterance at various levels with representations stored in the long-term memory. These representations might be shapes of words, the grammatical forms of sentences, the typical structure of narrative or the expected sequence of events in a particular situation type, so comprehension is the outcome of interactions between the utterance being interpreted and the 'members' resources' (2001, pp. 8,9). This idea of representations is an

important feature that discourse analysis, as used later in this study, is able to highlight and, therefore, be of value in understanding the nature of communication including interaction.<sup>7</sup>

Erving Goffman, a sociologist, is interested in the way in which people interact together. He suggests that when a word is spoken all those who happen to be in perceptual range of the event will have some kind of 'participation status' relative to it. All the people in the perceptual range form the 'participation framework' for that moment of speech (1981, pp. 3, 137). The point of all of this, according to Goffman, is that an utterance does not carve up the world beyond the speaker into precisely two parts, recipients and non-recipients, but rather opens up an array of differentiated possibilities. This establishes a participation framework that the speaker can use in order to guide and maximise her/his, own delivery.

There may be various kinds of participation frameworks in sermons, which are themselves activities. The event, then, is not just about preachers but it is also about listeners. Both preacher and listeners form the field of operation of this performance. The picture this generates is of preacher and listeners surrounded, as individuals, by a network of life experiences that criss-cross and interrelate to form the structure of the field in which the participants exist. This leads to comprehension that is, therefore, the outcome of interactions between the utterance being interpreted and 'members' resources'. The primary interest of this thesis is the identification of a sermon as performance, conveying ideas, feelings and concepts. The notion of performance is key

-

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>7</sup> Dell Hymes S.P.E.A.K.I.N.G. model illustrates Fairclough's contention that utterances need to be interpreted with representations stored in the long-term memory in order to promote the analysis of discourse as a series of speech events and speech acts within a cultural context (1986, pp.59-65)

to recognizing the importance of Rose's belief in 'connection and solidarity' in her conversational view of preaching.

#### 2.4 Performance

What is performance? Marvin Carlson, drawing on Goffman's dramaturgical concept of talk, implies that while all human activity could potentially be considered as performance (2004, p. 4), more specifically performance is a two-way activity and is, therefore, based in a relationship between the performer and an audience. This view expands Rose's notion that preachers can foster conversation by acknowledging that performance is a way of bringing out the assumptions and beliefs of a community.

Rose's conviction in the equality of the relationship between preacher and listeners supports the idea that preaching a sermon may also be considered performance; an opportunity to draw listeners into the context of scripture enabling them to experience discipleship from their own point of view. Performance becomes a way of interpreting human behaviour based both in the relationship between performers and themselves, and the performers and their audience. It connects listeners' own experiences with those that are being demonstrated within the enactment, drawing both preachers and listeners into the essence of the sermon until it becomes a constituent part of their own existence.

A different insight into performance is the observation of Richard Bauman that verbal art is performance based upon an understanding of performance as a mode of speaking (Duranti, 2001, chp. 7, p. 165). For Bauman the term '*performance*' conveys not only a dual sense of artistic action and artistic event involving the performer but also the art form, audience and setting. He suggests that in an artistic performance the subtext of the

communicative interchange is saying to the auditor 'interpret what I say in some special sense, do not take it to mean what the words alone, taken literally would convey' (2001, p.167). Bauman acknowledges the creation of space in which subliminal communication takes place and where all the power play also takes place including the jostling for position and authority (2001, pp.182, 183). Looking at performance from this point of view evidences the tension between Rose's conversational view of preaching and Bourdieu's notions of field, legitimate language, and institutional authority.

Bauman believes that performances are not all the same and it is possible to appreciate the individuality of each (2001, p.179). He implies that, within the context of particular situations, the emergent quality of performance resides in the interplay between communication resources, individual competence and the goals of the participants. All aspects of the communication system available are considered as resources to members of a community for the conduct of performance. The keys that are relevant include: genre; acting; events and ground rules for the conduct of performance. These make up the structured system of conventionalized performance for the community. When a preacher succeeds in helping listeners to become caught up in the essence of his/her sermon they have successfully recognized the social dimension of the occasion.

Bauman believes that, through their performance, performers elicit the participative attention and energy of their audience (2001, p.183). The extent to which the audience value the performance will be the degree to which they allow themselves to be caught up in it. When this happens performers gain prestige and control over the audience. This

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>8</sup> This refers back to Wright's idea that there are as many sermons preached as there are people listening (see section 2.1)

prestige of demonstrated competence and control is because the determination of the flow of the interaction is in the performers' hands. When performers gain control in this way there is the potential for transformation of the social structure. In Bauman's view, through this kind of control, performers create a social structure with themselves at the centre and, through a strategic use of performance skills, can transform a social situation.

Bauman maintains that the consideration of power, inherent in performance to transform social structures, opens the way to a range of additional considerations concerning the role of the performer in society (2001, 182). This illustrates Bourdieu's view that linguistic capital in any field creates the power and authority to bring about change. Contrary to Bauman's view that the control of performers comes from their connection with listeners, Rose argues that connectedness brings solidarity rather than control. The recent changes in attitude towards sermons and their role, noted in Chapter 1, indicate that there is some consciousness of performance control. Rose also suggests that performance control could be seen to be the purpose of the dominant homiletic voices as demonstrated in the classic, kerygmatic and transformational views.

However, whilst a performer might want to exert some control over their audience to lead them into the performance, in the conversational view of preaching the preacher initially makes a connection with listeners to establish solidarity so that listeners might be encouraged to take a step towards finding their own theology. So, in terms of performance and control, Rose contends that conversational preaching, in part, grows out of and reflects the on-going conversations between preacher and listeners in which the preacher is not 'the one-to-know' or control but an equal colleague in matters of

living and believing. Instead of impeding these conversations with a final or single answer, preachers foster them by explicitly acknowledging a variety of points of view, learning processes, interpretations, and life experiences (Rose, 1997, p.95). While all the authors cited above have some value and the ideas of Bourdieu and Bauman are particularly useful for this thesis, it is Rose's work that provides the most relevant framework for the primary research in this study. However, it must be stated that Rose takes a more idealistic and non-critical view compared to Bourdieu and Bauman. Their different views highlight the tension between conversation and authoritative performance. Although Rose has no linguistic/discourse background and, therefore, has no associated analytic framework, her stance on how and why a sermon is preached is important to the development of this study. This is particularly the case when examining the approach and beliefs of preachers in terms of their understanding of their role in delivering the sermon. Rose believes all language is inevitably biased and limited, historically conditioned and inseparable from that which causes the breakdown of relationships of each community of users (1997, p.90). Nevertheless, recognizing the limitation of language, Rose, in her conversational view of preaching, considers a sermon is more like a poem because unlike some other forms of language such as an advertisement, a sermon does not try to impose something on listeners. Its existence is somewhere between preacher and listeners with a reality being greater than what is expressed. She believes that the important features are the authenticity of interpretation and the process of thinking. These enable listeners to comprehend themselves and their lives more clearly by connecting with what is being said.

# 2.5 Towards a Community of Learning

Equating with Rose's view of solidarity through connectedness, Etienne Wenger

proposes that people form a 'community of practice' when they experience learning together. For Wenger 'participation' refers to a process of taking part and also to the relationships with others that reflect this process. The community of practice suggests to him both action and connection. Participation is being a member of a social community actively involved in social enterprises (Wenger, 2002, p.55). When people engage in conversation they recognize something of themselves in each other, which they internally acknowledge. He believes what is recognized has to do with a shared ability to negotiate meaning. In this experience of mutuality, participation is a source of identity and by recognizing this, preacher and listener become part of each other and an equal part of this particular field. By sustaining this common commitment, significant learning is also shared (2002, p. 56). From this perspective, Wenger proposes, that communities of practice can be thought of as having shared histories of learning. He suggests its members, through discussion, ultimately produce practice within an open process that allows for the possibility of including new understandings. This implies ways of participating are created in the very process of contributing (2002, pp.96, 97). Being part of a congregation is being part of an active community of learning.

Though Wenger's position is different, from a critical perspective these assumptions relate to Rose's opinion about conversational preaching. She suggests that engagement in the performance of a sermon by listeners necessitates their participation. This participation closes the gap between listeners and preachers. Rose also states that the experience of those in both the pulpit and the pew should be interdependence, where preachers and listeners stand together as explorers and the fundamental experience of connectedness redefines their roles (1997, p.90) In order to achieve this connectedness other elements, such as the use of style in sermons, need to be considered.

# **2.6 Style**

The concept of style has become increasingly important in sociolinguistics and discourse analysis. Style, therefore, derives its meaning from the association of linguistic features with particular social groups. It is an analytic tool that can be used on linguistic text and performance. This thesis draws on different discussions of style and uses some of these insights in the analysis of the sermons below to demonstrate how preachers evoke participation in their sermons.

The interaction between form and function is what Einar Haugen (1997, p. 349) calls style. Haugen suggests styles, called 'functional dialects', provide wealth and diversity within a language and ensure the stability of the norm. He also suggests that speakers design their style primarily for, and in response to, their audience. Though it has been acknowledged that style is an analytic notion, Haugen's view, has some consonance with Bourdieu's view concerning habitus: that contextual linguistic features arise out of the social conditions in which they were generated.

Complementing this view Muriel Saville-Troike argues that competent speakers enable their listeners by choosing to change their normal style of speaking to one in which listeners have more comprehension (2003, pp. 47-48). She maintains that whatever specific functions are served by changing language within and across communities, it

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>9</sup> This resonates with Paulo Freire's view discussed earlier that teachers should sit at the feet of those they want to teach so that they can understand their context and, therefore, enable the learners to learn. If preachers metaphorically sat at the feet of their congregation they would have a much greater understanding of which style to use so as to enable their listeners to discover their own theology.

<sup>10</sup>Called 'Style-shifting'. Patrick (2009) gives an overview of style and style-shifting suggesting that there are many types of style-shifting, including formality-based; cross-dialectical; cross-linguistic; register shift; hyper–correction; and performance speech. He agrees that style operates on all linguistic levels: phonology; grammar; lexicon and semantics. In addition, he includes pragmatics and discourse. A wide range of social factors may also influence style and contexts and a shift on one dimension, or axis, may also involve a shift in another. However, social class distinctions are generally preserved across style shifts in respect of the formality dimension.

adds to the verbal strategies speakers have at their command, and, as such, it provides another dimension of communicative competence and performance (2003, pp. 59, 62).

Tannen's interest in style is in the poetic and rhetorical components of talk. Repetition and the placing in context of words and phrases create meaning and involvement in discourse. She believes that conversational discourse provides the source for strategies that are taken up by other, including literary, genres both spoken and written. For Tannen, dialogue clearly embodies meaning expressed in the sounds and rhythms of speech whilst words, through imagery and detail, create visual representations of objects, people and scenes with which they interact even though they are expressed in verbal forms, that have sound and shape (2007, p. 2). So it is how people speak, that is the association of linguistic features in dialogue that creates the notion of style.

In a comparable way to Ong, Tannen has examined the spoken and written word as well as the process of writing down oral stories. Her findings demonstrate that, in some cases, literary writing, as opposed to ordinary language writing, develops strategies instinctive in conversation. In addition, the consideration of the genre as being an instance of discourse is crucial to understanding its nature. Tannen believes comparison of spoken and written narratives suggests that ordinary conversation and literary discourse have more in common than previously thought. For her the strategies that are instinctive in conversation work on two levels: on the one hand, sound and rhythm and, on the other, meaning through mutual participation in 'sense-making' (2007, p.29, 30). Sound, rhythm and 'sense-making' play an important part in the following discourse analyses

Tannen provides an example that illuminates her hypothesis. She analyses a speech of Jesse Jackson and suggests that he uses repetition, dialogue and details along with other involvement strategies such as storytelling and tropes (a figure of speech that operates on meaning) to communicate his ideas and move his audience towards acceptance of them and of him. She argues that the response given to his speech suggests that Jackson's performance provides a contemporary similarity to a classical poetic performance. The poet spontaneously creates a discourse in performance by repeating and elaborating previously used formulas in new ways. She states that this strategy enables the total engagement and emotional identification of the listeners with the speaker (2007, p.185). Tannen concludes by suggesting the power of oratory lies in the artful elaboration of involvement strategies – these same linguistic strategies are the ones that create involvement and make understanding possible in everyday conversation (2007, p. 186). Stylistic features are, therefore, essential in the development of strategies for involvement.

Tannen's main research focus concerns involvement strategies and the inseparability of emotion and thought. Although these elements of style are more commonly found in fiction, they are, in her view, equally found in written texts. This correlates with Haugen's view, discussed above, that style is associated with both the audience and the interaction between form and function. Tannen's interest lies in identifying the persuasive power of linguistic strategies that create involvement and make understanding possible (2007, p.165, 186). Since the preacher performs the texts s/he has written when a sermon is preached, Tannen's work can be used to analyse the meaning of his/her expressions. Corresponding to Rose's view of poetic, evocative language, Tannen suggests a relationship between conversational and literary discourse,

thus advocating the appreciation of written discourse is always a matter of interpretation and communication. This emphasis on the importance of linguistic strategies will be unearthed by the discourse analysis of the four sermons used in this thesis. Recent research demonstrates that the style of much of the 'poetic' is stated in terms of the metaphor.

George Lakoff and Mark Johnson suggest that since communication is based on the same conceptual system we use in thinking and acting, language is an important source of evidence for what the system is like. On the basis of this linguistic evidence most peoples' conceptual system is metaphorical in nature. They contend that the heart of metaphor is understanding and experiencing one kind of thing in terms of another (2003, pp.3-5). For them metaphorical thought is 'normal and ubiquitous' in mental life both conscious and unconscious. Lakoff and Johnson believe that the same mechanisms of metaphoric thought used throughout poetry are present in most common concepts. Metaphoric thought is systematic and the heart of metaphor is inference. (2003, p. 244). They state that there is no choice as to whether speech is metaphorical because metaphoric maps are part of the human brain. Since the mechanism of metaphor is largely unconscious, metaphors reflect the speaker's commonplace experiences of the world. They believe that many primary metaphors are universal because everyone has basically the same bodies, brains and they live in the same environments as far as features relevant to metaphor are concerned. However, the complex metaphors, that are composed of primary metaphors and make use of culturally based conceptual frames, may differ significantly from culture to culture (2003, p.257).

The use of metaphor and forms of structural parallelism will be examined closely in the four case studies.<sup>11</sup>

# 2.7 Summary

This chapter has sought to identify, through a variety of secondary sources, the approaches that will be used later in this study, particularly Gee's poetic approach to narrative analysis. The unique use of discourse analysis to analyse sermons as shown in this thesis, will, it is hoped, have a practical value of offering a way for preachers to recognize their social and historical perspectives and to understand their own agenda when they come to write and deliver sermons. Bourdieu's concepts of habitus, capital and field create the framework into which the analysis of sermonic language can be placed. These concepts demonstrate the importance of the sociocultural context for preachers as they seek to understand their purpose in their preaching. Preachers are empowered to choose appropriate words for their listeners when they are aware of the multi-layered meaning of their language and its relationship to habitus and field.

Similarly, the works of Wenger and Rose, though very different in focus, demonstrate the importance of people learning together to create community. Wenger's concept of a community of learning, where becoming a member of the community is established through participation, facilitates in a different way the recognition of the use of involvement strategies by all of the preachers analysed. By utilizing particular linguistic techniques (discussed in Chapter 4) in order to encourage participation, preachers demonstrate their sermonic purpose. Demonstration of purpose indicates the conscious or unconscious understanding of their position in the community of learning. Finally,

-

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>11</sup> Metaphor and structural parallelism appear to be the central processes for juxtaposing the human and the divine in such a way that listeners can potentially make the connection between the problems of daily life and the working of divine revelation.

Tannen's work on conversational discourse and her premise that literary and conversational discourses have much in common, brings these different epistemologies together. In joining these elements and using them in the analysis of the four sermons the importance of creating involvement strategies, style, performance and purpose in homiletics is demonstrated. At the same time as justifying Rose's conviction that preaching a sermon may be considered as performance.

Discourse analysis, therefore, facilitates preachers to reflect on their words and speak from a place of integrity, thus enabling them not only to grasp the social dimension of the context but also, with this information, to move towards Rose's view of conversational preaching. This will release them from their former restrictions (as discussed in 2.1. – 2. 3) and enable them to make a connection and to stand in solidarity with listeners. The works of all the scholars discussed in this chapter have provided in minor or major ways: the background; themes; concepts; impetus; and structural framework for the analysis of the four sermon case studies that form the body of this thesis. Chapter three discusses discourse analysis and associated methodologies used to establish the contribution it can make to a theology of preaching.

# Chapter 3

# Methodology

The issues identified in Chapter 2 through the examination of recent scholarly works have dictated the methodology that will be used in the primary research in the next two chapters. The driving factors in the choice of methodology are: Rose's conversational method of preaching; the identification of the poetic and emotive elements of language of Tannen and others; the idea of performance; Gee's approach to narrative analysis; and Bourdieu's understanding of capital, field and habitus.

Initial work on the primary sources entailed not only studying the texts but also the presentation. This empirical approach reinforced relevant parts of the secondary sources noted in the previous chapter and resulted in the recognition that the sermon is not just a piece of prose but a performance with all that entails. Discourse analysis provides the framework in which to discover linguistic strategies. It is hoped that, as has been previously discussed in Chapter 2 (see 2.7 Summary), discourse analysis will become a tool used by preachers in the preparation of their sermons to enable them to more fully recognize and understand their own perspectives.

#### 3.1 Method

In order to explore successfully the value of discourse analysis for the understanding of the intricacies and impact of a sermon on the listeners, the sermons of experienced preachers (i.e. four senior Anglican clergy each working in different contexts) have been used.

### 3.1.1 Audio/Video

Carey Jewitt argues that meaning is realised through a range of modes that in turn, contribute to the building of knowledge (2009, p.3-5). The use of audio/visual technology is valuable in demonstrating these different modes and illustrates how such modes work together to provide effective ways of delivering a message. Four video recordings have been used in this study. Two of the recordings are professionally produced and amateurs filmed the remaining two. The BBC televised 'Iraq - A Service of Remembrance' that included in full the Archbishop of Canterbury's sermon, whilst an independent video company filmed 'A service of Thanksgiving for the Restoration of the Church of St Andrew and St Mary at Paul', that included the Archbishop of York's sermon. The two amateur recordings are of the sermons by the Dean of Ripon Cathedral and the Bishop of Knaresborough.

Using professionally made videos ensured the quality of the recording, a situation not repeated in the amateur recording. Nevertheless, there was a downside to the two professional videos in that I was not present at either of these events. In addition the professional element of these videos included some panning to the audience, and this

meant that the preacher was not observed the whole of the time. However, it usefully enabled the observation of some audience participation, which has given greater depth to the deliberation on the effect of the language on the listeners. These visual responses of the listeners, while not being used in the analytical data do, nevertheless, enrich the data collected. More importantly, making use of both professional and amateur recordings facilitated access to the preaching of the Archbishops, the Dean and the Bishop and this enabled a careful scrutiny of the nature of the discourse in different contexts and with different experienced preachers.

A potential problem of the approach taken here is the lack of more than one sermon from each preacher, which could have provided useful comparisons about individual performance in different contexts. This, however, was not feasible in the context of the research.<sup>12</sup> The use of only one sermon per preacher was counterbalanced by an intense familiarisation with the data, playing and replaying each video, noting the language and salient moments of body conduct. The four videos were transcribed in full, using the Jefferson conventions for talk that has been used in many highly respected articles (Atkinson and Heritage 1984).

After the initial transcription of the sermons and some analysis, it became clear that the best way to handle the data was to place it within columns. Jewitt an expert in managing multimodal data suggests using 'time' as an anchor (2009, p.38). However, since 'time' was not available in any of the videos, the 'anchor' became, in each case, the preacher.

\_

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>12</sup>These include time constraints. Also, despite much effort to procure other recordings, there was a lack of availability of other videos of the other senior clergy and this has resulted in using only the four sermons in the thesis.

The two primary columns were made up of the 'preacher' and 'talk'. A secondary column noting body conduct formed the third column, and this largely held data on movement and gesture with 'gaze' being occasionally noted. It was felt necessary to include 'body conduct' at this point for, as noted earlier, although it is not part of the final analysis, noting its use gave extra depth to the other two elements. As Jewitt contends, each different mode plays a part in the meaning making of a text. Different aspects of meaning are carried in different ways by each mode.

#### 3.2 Frameworks

While discourse analysis and data collection is the central part of the methodology used in this thesis, the following frameworks enable a broader perspective on the performance of the preachers that enriches the analysis of the data.

### 3.2.1 Theological framework

As noted earlier, for the theological framework Rose's proposal that there are four views of preaching is being used in this study. This will help to identify whether or not performance of the sermons enhances or detracts from the development of a relationship between preacher and listeners as 'co-discerners of God's word and partners in the proclamation of the gospel' (John S. McClure Back cover of Rose 1997). Initially the approach of discourse analysts will be used to establish the linguistic style used by preachers. Taking this further, this analysis here will seek to determine how far Rose's 'poetic and evocative language' (see Chapter 2) is used. As she proposes in her study, such language helps to create a connection between preachers and their listeners to

encourage listeners to formulate their own interpretations reducing inequalities and asymmetries and bringing conversation into being.

### 3.2.2 Theoretical Framework

In establishing a theoretical framework for analysis in this study, the use of Bourdieu's notions of institutional authority, legitimate language, habitus, and the other elements of context<sup>13</sup>on the one hand and, on the other, Rose's conversational approach to the sermon<sup>14</sup>, clarifies the context of the sermons. Bourdieu's theoretical approach coupled with Rose's theological approach open the possibility of understanding, to some extent, how these four senior clergy preach their sermons.

Within both the theological and the theoretical frameworks, the sociolinguistic and theological analysis of the sermons is facilitated by different approaches. Tannen's research into the role of language within relationship and her focus on repetition, metaphor and details that create imagery, <sup>15</sup> supported by the findings of Lakoff and Johnson, contributes to an appreciation of Goffman's work on the concept of multilayered communication and the way people interact with each other. These approaches in turn, open up an array of differentiated possibilities that establish a participation framework (see below 3.2.3).

<sup>13</sup> Such as preaching in the open air or St Paul's Cathedral with members of the Royal Family etc.,

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>14</sup> That is, it recognizes the evocative nature of poetic language making a connection between preachers and listeners.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>15</sup> See also the discussion in Chapter 2

Rose's theological approach to sermons illustrates how the purpose of a sermon can affect how it is performed. Each approach illustrates the different ways there are to analyse the sermons:

- from a poetic standpoint both structurally and in terms of poetic language;
- using a narrative approach as illustrated by Gee (1991);
- a multimodal approach in terms of context as discussed earlier;
- from a performance standpoint as illustrated by Carlson(2009)

In respect of a sociolinguistic analysis some of Bourdieu's research is valuable. While the main thread of his work is not relevant here, Bourdieu's notion that being a representative of an institution can produce institutional authority is very helpful. Using the sermon as an example, preaching the sermon, therefore, produces institutional authority. Further, Bourdieu's idea of 'field' (see Chapter 2.2) is also apposite in respect of this initial research. Preachers convene within the field of religion, particularly the field created by the institution of the church that gives them authority. <sup>16</sup>

At the point of delivery in the four videos all that is available for analysis is the performance, though some assumptions can be made about the meaning of spoken words in relation to the content and the context of the sermon. Performance makes it possible to identify the notion of habitus in the sermons and, to some extent, to discuss the way in which individual preachers have developed their particular styles and modes of communicating.

-

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>16</sup> This issue of authority is taken up in respect of the two archbishops in Chapter 4.

# 3.2.3 Participation Framework

For three out of the four sermons analysed, the preachers did not personally know most of their listeners. To be understood these preachers must base their language within the social and institutional practices of the context of the sermon to build a relationship with listeners. In this way listeners can connect with the sermonic language.<sup>17</sup>

The method that preachers use to communicate is important in order to ensure that those who are listening really 'hear' what is being said. This method is significant because, although not part of the data analysis, in the following chapters it assists the understanding of the layers of experience that contribute to the language chosen for use in the actual sermons. The methodology used here is supported by the findings of Goffman. He introduces the notion of 'animator', 'author' and 'principal' to explain what is happening when a speaker speaks. He suggests that most often these three roles are found in one person; so for the purposes of this study, this will be applied here to the preachers who write and preach their own sermons (1981, pp.144, 145). Goffman's suggestion that these different roles are part of the production format conveys the concept of lamination, that is: the different layers of speakers' experience incorporated in their words.

Preachers can 'meld' these layers into the speech event making them available to listeners by way of extemporaneous embellishment of the text. Goffman's concept of lamination also includes different voices incorporated in the production of a text: voices

٠

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>17</sup>Fairclough's thesis on interpretation of an utterance, Goffman's participation frameworks and Wenger's community of practice will be used to test the level to which this is being used in each of the sermons.

of scripture; the congregation; the culture; and the worship (Schlafer, 1994, p.124; Bakhtin, 2008,). Consequently, communication is multi-layered from two perspectives; one deep within the preacher and the other deep within the social context. The methodological approach used here enables an exploration of how all of these concepts can be recognized within a sermon's performance.

### 4. Narratives and the Use of Poetic Structures

Tannen suggests that 'meaning making power' originates from subjective narrative that utilises most of the other linguistic strategies previously mentioned (2007, p.41).

Considering every sermon as narrative and analysing each one using Gee's approach to illustrate poetic language reveals the underlying meaning in the sermon text. This links into Gee's views that stories have a natural structure and carry the poetic dimension of talk. Not infrequently the analysis of prose as poetry provides a clearer indication of the strategy each preacher used to make the point they wanted to make. When the lines are grouped into verse, it becomes clear that there is an inherent cultural pattern. As Hymes suggests, when the poetic approach is used implicitly on the narrative text, the prose of the sermon gains a rhythm and 'comes out right' so listeners are 'wooed' into hearing the message (2007, p.136, 137).

In order to bring clarity to the details of the primary analytical approach used here, and within the parameters of the frameworks detailed above, all the texts are marked up to show 'lines', 'stanzas' and 'strophes' (see Appendices 1-8). This approach follows that of Gee who suggests interpretation, like visual perception, is a combination of the structural properties of texts and creative inferences drawn on the basis of context and

previous experiences (1991, p.15-39). According to Gee's approach each numbered line is to be seen as the equivalent sentence in writing and is about one central idea or argument. This line maybe constructed of one or more 'idea units' separated from each other within a line by a slash '/'. 'Idea units' can be best understood by examining how speakers stress different words and change their pitch when they speak. Gee argues that English speakers emphasise *different* words and phrases from those of other languages. <sup>18</sup> These prosodic phrases are the basis of the characteristic rhyme of oral English (1991, p. 4).

Gee's approach proposes when someone speaks a sentence at a 'normal' rate, they choose a word to 'bear the primary pitch disruption'. This is called the 'pitch-glide'. It is described as the rise, rise-and-fall, and fall-and-rise of the voice in relation to the base pitch level of the sentence. This 'pitch-glide' signals the focus of the sentence, the information that the speaker wants the listeners to take as new information. This is identified in the analysis of the sermons in the next chapter. A sentence with one 'pitch glide' is an 'idea unit' (1991, p.11). 'Idea units' contain a single piece of information and are often separated from other idea units by a small pause or a slight hesitation. The more 'idea units' in a sentence the more 'pitch-glides' the speaker will have to make. Gee argues that the discourse structure of a narrative text at a variety of different levels functions to set up a series of cues or interpretive questions (1991, p3). The questions must be answered by any acceptable interpretation of the listener. Answers given are constrained by the questions asked.

\_

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>18</sup>This is important because two of the four preachers in the case studies have experience of foreign language influences

Gee also suggests the reading/speaking of a text is crucial to the structure assigned to it and the meaning given. Gee terms this the 'speech stream', which is a structure and not just a product of the listeners' inference. He notes that across a narrative or exposition, the 'lines' pattern into various larger units called 'stanzas', the basic building blocks of wide-ranging sections of interactive language. Stanzas can form into 'strophes', which often fall into related pairs. These then become the larger 'units' which Gee calls 'parts', that form the story as a whole. It is likely that this interpretation happens automatically as preachers speak, enabling listeners to connect with the discourse as it unfolds. In this study each of the stanzas and strophes is given a short descriptive title to help to show the strategy of the sermon. Stanzas appear to be made up of a similar number of lines, known as 'isochrony'. The switch from one strophe to another can be established by the topic at the end of one stanza being related to the beginning of the next (Gee, 1991 p.15).

Using the discussions of scholars on the importance of poetry (see Chapter 2), <sup>19</sup> this study will draw on various elements of poetry within the text and the word. Rose's conversational view of preaching supports the idea of poetic and evocative language illuminating the mystery of God and associating the poetic with the 'Unseen' to give a fresh sense of wonder to the mundane and ordinary. Poetic language is, therefore, essential to a sermon because it communicates the process of thinking and nurtures that process within listeners. Once the sermons are placed into the physical poetic mode (lines, stanzas etc.) the features inherent in poetry will be utilized in the analysis of the four sermons. In addition to identifying the stylistic elements such as metaphor etc,

\_

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>19</sup> The importance of poetry has been noted by many as being part of the process of enabling people to experience God.

poetry also creates both lucidity in discourse, and relational participation in communication. How it is used links to expressive style. It highlights the 'coupling' of equivalent paradigms named by Goffman as 'grammatical parallelism'.

### 6. Summary

In terms of analysis, the Archbishop of Canterbury's sermon proved the most difficult to access as prose. A common approach to all the sermons was needed. The problem was solved by the decision to analyse the entire cluster of sermons as if they were based in narrative and then to re-sort them into the poetic form as detailed above. This approach is justified in terms of Gee's view that prosodic phrases are the basis of the characterised rhyme of oral English. Once the prosodic phrases are extracted then it is possible to identify the 'pitch glide' discussed above. This signals the focus of the sentence that each preacher wants listeners to hear while still leaving open the opportunity for listeners to construct their own meanings of situations through interpretive processes (Muriel Saville-Troike, 1997, p.126-130). Metaphorical resonance seems to be at the heart of the strategies, which attempt to establish a connection between the human and the divine. Metaphor could be construed as a powerful vehicle for making this connection, since by definition it is operating at a Meta level, allowing more material aspects to be understood in terms of images and concepts beyond them. This chapter has highlighted the major aspects of the methodology used in this study and has given some preliminary analytical observations. Chapter 4 begins the work of examining the sermons as performance in depth in order to establish the contribution these methods can make to a theology of preaching.

# **Chapter 4**

# **Homiletics and Discourse Analysis**

The focus of this chapter is homiletics. It considers how preachers communicate and how they aim to engage listeners on a deeper level, below the level of rational language at the same time as engaging them on the rational, intellectual level. It also aims to demonstrate how the framework, based on the findings of the scholars discussed in Chapter 2, is able to draw out the largely hidden strategies used by the four case-study preachers in order to involve their listeners their performance.<sup>20</sup>

Whilst Rose's work is clearly theological in focus, the relevance of the sociolinguistic research of Bourdieu and others is not immediately clear. However, because homiletics deals with Christian life and practice, both in the church and in wider society, the faith and actions of an individual within his/her setting are important. The works of Bourdieu and others seek to understand context and how people relate to it and each other. Their findings are, therefore, very important for identifying the contribution that discourse analysis makes to a theology of preaching.

55

 $^{20}$  These include the works/findings of Rose, Tannen, Bourdieu, Hymes, Gee and others

-

In order to use Bourdieu's suggestion that the habitus of each speaker/preacher analysed is derived from his or her sociocultural background and experience, it is important to set each preacher into as much of their context possible. Once this is established, the notion of habitus informs a discussion about the way in which the speaker has developed particular styles and modes of communicating. This information about each preacher will provide indicators as to why his sermon is delivered in the way that it is.

Many scholars accept that a sermon's words are the locus for an encounter with human consciousness. An important element, therefore, in understanding the purpose of a sermon is the identification of why the preacher has adopted a particular language in his/her quest to develop a relationship with listeners. As discussed in Chapter 2, frequently sermons draw on poetic language, particularly the language of image and rhetoric found in the conversational rhythms of the Bible and the poetry of its words-

# 4.1 Poetic Approach

The analysis of the four sermons involves establishing a framework that includes two very different epistemologies: Rose's views of preaching supported by Bourdieu's concepts of habitus, field and capital. Facilitating the development of a framework is the poetic approach of both Hymes and Gee. This poetic approach opens up the texts of each sermon to reveal both the instinctive strategies that Rose maintains each preacher uses to generate her/his purpose for preaching, and the involvement of the personal history of each preacher that Bourdieu believes creates a rich linguistic capital within the field. Both of these also reveal the layers of meaning that form the connections that

would not have been previously perceived. Analysis of sermons based on the works of Rose and Bourdieu demonstrates how working on the levels of rhythm and meaning can evoke solidarity between preacher and listeners through mutual participation.

Although not an expert in the area of linguistics, Rose, when discussing her conversational view, emphasises the value of poetic, evocative language. Such language builds on the desire for accuracy and clarity, and includes the community of faith at the same time as using metaphor and imagery to open up the mystery of God. She suggests that the use of poetic language creates lucidity in discourse and relational participation in communication (Rose, 1997, p.70).<sup>21</sup> Each sermon analysed, therefore, will be subjected to analysis by using Gee's poetic approach in order to show the differences and similarities between them.

# **4.2** The Main Analytical Themes

Types of delivery such as 'performative' or 'narrative' drive the analysis of the four sermons. Further, within these headings, there is analysis of such strategies as the use of: metaphor; repetition; parallelism;<sup>22</sup> rhythm; poetry and story as identified in earlier chapters. In Lakoff and Johnson's view, metaphorical thought, present in most common concepts, evidences the ways that people think generally. Because the language of metaphor reflects how a speaker experiences their world, it gives listeners some indication of the culturally based conceptual frame of that speaker. Another element in

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>21</sup>In Rose's work on contemporary homiletics is very useful. Her work reflects her ability to listen and respond to theories within homiletic literature but she has not undertaken detailed analysis.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>22</sup> Parallelism is the use of successive verbal constructions in poetry or prose, which correspond in grammatical structure, sound, metre and meaning.

the analysis in this study uses Tannen's argument that repetition and the placing in context of words and phrases create meaning and involvement in discourse. In addition, she suggests that involvement is also created through the sound of language so that listeners are involved rhythmically and at the same time they are involved by participating in the making of meaning (2007, p 2). Embedded in homiletics is the art of 'faithful persuasion'. Rhetoric is persuasive language used in order to convert the listener to the speaker's point of view. Through the centuries, Christian preaching has been associated with rhetoric because it seeks to enrol people in a particular way of life (Long and Farley, 1996, p.129).

Story, a feature that appears in three of the four sermons analysed, is different from poetry in its structure and yet the plot is still part of the fictive element of language as opposed to the rational, non-fictive elements. In Tannen's view (similar to Rose's conversational view of preaching) oral, conversational telling of a story exhibits more involvement than in the written form. Events, portrayed by the preacher as a scene, evoke listeners to imagine the described characters, objects and action triggering their own ideas and feelings associated with such a scene (Tannen, 2007, p. 40).

The aim of examining the four case studies is to demonstrate that skilled preachers bring all these strategies into play so that listeners will remember an image or a phrase that caught their attention. Each of the preachers analysed uses elements of all of the strategies discussed in this and earlier chapters but gives different weight to them. For

example, in his sermon<sup>23</sup>, the Archbishop of Canterbury does not use the same type of performative delivery as the Archbishop of York nor the narrative delivery of the Dean of Ripon Cathedral. Rather, he uses the abstract notions of courage and steadfastness understood by those in military service and based in the reality of lives involved in conflict.

One of the primary interests of this analysis is the accessibility of each sermon as performance, particularly acknowledging Carlson's opinion on the relationship that is fostered between the performer and audience. The notion of performance as conveying ideas, feelings and concepts in a sermon is the link to the other focus of the analysis, which is how the language used in preaching, enhances performance, creating a more 'conversational' style. However, the genre does have to be taken into account and, because the speech events analysed are all sermons, there will be certain constraints placed upon the preachers in terms of what they can say and how it can be said that may not be there for other types of speaker. Many of those constraints will be from the expectations of listeners who, as has been previously discussed, have expectations of the type of language and how it should be used within a church setting. Language use, performance and style cannot be separated from each other:

'[w]hat we're talking about really is an area of conventionality which is partly linguistic and partly cultural. This area of conventionality is automatic; it's something that we do without thinking and without reflection. We don't think about how we're going to say things. We think about what we're going to say and then we automatically select our style of speaking. What is involved is this automatic process

.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>23</sup> He was preaching a sermon to a largely military congregation.

by which we select our style of speaking, and whether you call it cultural or whether you call it linguistic isn't really that important.' (Gumperz 1979 (2003, p.272).

Expanding the views of Gumperz' (see above) that language style and performance are inextricably linked, Tannen suggests that cultural patterns<sup>24</sup> do not prescribe the form of preachers' discourse. However, she notes that they do provide a repertoire of linguistic resources from which an individual might choose strategies that they habitually use in expressing their style (Tannen 2007, p.80). For example, the Archbishop of Canterbury is a Welsh speaker and has experience of Russian religious thought. It is likely that this habitus will have influenced his poetic language and his biblical knowledge. At the same time, his habitus will take on an extra dimension because of the context. He preaches his sermon from a high pulpit in St Paul's Cathedral from where most of the listeners within a certain distance from the pulpit, can be seen (Max Atkinson, 2005). This elevated position and the fact that all the listeners see him will create that extra dimension and influence his style.

#### 4.3 Case Studies

# 4.3.1 The Archbishop of Canterbury

Born in Swansea in 1950, the Archbishop of Canterbury is Welsh-speaking. He spent the major part of his early life in education culminating in a D.Phil on Russian Theological thought from Oxford in 1975. The Archbishop spent two years as a lecturer

\_

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>24</sup> This is part of Bourdieu's concept of habitus.

after which he was ordained deacon in Ely Cathedral before returning to Cambridge. He was ordained priest in Cambridge and spent nine years in academic and parish work there. He considers himself a poet and translator and is acknowledged internationally as an outstanding theological writer, scholar and teacher (for more details see Appendix 9).

The sermon used in this case study was preached by the Archbishop in October 2009, in St Paul's Cathedral, London during a service of commemoration to mark the end of military operations in Iraq, in April, 2009. The video shows that the sermon is preached from the pulpit above the listeners, and that a microphone was used. Present were Her Majesty, the Queen, and the Duke of Edinburgh, the Prince of Wales and other members of the royal family along with senior political and military leaders, foreign dignitaries and the families of those who died in the war. Among the congregation of 2,000 people are serving and former serving veterans, along with their commanders, medics, and some of the injured.

The war, which formally ended for U.K. troops in April 2009, was considered to be one of the most controversial episodes in British foreign policy since the Second World War. The inquiry into the war was formally launched in June 2009 and the political controversy continued to resonate even as the commemoration service was being held. Because of these circumstances and the fact that the Archbishop is delivering his sermon in the presence of the Queen and other military, international and political dignitaries, as the leading national representative of the Church of England, the way that the sermon is preached, the tone of its delivery and the content will have symbolic significance and will influence the overall gravitas of the sermon.

### 4.3.1.1 Discourse topic and Main Line Material

The discourse topic of the Archbishop's sermon is the 'cost of seeking justice'. Using Gee's notion of main line material, the central theme can be identified as the necessary sacrifice that is exemplified by 'cost'. His sermon falls into two parts. Part 1 of the Archbishop's sermon is an expression of his understanding of why the war happened; the qualities of those who fought; the challenge of the war to those looking on; those who were responsible; and those who had to pay the price. In Part 2 the Archbishop theologically reflects on the situation in Iraq. He refers to the scripture reading that preceded the sermon. He likened the sacrifice of the servicemen and women involved to that of Christ, acknowledging their courage against enemies, both visible and invisible, and reflecting on the reality of the cost to individuals. He concludes with a call to recognize the thanks that is due to those who have shown society the worth of justice and peace and how to live with Christian values.

The Archbishop uses language in his sermon that is all embracing in terms of his congregation. It reflects reality for those who experience war at first hand recognizing 'young and not so young' meet the cost for seeking justice (Appendix 1, lines 1,2). At the same time he uses the language of 'mystery' and suggests that it is very hard for those who do not have the experience of being at war to understand (Appendix 1, lines 3,4). This language of 'mystery' empathises with those who have had no experience of war and so the use of a poetic term such as 'mystery' gives 'permission' for this lack of understanding thus creating 'solidarity'. Further, the phrase 'people like ourselves' (Appendix 1, line 5) also illustrates Rose' notion of conversational preaching. In Rose's terms, the Archbishop's language falls into the category of 'homily' or familiar

conversation. She likens this to the conversation of the two disciples on the Emmaus Road (see Luke 24:13-32). They talked with each other about what had just happened in Jerusalem: one believer is speaking conversationally among other believers in order to articulate or reinforce faith (1997, p.94).

# 4.3.1.2 Poetic Structure

It has been demonstrated in the literature review (Chapter 2) that interpretation is an interaction of the properties of texts and creative inferences. This suggests that there is a great deal of meaning available in the structure of the language of the text. As discussed at length earlier, in order to understand the underlying connections, each of the sermons under study will be subjected to scrutiny using Gee's approaches. <sup>25</sup>All of the sermons have slightly different emphases in terms of the analytical constructs that need to be used. For example some of the sermons make more use of metaphor, and others make more use of repetition or narrative. The analysis of the Archbishop's sermon indicates that the emphasis is on metaphor.

As noted earlier, listener participation is much more about the use of poetic language. The Archbishop appears to use this by employing phrases that subtly include listeners, for example 'people like ourselves' (see Appendix 1, stanza 2 line 5) and 'In a world as complicated as ours has become' (see Appendix 1, stanza 4 line 11). The use of poetic language only partially identifies the meaning and purpose of the sermon; its whole structure needs to be looked at for what Gee calls a complete theory of interpretation (1991). The Archbishop's sermon divides into eighty-eight lines using 'idea units' to

<sup>25</sup>See Appendix 8 for a comparison of all the sermons,

-

make the initial line divisions, and those lines form twenty-six stanzas. A stanza is a group of lines on one topic representing a particular perspective or 'scene'. So, for example, these two following stanzas show that the lines are about seeking justice and unexpected qualities (see Appendix 1):

# Stanza 1 (seeking justice)

- 1. Today is a time for reflecting / on the human cost/ for seeking justice
- 2. On the generosity of so many people /young and not so young / facing / and meeting /that cost
- 3. and the countless, mysterious ways / in which such people / have been equipped / to meet the cost
- 4. through their relationships / through quiet support and inspiration / of those who love them / and have shaped who they are

# Stanza 2 (unexpected qualities)

- 5. A time to reflect / on the unexpected qualities / of people like ourselves
- 6. who, caught up in / the confusion / of a great international upheaval
- 7. simply got on with / the task they were given
- 8. because they believed that order and justice mattered

Following Gee the demarcation of stanzas in the text is fairly well defined and titles assigned to each stanza and strophe<sup>26</sup> makes clear the content (see Appendix 1). The structure of lines and stanzas adds to the overall meaning of the text by combining the contributions made by patterning, word order, plot, point of view and theme, all of which are tied to the line/stanza structure forming the framework of the text (Gee 1991).

.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>26</sup> As noted earlier, a 'strophe' is where stanzas fall into related pairs

As discussed in Chapter 3 the 'isochrony' of the stanzas follows, overall, a 4, 4, 2, 4 pattern of lines and this is found in Part 1 of the Archbishop's sermon and in the first three strophes of Part 2. However, as the Archbishop begins to draw his sermon to a close, reflecting on the cost of justice and love the 'isochrony' changes to a 4, 4, 4, 4, pattern. Strophes illustrate the structure of the sermon overall and how the Archbishop's discourse topic 'a time to reflect' flows through the sermon. The following gives two examples: Strophe 1 from Part 1 of the Archbishop's sermon and Strophe 6 from Part 2:

**Strophe** 1 Cost **Strophe** 6 Scriptural Resonance

Stanza 1 seeking justice, 4 lines Stanza 11 healing and building, 4 lines

Stanza 2 unexpected qualities, 4 lines Stanza 12, special resonance, 4 lines

# 4.3.1.3 Topic Development

Strophes come together to form parts: Strophe 1 above illustrates the beginning of Part 1, which, as noted earlier, outlines the situation in Iraq whilst Strophe 6 begins Part 2 which makes the connections to the scripture that preceded the sermon. Further, using the poetic structure highlights the fact that throughout his sermon, the Archbishop constantly answers the underlying questions about whom it is that is involved; what it is they are involved in; and how their involvement affects them and the situation in which they find themselves. It also emphasises how he 'glides' easily from one concept to another, for example, from the concept of 'cost' to 'generosity':

1. Today is a time for reflecting / on the **human cost**/ for seeking justice

2. On the generosity of / so many people young and not so young / facing / and meeting /that cost

By using this glide, the Archbishop indicates the key theme for this part of his sermon: the service personnel who are willing to give more than is asked, to succeed in the task of creating order and justice out of the upheaval of conflict. It is the beginning of the link between the present situation and the biblical insights that come in Part 2. By connecting 'cost' with 'generosity' he is indirectly commenting on the work that service personnel do when faced with shouldering the heavy responsibility of creating a 'climate of mutual trust'. His focus, therefore, is on the cost to individuals for 'seeking justice'.

The text falls into two parts demonstrating theological reflection on the war in Iraq and its consequences for the service personnel and their families as well as society. In the first part the Archbishop acknowledges the cost of seeking justice and what it means in the reality of day-to-day lives of service men and women, whilst the second part looks at a scriptural insight into what this sacrificial cost actually means, emphasizing that the Bible does have something to say to this present day situation. Although the Archbishop does not read his sermon as if it is a poem, he indicates the end of an idea by pausing at the end of a line and to change the meter of his sermon he occasionally takes an idea along into the next line thereby drawing listeners along with him. For example, in stanza 4 listeners are drawn along through the whole stanza to the Archbishop's point about the judgements that people might want to make about the war:

Stanza 4 (complicated world)

11. In a world as complicated as ours has become

- 12. It would be a very rash person / who would feel able/ to say without hesitation
- 13. this was absolutely the right / or the wrong thing to do
- 14. the right or the wrong place to be

Thus form and content are interconnected and hold listeners' attention. These words create mood and pace because they are founded on multi-layered platforms of experience and association. These are likely to touch a depth of emotion that has been evoked by the language the Archbishop uses and its synchronicity with the on-going political controversy surrounding the war. Reality is made real and emphasised in stanza 7:

# Stanza 7 (everyone knows)

- 20. What matters is not that there is no debate / disagreement / or uncertainty
- 21. simply that everyone knows / who has to answer which questions
- 22. this was a conflict / where some of the highest level questions were unusually hard / and sharply argued over
- 23. But everyone had their share of the tough challenges

By using a poetic structure, either consciously or unconsciously, the Archbishop's sermon encourages listeners to use their imaginations. The rhythm of the sermon creates meaning, rhythmic variations being caused by the pauses at the end of an idea, enabling listeners to make connections with their own lives and the poetic rhythms and patterns of the King James Bible. This unconscious uptake of poetic rhythms by the listeners evokes their involvement and begins the development of a community of learning (see

sections 2.5 and 3.2.3) whilst at the same time demonstrating the tension between authority and conversation.

### 4.3.1.4 Repetition and Rhythm

While repetition, at its simplest, emphasises a point and makes connections, it illuminates our formation of language and makes possible the creation of meaning and rapport. Rhythm (that is, the beat) is either embedded in the actual words or is in the intonation. Both enhance the meaning of what we say. Tannen suggests that the opening and the closing (or coda) of a discourse or 'bounding sections' can be characterised by 'the most striking repetition' (Tannen 2007, p.79,80). One feature of this style of repetition is that it seems to draw on biblical structures such as parallel phrases like 'on the..., on the....' and cohesive devices of repetition:

- 1. Today is a time for reflecting / **on the** human cost/ for seeking justice
- 2. On the generosity of / so many people young and not so young / facing / and meeting /that cost

The Archbishop also illustrates Tannen's striking repetition by framing his sermon with an acknowledgement of the Trinity:

'In the name of the Father and the Son and the Holy Sprit Amen'.

This acknowledgement could represent the ritualised beginnings and endings of his sermons displaying his position in the field. He makes it clear whose authority he claims in this field, and in whose name he speaks. Using Rose's quartet of preaching styles, the Archbishop's display of divine authority: speaking 'In the name of' sets him apart from listeners and illustrates a traditional view of separation between preacher and listeners

and the tension between authority and equality (see below section 4.3.1.6; Tannen, 1997, p.15).

In stanzas 1 and 2 (see Appendix 1), the repetition of words emphasises the theme in Part 1 regarding the situation in Iraq. The Archbishop suggests these service men and women are giving of themselves (see Appendix 1, line 2).

2. On the generosity of so many people /young and not so young / facing / and meeting /that cost

They are also creating order and justice out of the chaos of war, opening the possibility of a connection between service men and women who do what they do because of the support and inspiration of those who love them (see Lines 3 and 4 below)] and Jesus doing what he did with the support and inspiration of his Father:

- **3.** and the countless, mysterious ways / in which such people / have been equipped / to meet the cost
- **4.** through their relationships / through quiet support and inspiration / of those who love them / and have shaped who they are

The Archbishop begins making this connection through the rhythm of the idea units in lines 3 and 4 which are units of intonation through which listeners process the development of meaning<sup>27</sup> and developing it through lines 17-19 with the lexical

-

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>27</sup> See Chapter 3 where Gee's work on prosody is discussed (Gee 1991).

repetition<sup>28</sup> of 'obedience'. When the sermon was transcribed it was clear that these were 'ideas units' by the Archbishop's falling tone at the end of each unit.

- 17. Their **obedience** is anything but mindless
- 18. But it is **obedience** all the same.
- 19. **obedience** that comes from recognizing / others have been given a clear responsibility for certain difficult decisions

Any listener knowing the story of Jesus' death in the Christian tradition will understand the correlation between the obedience of service personnel and Jesus' obedience in the Garden of Gethsemane (cf. Luke 22: 42). The grammatical parallelism between lines 3-4 and 17-19 comes from the scriptural understanding that the service personnel were equipped by the love of their families in the same way that Jesus was equipped by the love of his Father. All of them, therefore, are being given the strength to 'carry' the obedience.

These inferences are available to the biblically knowledgeable whilst at the same time appealing to the rhythmic sensibilities of those who are not, by placing 'obedience' upfront in each idea unit. 'Meaning' in poetic language touches below the level of conscious thought and becomes part of listeners' experience and imagination. Lexical repetition opens up the way for words to penetrate the 'members' resources' (discussed in Chapter 2). The poetic influence of the King James Bible, seen in the works of poets such as Shelly and Wordsworth, tells people who they are and stabilises the language of the everyday. Biblical phrases, rhetorical structure and rhythm have become part of

70

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>28</sup>There are three forms of repetition used in this thesis: lexical repetition when words are repeated: syntactical repetition is a repeat of the same sentence structure: and phonological which is the repetition of a letter.

everyday parlance; for example 'feet of clay' suggesting weakness or character flaws in people of high station (Dan. 2:4); 'reap the whirlwind' (Hosea 8:7) a proverbial phrase; 'the end justifies the means'.

The Archbishop ends the development of his point in lines 67-71 with an acknowledgement of sacrifice not only by Jesus but also by the service personnel:

- 67. These are all part of the cost / the sacrifice involved in seeking a better and more secure life / for people who have suffered outrageously.
- 68. When we as Christians consider the sacrifice / that purchased peace and mercy for the whole world
- 69. We think not only of the death of Jesus on the cross / but also the cost of love and openness to the stranger / that marked his life
  - 70. We can recognize the same thing at work / in a lesser degree
  - 71. In any life that is dedicated / to taking the world a little further out of barbarity and violence

In the first two stanzas of Part 1(see Appendix 1), the Archbishop sets the 'scene' of whom these people are who have chosen to seek justice. He uses syntactic repetition to engage with those listening, paraphrasing the ideas of human cost in stanza 1 and their unexpected qualities in stanza 2. By using syntactic repetition he creates a link between Part 1 and Part 2 of his sermon. In stanza 3 the Archbishop of Canterbury begins to introduce the war in Iraq and notes in stanza 4 that the world is complicated, making it difficult to judge the war. He continues to paint a picture of the service men and women in stanzas 5 through to 10 using lexical repetition to accentuate their obedience and

responsibility. The Archbishop also links the two parts of his sermon with syntactic repetition of the phrase 'a time'. In Part 1 he begins with 'Today is a time for reflecting' and he links that to Part 2 with the words from the passage of Scripture read in the service 'A time to kill and a time to heal'.

Within the initial strophe the Archbishop slightly moves the focus. The first strophe is about cost and opens up reflection on the cost of going to war. Stanzas 1 and 2 (see Appendix 1) identify those who are counting the cost and how they are equipped to do that. Stanza 2 returns the listener to the discourse topic signalling the stanza change. Strophe 2 is about the situation and the temporal phrase 'for a long time yet' switches the listeners from generic discussion about service men and women to discussion of the specific situation of the ongoing inquiry into the war and the continuing political controversy, thus signalling a change of strophe and stanza.

Stanza 4 is the coda to discussion about the legitimacy of the Iraq war. The stanza switches perspective slightly to the complicated nature of the world and how people need to be careful what they say when making comment about the war. Strophe 3 returns the listeners to focus on the service men and women. It uses lexical repetition to emphasise obedience and responsibility moving on to strophe 4, which acknowledges that there are tough challenges for everyone concerned, both those in Iraq and those dealing with the political issues. Strophe 5 is the coda to Part 1 using the topic of trust in stanza 9 to return listeners to the personnel and, in stanza 10, emphasising that the country's moral credibility rests on the capacity of the personnel to discharge their 'responsibilities with integrity and intelligence'. Within some of the stanzas in Part 1,

such as stanzas 6 and 7, there are phonological repetitions. For example, in line 20'(d)ebate, (d)isagreement) and line 24(re)sponsibility', '(re)mained', and '(re)mains', that contribute to the rhythm and musical effect. There are also repetitions of words between the stanzas 6 and 7, such as, 'simply' in line 7 and also in line 21. Although these two uses of 'simply' appear to be different they both contribute to the essence of the message that the Archbishop is creating and that is likely to be having an effect on the listeners. Using concatenation<sup>29</sup> he concedes the tough challenges facing the armed forces and those with responsibility for discussing the question of the ethical nature of the conflict (Tannen, 2007, p.57).

As implied above different types of repetition connect one stanza to the next, often with lexical repetition alternating with syntactic differences and, additionally, in some places syntactic or parallelism can be found (see lines 1 and 5):

- 1. Today is a time for reflecting / on the human cost/ for seeking justice
- **5.** A time to reflect / on the unexpected qualities / of people like ourselves

Line 5 is about people linking back to line 1 about the human cost, and the lines in both stanza 1 and 2 follow the same pattern:

Line 1 – human cost: line 5 - people like ourselves

Line 2 – young and not so young meeting the cost: line 6 – the international upheaval

Line 3 – mysterious ways in which people have been equipped: line 7 – got on with the task

-

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>29</sup>Linking a series of interconnected things, for example the word 'simply'.

Line 4 – relationships shaped who they are: line 8 – because they believed order and justice mattered

Line 6 links back the idea of international upheaval with line 2 concerning those who, because of the upheaval, are seeking justice, i.e. the young and not so young.

Line 7 is linking back to line 3 proposing that the support of their families equipped service men and women to get on with the task of seeking justice.

Line 8 links back to line 4 suggesting that service man and women are inspired to believe that order and justice matter through loving relationships.

Hymes (2007, p.146) calls this a 'resumptive parallel' which links the second stanza back to the first. Just as the discourse topic of the whole sermon is 'a time to reflect', the Archbishop uses temporal phrase to introduce the second part of his sermon (strophe 6, Appendix 1) 'a time to kill and a time to heal'. By 'coupling' equivalent paradigms<sup>30</sup>, links are created through grammatical parallelism from part 2, to part 1 (Tannen, 2007, p. 57). Part 2 is the message that scripture has to offer to the context of the Iraq war in part 1. The Archbishop couples these concepts of war and healing to emphasise his point in lines 49 and 50 (see Appendix 1) that scripture has some 'essential advice' for those who are caught up in war. Making this subtle connection opens up the possibility of listeners recognizing the relevance that scripture might have to a military situation.

Stanza 11 switches perspective to two scriptural, temporal phrases (lines 32, 33 Appendix 1) the positive aspects of which the Archbishop uses to describe the work of the service men and women he has described in part 1. In stanza 12 he makes the

-

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>30</sup>For example: killing coupled with war; and healing coupled with seeking justice.

connection between scripture and the work of 'the modern armed forces'. Strophe 7 replicates the pattern in stanzas 3 and 5 both in structure and position. It identifies the situation in stanza 3 and those who deal with it in stanza 5 before switching to identifying the enemies in stanza 13 and their actions in stanza 14. This repeated pattern is signalled by the repetition of a particular word in the following stanzas; 'obedience' in stanza 6 and 'letting' in stanza 14. This overall patterning of the text, which shows in consistent internal patterning and in the similarity of isochrony in the beginnings of part 1 and 2, is the framework within which thematic echoes and thematic development take place (Hymes, 2007, p.148; Gee, 1991). As previously discussed in Chapter 2, isochrony is the pattern of lines within the stanza and related to other stanzas. For example, the beginning of part 1 has the pattern of 4 lines in stanza 1, 4 lines in stanza 2, 2 lines in stanza 3 and this pattern is repeated in the beginning of part 2. Repetition of pattern creates the rhythm of the poetry.

# 4.3.1.5 Intonation and Syntax

As syntax is at the heart of discourse analysis and has been discussed in a previous section (see section 2.2) it will be considered here in more detail. As well as syntactic parallelism there is syntactic complexity, which relies less on rhythm and repetition and more on causal relationships. For example in the Archbishop's sermon each 'line' has one central idea around which the syntax and intonation are organized. Consider the quite complex line 25 in the text below:

'Sustaining the climate of mutual trust and confidence / that allows a decision to be implemented effectively / and behaving in ways / that maintain everyone's trust in the integrity of the armed services.'

The central idea is 'Sustaining the climate of trust'. The idea unit following with the focus 'decisions' is syntactically connected to the preceding one because it is a relative clause on the central idea 'sustaining the climate of trust'; signalled by the word 'that'. The next two units, with the focuses 'behaving' and 'maintain', explain why a climate of trust would be sustained. The last idea unit is similarly being syntactically connected to the one before it and is also signalled by the word 'that' illustrating again the Archbishop's use of grammatical parallelism. Further, these last two idea units are also connected by intonation to what precedes because they were said with a low pitch. This pitch signalled the 'background-connected' information that explained both the sustaining climate and a syntactic marker like 'since' connecting them. In other parts of his sermon the syntactic complexity is carried across more than one line, for example, in stanza 18 the central idea of justice is carried through lines 57-59 (see Appendix 1), again signalled by the word 'that'.

# 4.3.1.5 Metaphor and Rhetoric

In his use of metaphoric language the Archbishop demonstrates the potential highlighted by Rose that evocative language can create a connection between preacher and listeners. If, as Lakoff and Johnson suggest, on the basis of linguistic evidence, most of the ordinary conceptual system is metaphorical in nature, then it is possible that parts of the Archbishop's sermon are metaphors for the life of Jesus as the following demonstrates (2003, p. 4):

- 56. Justice does not come without cost.
- 57. In the most obvious sense / it is the cost of life and safety.

- 58. For very many here today / that will be the first thing / in their minds and hearts;
- 59. Along with the cost in anxiety and compassion / that is carried by the families of service men and women.

In the lines shown above the Archbishop is using the language of 'cost'. In the biblical tradition of the New Testament the life, death and resurrection of Jesus is seen as paying the price for the sins of humanity and is recognized as the 'cost of salvation' (cf. Mt 20:28). If he is using these phrases above as a metaphor for Jesus' life then a connection can be made here to the style of Jesus' teaching, demonstrating the Archbishop's poetic, Biblical pastiche. In the Christian tradition of the New Testament Jesus taught people by telling metaphoric stories in the form of parables<sup>31</sup>. Lakoff and Johnson believe that thinking is metaphoric, therefore, an understanding of the world may come through these metaphoric stories told out of peoples' experiences. Jesus taught through parables, which leave the listeners to work out for themselves how the metaphor may connect to their own experiences. Here the Archbishop is doing likewise, through his description of the daily life of the service men and women in a warzone and the sacrifices they have to make within a life of obedience. He connects that metaphor of their daily working life to the second part of his sermon by commencing with a relevant passage from the scripture. This demonstrates Rose's belief that in transformational preaching what is transmitted is no longer an idea or a message but a transforming experience (1997, p.78).

In some ways this metaphoric element of the Archbishop's sermon runs counter to the poetic and falls more into the rhetorical. However, as discussed in Chapter 2, there are

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>31</sup> A parable is a simple story used to illustrate a moral or spiritual lesson, as told by Jesus in the Gospels.

those who would argue that there are poetic elements that are rhetorical since they are used to persuade. The Archbishop is building up to his view that service personnel doing their job and sacrificing their lives are more indicative of 'intelligence and integrity' than 'the rhetoric of politicians and commentators' (see Appendix 1, line 30). He uses performative elements to develop a sense of the responsibility shouldered by these service personnel. A common rhetorical strategy to keep listeners' attention is by using lists, most particularly lists of three, forming a completion point where a next utterance begins and there are indications that the Archbishop uses this strategy. Within the church setting congregations are accustomed to lists of three exemplified by use of the three persons of the Trinity: Father, Son and Holy Spirit (Atkinson, p.59). An example of this is found in stanza 14 (see Appendix 1), the Archbishop uses triple repetition of characteristics of the work of the invisible enemy. This list of three, works to strengthen and amplify the message of criticism of taking shortcuts in the search for justice. He uses another list of three to make his point about the temptations of shortcuts:

- 46. Against these temptations / St Paul tells us / to wrap ourselves round with the truth,
- 47. to be defended by justice
- 48. And to be impatient for peace
- 49. These are not remote ideals for any religious minority

Here St Paul's words are a theological comment on the life of Jesus who did 'wrap himself around with the truth etc.' (see Appendix 1, lines 46-48) even though it meant his crucifixion. The Archbishop uses the above lists of three by continuing with a comparative point, also made in a list of three, about the work of the military personnel

in Iraq who were willing to count the cost and overcome these temptations, in the following list of 3 in lines 64-66 with line 67 summing up:

- 64. A **cost in** putting up with boredom / or frustration / in the course of operations.
- 65. In **setting aside** prejudice / and resentment / to get to know a strange culture 66. And to **feel** for its people.
- 67. These are all part of the **cost** / the sacrifice involved in seeking a better and more more secure life / for people who have suffered outrageously.

He may be making a subtle political point about the behaviour of those politicians and senior military personnel, who have tried to shortcut the proper procedure associated with the conflict in Iraq: lines 42-45 (see Appendix 1). The Archbishop proceeds to theologically reflect on this point by using the list of three as already mentioned above in (lines 46-48).

In the lines above the Archbishop uses words and phrases that the service men and women will understand. This is one of many occasions that he uses the rhetorical device of thematic fronting along with a high incidence of nominalisation. For example, the following phrases: moments of high tragedy (Appendix 1, line 71); patient acceptance (Appendix 1, line 72); painstaking attention (Appendix 1, line 73) are not put in the object position but in the subject position.<sup>32</sup> These performance features demonstrate that the way text is articulated is crucial to the structure assigned in terms of units, focuses and lines. Responsible listeners are expected to take notice of these cues.

79

 $<sup>^{32}</sup>$  See also: Appendix 1, line 46 – 'Against these temptations St Paul tells us to wrap ourselves round with truth'

# 4.3.1.6 The Language of Authority

The Archbishop's sermon is full of assertions, beginning in line 1 with the assertion that 'today is a time for reflection' and continuing line by line thereafter (see Appendix 1). In fostering his authority using a formal style, he is aiming to persuade. This is contrary to his point in stanza 10 about the moral credibility of any country engaged in war. Through this point, however, the Archbishop points listeners to the end of part 1 and the situation in Irag.

This language positions him in a place of authority in the field. His statements are more assertive than those of the Dean, for example, who makes his theological points by telling a story. By making the judgement (in Appendix 1, line 24) that the responsibility of frontline service men and women remains the same and by suggesting what that responsibility is, the Archbishop takes a stance of authority. In Rose' scheme of homiletics the traditional theory sees the preacher as the authority figure whose main responsibility is to tell people what to believe and why they should believe it (1997, p. 14). The Archbishop develops his position of authority in stanza 7, line 20 'what matters' and continues into stanza 8 line 24 with the introductory phrase:

24. **The responsibility** of those on the front line **remained** / **and remains** the same. The Archbishop fosters this authoritarian position with 'the demanding task' line 26 and 'one of the heaviest responsibilities' in line 27, leading to line 30 and ending part 1 with line 31:

- 30. **The moral credibility** of any country engaged in war **depends a lot less** on the rhetoric of politicians and commentators
- 31. Than on the **capacity of every serving soldier** to discharge these responsibilities with integrity and intelligence.

In any situation where the Archbishop preaches there is likely to be a tension. On the one hand between the 'double' authority that he has in the light of his position in the church hierarchy and the authority to preach that the institution gives to all priests at their ordination, and, on the other hand, any desire he might have to communicate with listeners from a place of equality that Rose suggests is indicative of a conversational view of preaching. The added difficulty for the Archbishop of Canterbury is the historical authority of his role and his linguistic habitus as a highly educated man who has had the role of a teacher in the academy.

### 4.3.1.7 **Summary**

The discourses that the Archbishop is using in the lines above are a combination of the religious and the political. The life of Jesus, which has been described as one of obedience and commitment, is re-framed in this sermon to reflect the lives of the service men and women who were in the conflict in Iraq suggesting that the global themes of peace and justice are framed both explicitly and implicitly as Christian. The Archbishop's rhetorical strengths place him in both Rose's traditional and transformational categories. It revolves around his ability to take the present situation, which in this instance is marking the end of military operations in Iraq and interweave it into a biblical framework. He does this both structurally and linguistically by creating a

poetic foundation and a field where he is capital rich. The first part of his sermon recounts the reality of engagement in Iraq both for the service men and women and their relationships with those who love and support them.

In his sermon the Archbishop uses repetition, metaphor and rhetoric to communicate his ideas and move listeners towards an acceptance of them. His poetic language not only enables listeners to empathise with the experience of life in a warzone, but also, the language creates a movement from the physical reality to the spiritual bedrock of life, that is the mystery of God. Throughout his sermon the Archbishop's performance includes different linguistic techniques to maintain the interest of the listeners. By using the language of 'obedience', 'trust', 'anxiety' and 'compassion' he invites into this sermonic conversation those people who can connect with his second-hand experience of the realities of the war in Iraq (c.f. Fairclough's members' resources). In Rose's (1997, p. 95) conversational view this sermonic conversation is grounded in a shared identity: as believing people of God shared priesthood before God and within the community; and shared tasks of discerning and proclaiming God's word. In addition, within the conversational mode the Archbishop uses a more accessible approach of preaching through empathetic language; for example in stanza 20 he uses words like boredom and frustration, prejudice and resentment.

Using Gee's methodology for organising and processing naturally occurring speech has revealed the overall structure, which in the Archbishop's sermon falls into Rose's transformational view of preaching. Throughout the sermon his performance oscillates between the traditional view when he asserts his authority; the conversational view

when he uses language that reflects the recognizable reality of life for the servicemen and women; and the transformational view when he uses rhetoric to persuade or transform listeners to his point of view. However, the main tenor of the sermon is transformational, demonstrated by his strategic use of repetition, metaphor and rhetoric. He is preaching in a very formal situation and this is reflected in his performance. He displays his institutional authority and has no need to establish his place in the field having already accumulated his linguistic capital and his position through his title.

# 4.3.2. The Dean of Ripon Cathedral

The Dean of Ripon Cathedral served in ministry for twenty-nine years in the dioceses of Lichfield, York and, finally, Ripon and Leeds where he was appointed Dean of Ripon Cathedral in March 2007 (see Appendix 9 for further details).

The Dean preaches his sermon on the green in the small village of Bainbridge, North Yorkshire. The service is an outdoor, ecumenical<sup>33</sup> service preached under a gazebo in the middle of Bainbridge green to celebrate the Feast of Pentecost. It is an open-air service of witness. The village green forms the centre of the village and is surrounded by roads, one of which is the main road through the village. It is also surrounded on all sides by cottages and local businesses. During the time of the service people come out of their homes and sit on the green within earshot of the gazebo, and cars stop at the side of the road with windows rolled down so passengers can hear. Under the gazebo is

<sup>33</sup> A number of different Christian denominations are represented.

-

a lectern, which is for the preacher, and some chairs. When the Dean speaks from the lectern, which is in front of the listeners and on a level with them, he uses a hand-held microphone. There are approximately thirty people under the gazebo and up to twenty people sat in the vicinity with at least four cars along the road with two passengers in each one.

The event was designed to witness to the presence of the church in the village and to demonstrate an act of worship to passers-by. The informal context of the event; the importance of being heard by those listening, both churched and unchurched would contribute to the nature and delivery of the sermon. The Dean was aware that some listeners might have no experience of 'being in church' and that could have influenced his choice of biblical translation (see later) as well as his speech.

# 4.3.2.1 Discourse Topic and Main Line Material

Briefly, the core of the Dean's sermon is a story about a train disaster and his involvement in it. The Dean uses the story to demonstrate how God works through the gifts that people have and the good that can arise when people are willing to use them. Using Gee's analytical approach, the Dean's sermon divides easily into 186 lines, 46 stanzas and 25 strophes. This approach reveals that the overall discourse topic of the Dean's sermon is 'the Wonder of God': the 'main line material' (discussed below). The text (Appendix 2) falls into three parts: Part 1 describes the Dean's journey to Bainbridge beginning with stanza1 at Ripon Cathedral, and this serves to set the Dean's context (Goffman's 'preplay' 1990, p.24); the second is the story of the train disaster

and forms the main part of the sermon, stanza 9 through to stanza 29; and Part 3 is the end result of the story and a description of how God worked through people to bring the heroine of the story to faith and witness. The whole story can be seen as a metaphor for Christian discipleship. The Dean begins with the scripture passage and then builds the characters of the story to demonstrate the relevance of that scripture for people today. The Dean's style in the first part has some similarities with that of the Archbishop but after that their approaches differ markedly.

Before he tells the story of the train disaster the Dean reads from the Scripture part of the Apostle Paul's letter to the church at Ephesus. The inference of the Scripture is that Christ shares his gifts with his disciples so they will learn to serve others and through that service will grow strong in faith. The story of the train disaster focuses on how the Dean and others helped the heroine of the story. His message demonstrates how God, by his Holy Spirit, works through ordinary people, blending the biblical with non-biblical in a very different way from the Archbishop of Canterbury. The Dean uses theological reflection indirectly as he tells his story, whereas the Archbishop sets an assertive biblical tone all the way through his sermon (see Appendix 1, part 2).

The main line material in the text (see Appendix 3) is only a very small fraction of the whole and it occurs in a non-random way within the whole narrative. By strophe 6 in Part 2, when the Dean begins to tell the story proper, the main line material appears regularly one phrase at a time. It is developed in Part 3 where it begins to appear as two phrases at a time in the stanzas suggesting that the main line material is more about the 'Wonder of God' than it is about 'The Story'. By this the Dean implies it was part of

God's purpose that he walked across a field to meet a lady in the mist that had '*lost*' her husband. It is born out by his implication that, even though he did not find the husband, he helped her to find God who had used him and others to support her in discovering God and a new community.

The Dean sometimes uses within his sermon either a temporal reference to bring the listeners right into the moment of the story or spiritual references to connect them with the numinous. For example, the Dean has two images of home, the first one in Part 1 is the physical home of the Cathedral and the second one in Part 2 is the spiritual home that is embedded in the Scripture (see Appendix 2 stanza 10). Within his temporal references strophe 6 begins the story proper. Just as he used the reference to a particular occasion at the Cathedral ('just there long enough') to switch from stanza 1 to stanza 2, he also uses the reference to a specific occasion in the story ('a different day') to switch from stanza 11 to 12 repeating the word 'different' to keep the connection.

Strophe 7, stanzas 13 and 14 place the Dean physically into the frame of the story by asking a rhetorical question in stanza13:

40. Why was I walking across a field that day? and answering it in stanza14:

# 54. There's been a train disaster

These two stanzas create the structure of the story. He uses the idea of a journey to equate listeners with himself in the story by a 'resumptive parallel' (Hymes 2007, p.146), the journey to the green that they all have made paralleled to the journey from

his home to the field near the train crash in the story.<sup>34</sup> This syntactic system makes links between the stanzas across the whole narrative. It creates consistency in the text anchoring into it both the narrator and listeners.

#### 4.3.2.2 Poetic Structure

The main focus of this section uses Gee's analytic approach to reveal the underlying poetic structure found within the narrative. It demonstrates that when narrative prose is broken down into its poetic structure, the strategies used by the preacher to evoke connections with listeners become more apparent. By delineating the text into lines, stanzas and strophes the thematic development becomes more noticeable through the different levels evident in the poetic language.

The vivid scene and the similarity of venue and the Dean's use of poetic language evoke a connection with the story. He uses poetic language that reinforces the reality of the scenes as he describes them, enabling the listeners to experience, in Rose's terms, connection and solidarity with him. Stanza 15 begins with 'it became known' and stanza 16 begins with 'you know'. The Dean weaves into his story repeated phrases that connect the listeners back into the story ('I've never forgotten it' line 60; 'And I remember' line 65; 'I noticed a couple of things' line 92) and back into the presence of God ('and he said God help us' line 67).<sup>35</sup>

2

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>34</sup> The action in this first part of his sermon takes place in a field adjacent to the train crash and this is synonymous with the Bainbridge green.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>35</sup> Labov's work on narrative talks of the anchoring strategies of the traditional Anglo-narrative.

Stanza 26 is the end of the first part of the story of the heroine. The way the words 'So' and 'and' are used preceded by a significant pause along with the clear break in intonation with what precedes, as well as the use of the word 'then' reveals the disfluency that begins stanza 27. This helps to indicate the switch in emphasis from the first part of the heroine's story and the beginning of the next phase. The way the Dean handles his story demonstrates a much more personal stance than that of the Archbishop of Canterbury.

As a signal to the listeners that the story is moving on quickly through the next stanzas towards Part 3 and the overall discourse topic 'the Wonder of God', the Dean uses 'and' and 'but' frequently. This is in contrast to the syntactic complexity of the Archbishop of Canterbury. Ideas joined together with connectives in this way are typical of conversational and narrative talk. Coordinators such as 'and' or 'but' tie together two or more clauses of the same status and are indicators of either new material or a return to previously mentioned material. The Dean uses stanza 30 at the beginning of Part 3 to introduce the next phase of the story by acknowledging the movement. He again uses 'and' to move the story on quickly, switching the perspective away from the train crash including what happened to the heroine, and into the church, which is the focus of this part of the sermon. The focus also changes from the darkness of the night of the train crash to the lightness of a smiling face.

Strophe 17 introduces the church and is the point that the story begins to turn to the discourse topic as well as to the involvement of those listening. Strophe 18 reintroduces God and the idea of belonging to a community. Strophe 20 is not only a powerful image of the work of God it also creates important echoes back to the scripture reading that began the story. Stanza 43 switches to Bainbridge and uses the same language of wandering that the Dean used about the heroine when he met her. Strophe 25 closes the story by acknowledging that God is responsible and all the listeners have to do is to be themselves. Gee suggests that when the text is structured it divides a narrative into pieces of information about the people and events that make up the story (1991, p. 20). The patterning of the text into stanzas and strophes emphasises the discourse theme 'the Wonder of God' and the participation of the listeners in its outworking in the community. The images created through the stanzas enable listeners to travel through the story with the Dean as the participants, events, or changes in time or frame, shift from each preceding stanza.

#### 4.3.2.3. Self-deprecating Language

The Dean sets a self-deprecating tone in the first part of his sermon. In line 11 he tells listeners that the Cathedral congregation clapped when he said that he was going to Bainbridge, suggesting that the Cathedral congregation thought it was a privilege for him to go there. He reinforces this in lines 12,13 where he brings greetings from the Ripon congregation to the people of Bainbridge. However, he sets himself apart from listeners when in stanza 1 he informs them he has a role at the Cathedral. This type of

action that separates the preacher from listeners is found in each of Rose's three dominant views of preaching.<sup>36</sup>

At the same time the notion of Goffman's 'preplay' (1990, p.24) is illustrated as the Dean opens his sermon by including the Bainbridge listeners in the scene at Ripon Cathedral in preparation for them to listen to the story of the heroine of the train crash. Not only does this generate a rapport with listeners, it also establishes his position in the field and gains him some linguistic capital. He uses a temporal phrase 'just long enough' to switch from a generic discussion ('at the cathedral') to discussion of a specific occasion, in order to signal the change from one stanza to the next.

Stanza 2 begins to set the self-deprecating tone, which is fulfilled in stanza 4. In stanza 5 he changes the perspective slightly by using the word 'anyway' indicating the selfdeprecation is over and he is now getting down to the business of the sermon proper. In stanza 6 the Dean reassures the listeners again by suggesting that being outside would have God's approval, thus returning to the overall discourse topic ('the Wonder of God'). Strophe 4 is the coda to part 1 and builds on the understanding of the 'Wonder of God' with a challenge not to make this a 'one-off' event but to repeat it and double the number next year.

# 4.3.2.4 Metaphor and Metonymy

The Dean uses the rhetorical device 'synecdoche': that is an example of the special case of metonymy known by traditional rhetoricians as 'Part for the whole'. There are many

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>36</sup> Traditional kerygmatic; or transformational view of preaching

parts that can stand for the whole. For example, in his sermon the Dean uses 'Ephesians' to refer to the people of the congregation of the church at Ephesus (see stanza 9, Appendix 2). Elsewhere in his sermon he refers to people who attend the 9.30am service at the Cathedral as the '9.30'. Metaphors are to be frequently found. For example, the story of the heroine 'wandering aimlessly' after the train crash and after death of her husband may be a metaphor for those who do not have a purpose in their lives and the term 'wreckage' also appears to be a metaphor for the state that people may find their lives in:

- 71. Of course she was deeply in shock
- 76. She had managed to get herself out of the wreckage
- 77. and was just- you know- in the shock, wandering aimlessly
- 125. And she said 'There was many a night in the first phase of bereavement when I would just leave home; (she lived in Newcastle)
- 126. I'd leave home and I'd **just wander up and down streets** of Newcastle wondering whether life was worth living

The Dean also used the metaphor of the church as a person:

18. The church / on this particular day / witnessing in the open air (Appendix 2)

He tells the story to present information to the listeners without having to be explicit about the church, by entwining the narrative together with information, facts and instructions embedded in the narrative structure, for example, the date, time of year and place of the incident. The Dean includes these actual facts as part of the metaphor and metonymy to show that when someone has a disaster in his/her life the simplest thing

that another person can do is to ask what he or she can do to help.<sup>37</sup> He includes the listeners in the metaphor by using line 53 (Appendix 2), which refers the incident to their actual memory, thereby evoking their participation in the story.

# 4.3.2.5 Involvement Strategy

As previously discussed in Chapter 2, Tannen's emphasis is on involvement strategies particularly in conversational discourse, recognizing them to be 'spontaneous and pervasive' (2007, p. 25). It is probable that as part of his strategy to involve listeners directly with his story, the Dean supplies them with information about the conditions on the day of the train crash and by giving them the actual date so that they can use it to remember where they were at the time of the crash. Using the simple question 'what can I do' he indirectly shows them what they can do in any situation that they may find themselves. In this way the Dean uses this context to encourage the congregation to place themselves in the story. He has given them enough information in order for them to identify the contrast where they are with him on the village green with the story so they can envisage the place and the people and be able to see themselves there. The Dean may be weaving together enough information that the listeners can believe that they could do the same in any similar situation; 'so that his people might learn to serve', This approach orients his sermon more to Rose's conversational view than Archbishop of Canterbury did in his sermon. Using 'phatic' communication the Dean creates a

.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>37</sup> By using the facts of the incident the Dean includes the element of reality to demonstrate that this could happen at any time in anyone's life.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>38</sup> This is a good example of what Goffman calls 'space between the lines' and Fairclough's 'members' resources'.

context in which listeners can embody the lessons of Pentecost (Muriel Saville-Troike, 2003, p.13).<sup>39</sup>

# 4.2.2.6 Narrative and Repetition

As has been previously stated, stories are a means by which past experiences are organized in the memory and narrative is so powerful that it provides a context for an individual's world around them. Narrative has been recognized as an alternative, but equally important approach to making claims about knowledge, presenting viewpoint and constructing and challenging theories about individuals (Georgakopoulou & Goutsos, p.40) The overall interpretation of a narrative is constrained not only by its focal point but also by the need to answer interpretive questions that have been set by the structure of the narrative in terms of idea units, lines, stanzas, strophes and parts as illustrated in Appendix 3 (Gee1991). Gee's approach to narrative marking the text into lines, stanzas and strophes, helps to demonstrate how meaning is distilled from the prose (see Appendix 2).

The Dean appears to have told this story to articulate what he believes Pentecost has to do with the church today. He believes that through the power of the Holy Spirit, just by 'being there' people can do things they never believed they could. By listing the people involved in the heroine's story in stanzas 39 and 40, the Dean uses the cumulative effect to make his point. He adds to its persuasive effect by repeating words and phrases:

#### 155. But **he used** me to help Shirley / just by being there

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>39</sup> Phatic communication conveys a message, but has no referential meaning. The meaning is in the act of communication itself (2003, p.13).

- 156. **And then he used** the people who were singers / and musicians in the church in Newcastle to be there for Shirley
- 157. **And then he used** the people who were welcomers in the church / and those who made the tea and coffee
- 158. **And then he used** the members of the house group / and the clergy of the church to encourage her / and prepare her for confirmation
- 159. **And then he used** those who serve with Shirley in the school hearing children to read.
- 160. This is what God does

At the same time the Dean uses intonation to accentuate the point up to line 159 and then in line 160 his intonation changes from incredulity to quiet awe.

# 4.3.2.7 **Summary**

The Dean recounts the story using the vernacular in order to establish his position in the religious field. His performance, by conveying feelings, creates a

connection with the listeners both through the kind of language he uses and also by referring to them directly: 'some of you may remember...' (see Appendix 2, line 55). It may seem as if this demonstrates Rose's conversational view of preaching and to some extent it does. However, the Dean shows a desire to transform listeners' view of themselves as unworthy of being servants of God by the urgent tone in his voice from stanza 42 onwards. He has set himself apart from listeners in the 'preplay' signifying a gap between himself and listeners. These indicators suggest the Dean's preaching is transformative.

# 4.3.3 The Archbishop of York

The Archbishop of York was born into the Buffalo Clan in Uganda in 1949. He was educated by the English missionaries and teachers, and graduated in Law at the University of Makerere in Kampala. He came to the U.K. in 1974 and read theology at Selwyn College, Cambridge. He trained for the ministry at Ridley Hall Cambridge and was ordained in 1979. In 1996 he was consecrated Bishop of Stepney; in 2002 he became the Bishop of Birmingham; and in 2005 he became the Archbishop of York (see Appendix 9 for further details).

The Archbishop of York preaches his thanksgiving sermon at the church of St Andrew and St Mary in the village of Paull in East Yorkshire. He uses the pulpit at the front of the church above the listeners. The Archbishop was invited to the church of St Andrew and St Mary to bless the refurbishment of the church and its bell. Over £200,000 was raised for the refurbishment of which £80,000 was collected by the village itself. This was an outstanding achievement given that the village of Paull has only three hundred and thirty houses and a population of six hundred people.

The refurbishment entailed a replacement of the whole of the roof on the nave of the church as well as the restoration of the bell which had not been rung for twenty years and re-pointing of several of the outside walls. Those present at the Archbishop's service are members of the church with their families including Parochial Church Councillors and the Church Wardens; children from the local school; and those who had

been involved in helping to raise funds for the refurbishment. The church is full. As with the other sermons analysed, context is important. The Dean had to be aware in his sermon that there may be difficulties for people hearing him; equally the Archbishop is confronted with the complication of reaching his listeners. For him the challenge is to take into account the mixture of ages and church experience of his listeners.

# 4.3.3.1 Discourse Topic and Main Line Material

The sermon is about a thanksgiving and a celebration. It focuses upon the ideas of the hard work of restoration, of a journey and of gifts. The Archbishop examines the journey and the gifts of the Wise Men and, in a similar way to the Dean who uses the story of the train crash as the main thrust of his sermon, he creates a tableau<sup>40</sup> with a child from the congregation to come and examine with him samples of the three gifts. Using Gee's analytical approach in the same way as in Sections 4.2.2.1 and 4.3.2.1, the Archbishop's sermon divides easily into 178 lines, 40 stanzas and 20 strophes. This tableau is central to the whole sermon since takes up the whole of one part, which contains nine of the twenty strophes. It is central because, through the child, it takes listeners on a crucial journey to understanding the importance and value of gifts. As with all the other sermons analysed here, it is held together by an over-arching metaphor. This approach reveals the overall discourse topic of 'restoration', whilst the main line material is exemplified by the concepts of 'gifts' and 'journey'.

.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>40</sup> See a detailed analysis of the tableau in the section 4.3.3.4 below

The text of the Archbishop's sermon (Appendix 4) falls into four parts: the first part of the sermon gives thanks to the people for the restoration of the church. This sets the tenor of celebration and thanksgiving that will continue through the whole sermon. In addition, it signals the idea that the sermon will be about the restoration of relationships with God. Part 2, focuses on the gifts that the Wise Men bring to the baby Jesus, opening up the possibility of equating the journey of the Wise Men to the journey of the church towards its restoration. This is central to the whole discourse because it is about work, effort and achievement, not abandoning the journey when it becomes difficult and about the costliness of the undertaking not just in monetary terms. In addition it follows the theme of the day, the Epiphany of Christ. In this part of his sermon, he establishes the shared universe of the discourse created by a regular interaction between him and the child. Having already established the parallelism between the journey of the wise men and the costliness of their gifts (see Appendix 4, stanza 7) he then begins a didactic sequence through his performance with a child. In this sequence the Archbishop uses lexical repetition and a very gentle tone to ensure that his points are made clearly.

In Part 3 the Archbishop turns his focus onto Jesus, the child that the Wise Men had journeyed to meet. He examines the mistake of the Wise Men in going to visit Herod in his sumptuous surroundings. He points out that Jesus was not born a palace but in an ordinary village just as Paull is an ordinary village. As a parenthesis, he acknowledges that the people of Paull have never failed in their generosity in contributing to the Diocesan common fund. This parenthesis (reminiscent of a conversation) demonstrates the development of his relationship with the listeners (cf. Tannen).

The Archbishop concludes Part 4 with the focus on celebrating being a child of God. This entails being empowered by the gift of the Holy Spirit and recognizing that with this gift comes the responsibility to witness. He notes that Christians as children of God should testify to this by their behaviour in the world. The images in Parts 1 and 4 show that this restoration of relationships/building carries responsibility as well as celebration The images of Parts 2 and 3 demonstrate that life is a process and sometimes mistakes are made along the way but the end result is an intimate relationship with God (see Appendix 5 for an overview of the main line material).

The Archbishop opens his sermon with thanks to the congregation for the restoration work. Then, immediately he intertwines this with thanks to God in stanza 2 (see Appendix 4, line 6-9) while at the same time as establishing his relationship with those listening to him by the use of 'your' (the second person plural). He frames his sermon by recognizing the work of restoration and associating that with the 'very, very rich feast of Epiphany' by using the same language in relation to God (Goffman 1990, p24):

- 1. May I also add my own thanks to all of you
- 2. For restoring this church

Stanza 2 (Celebration)

- 8. In the celebration of the life of Christ / who has come into the world
- 9. To restore our relationship with God
- 10. And your thanksgiving / for the restoration and repair / of your church building.

# 4.3.3.2 Repetition and Rhythm

As already discussed in Chapter 2 and re-iterated in 4.3.2.5 Tannen recognizes involvement strategies to be as important in literary discourse as in conversation. She also suggests that rhythmic strategies work mainly on sound (2007, p. 32) and so lexical repetitions work to evoke connectedness between preachers and listeners. This section will show that, for the Archbishop, repetition and rhythm are inextricably linked. Given the Archbishop's background of European and African influences it is likely that the Archbishop's 'African habitus' will have an influence on the content and style he uses in his sermon. For example, he demonstrates a particular 'feel for the game' illustrated by this acknowledgement of the hard work of the church members and community (see Appendix 4, line 3) at the same time as wanting to create an atmosphere of celebration and fun (see Appendix 4, lines 4-6).

To enhance the level of interpretation by listeners in stanza 1 the Archbishop not only uses phonological repetition of the letter 'r' but he also uses a parallelism of 'restore, relationship' with 'restore, repair' perhaps to emphasise his point. He follows this by acknowledging that the restoration of the church building is not yet complete and, if the repetition achieves its purpose, then the listeners will recognize that their 'restoration' in respect of their own life's journey with Christ is also incomplete. This use of repetition ties all of the stanzas in Part 1 to each other creating what might be a subtheme at the same time as helping to bond listeners and preacher in mutual activity. This further strengthens the Archbishop's relationship with listeners. In stanza 16 the Archbishop links listeners back to Dr Who in stanza1 whilst at the same time teaching

-

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>41</sup> This accords with Bourdieu's suggestion of habitus giving the 'feel for the 'game' (see Chapter 2)

about the symbolism of incense. By repeating his allusion to the Tardis he moves his listeners from Dr Who the explorer and friend in line 71 to Jesus who leads us in 'what we are supposed to do' in line 77. The Archbishop also uses lexical repetition and a very gentle tone to ensure that his points are made clearly. In stanzas 10-12 he uses repetition of the word 'pure' increasing its importance through the stanzas until it becomes 'absolutely pure' in stanza 12.

Once the involvement of the child has ended and she has gone back to sit with her school the Archbishop changes his focus back to directly involving the adult listeners by using rhythmic synchrony. Rhythmic synchrony is, according to Tannen, an involvement strategy and combined with repetition. This combination is poetic and shows language being used in a non prose-like way (2007, p. 32). The Archbishop repeats phrases in such a way that listeners synchronise with the pattern of beats and consequently are re-involved in the discourse:

- 106. Jesus **comes to us** as a king
- 107. **Comes to us** / as a one who prays **for us**
- 108. And stands **between us** and God
- 109. **Comes** as one / who has **come** to die for us
- and he comes as one of **us** / so that he may lead **us** to the rightful God.

This is a different kind of repetition from that used by the Archbishop of Canterbury and is one that relies on much more rhythm. The Archbishop of York emphasises the word 'us' creating the rhythm composed of tempo, the pattern of the beats and density, and syllables per beat. This is a link to what is known about black preachers generally and their rhythmic repetition, like the lyrics of a song (see Tannen, p. 33). The aim of

rhythmic synchrony is 'ensemble', the coming together in interaction. In this way the Archbishop entices listeners back into the sermon after the child has gone back to her seat (Tannen, 2007, pp.32-34), opening up the opportunity for the listeners who have been 'observers' to become re-involved with the rhetoric.

As noted earlier, in strophe 13 the Archbishop moves on to talk about the mistake that the Wise Men made in assuming this king would be born in a palace. By linking in his rhetoric to the listeners' village he enables their participation in his sermon because, in his view, by being ordinary and not magnificent, people are able to know God for themselves. The additional point to note about this comment in the middle of this part of the sermon (see Appendix 4, lines 119-121), which is seemingly out of place, is that through it the connection is made between the listeners' simple generosity to others and the Wise Men's generosity to Christ. A particularly powerful example of rhythm and repetition is found in strophe 15 where the Archbishop of York tells those listening 'what they need is forgiveness' and he uses lexical repetition to emphasize his belief by repeating the words 'we need' four times and 'forgiveness' twice.

Part 4 of the Archbishop's sermon focuses on 'being a child of God' by using Jesus' baptism by John the Baptist as a frame. In stanza 33 he uses narrative and tells a story once told by Archbishop Desmond Tutu. This story tells the listeners more about him because he admits that he loves the story indicating he believes that behaving is a certain way is good. Narrative is the translating of previous experiences that are segmented into a sequence of temporally ordered, discrete events that can be used to enhance understanding of a point being made. The use of narrative: can bring speaker

and listener into a position of rapport; can enhance intimacy; and can strengthen the bonds between participants, thus creating a participation framework. (Georgakopoulou and Goutsos, 2001, p.52).

The language that the Archbishop uses and the pictures he paints in the story, all determine something about him. For example, the Archbishop uses this story to begin the final part of his sermon and to change the tenor of his language (see Appendix 4, strophe 17):

- 143. I **love** that wonderful story / told by Archbishop Desmond Tutu
- 144. Written by a **teacher** in Soweto
- Of a boy / who gave an interesting answer to a question / during an examination
- 146. And the question was 'what did John the Baptist say to Jesus when he came to be baptised by John'
- 147. And the boy said 'John the Baptist said, "now you know you are the Son of God start behaving like one"'

# 148. (I just thought that) lad very bright

The story correlates with one in the Bible about Jesus confounding teachers in the Temple (c.f. Luke 2:46-47). Immediately after the section above, the Archbishop uses rhythm and repetition to carry people along with him to his next point that the boy was right:

- 151. So the boy was right, 'Now that you know you are the Son of God start behaving like one'
- 152. And then / of course / what happened, /the Holy Spirit descends on Jesus / and God says 'you are my beloved son'
- And so dear friends this is a very **great** day, a **great** moment, a very **great** time,
- Where you and I give thanks for the **restoration** of this church, the **restoration** of the bell and soon the **restoration** of the vestry.

The way in which the Archbishop has used rhythm and repetition gives great weight to the important points he is trying to make. It also creates an atmosphere that opens up the possibility of participation of the listeners (See Rose on connection and solidarity in Chapter 2).

# **4.3.3.3** Metaphor

The first stanza of Part 2 of the Archbishop's sermon focuses on the question of whether the job of the fundraisers' is finished. In using the word 'job', it is possible that the Archbishop means not only that the physical job of restoring the church building is almost complete but also that it is a metaphor for the work of Christ that is not yet finished. Using the first stanza of Part 2 that focuses on the gifts of the Wise Men, the Archbishop acknowledges his own gift to the church restoration fund grounding the whole idea of 'gift' into something tangible for the listeners. Each stanza in Part 2 is a particular take on the idea of gifts beginning with the Wise Men. By stanza 8 the

Archbishop moves the listeners on to understand celebration and gift by asking for a child who has a birthday to help him.

As previously mentioned in 4.3.3.2 above, the Archbishop uses parallelism as a rhetorical strategy to engage the listeners at each stage of the sermon. By using the metaphor of the restoration of the church building to symbolise the restoration of the relationship between the people of the church and God, he offers the possibility of holding listeners' attention because he is talking about something, which is bound to be close to their hearts. Having begun to establish a relationship with the listeners, the Archbishop refocuses his listeners into the biblical theme that informs the metaphor and begins the next part of the sermon.

# 4.3.3.4 Performance

The art of performance, discussed in Chapter 2, is to draw an audience into a discourse. The Archbishop uses several techniques to enable listeners to participate in his sermon: by his occasional authoritarian tone; by his gentle relationship with the child; by his jokes and laughter; and by his use of stretched vowels, significant pauses, changes in pace and rhetorical questions. Before the Archbishop involves a child in the sermon, as part of his performance strategy he stretches a vowel to alert listeners that something is going to happen, for example: 'Go::ld' (see Appendix 4, line 31). In the cluster of sermons analysed in this study this is a technique used only by the Archbishop. Once listeners are aware that there are these signals embedded in the text then their attention is likely to be more acute. The Archbishop relates to the child in two

ways. One of the most overt ways is that he makes the connection safe by taking control as the child comes up into the pulpit, and, another way is by being and sounding gentle. The repeat of the phrase 'come up here' changes from a request to a direction, followed by the repetition of the words 'carefully and gently'.

- **35.** Can you come up here please?
- 36. You are going to help me quite a lot. Do you mind?
- 37. Come up here.
- 38. Carefully, carefully, gently, gently
- 39. And what is your name?

By inviting the child into the pulpit the Archbishop is drawing her into his performance so that he can transmit his message to the other listeners through her, a performance within a performance. The change to a gentler tone by the Archbishop when he speaks to the child reveals another side of his character from that more authoritarian approach which he has held up to this point. However, he still maintains his power in the fact that, even in this gentle mode, he still remains in the pulpit and separate from the body of listeners (Carlson, 2009, p.186). Rose calls this a change from a transformational view of preaching to a conversational view of preaching because learning together suggests equality (1997, p.89). By remaining in the pulpit the frame stands ready rather than having to formulate a new one by joining the child at the listeners' level. At the same time it gives the child time to express her response to whatever is going to happen in the pulpit, creating safety for all concerned (Tannen, 2007, p.57).

Involving the child with the physical substance of the gifts of the Wise Men helps the listeners to integrate their knowledge, perceptions and emotions, consequently activating their imagination and involvement in the story. This action can be related to the ideas of Fairclough and Wenger: that imagination is where meaning is made and shared meaning creates community. The Archbishop creates a scene using objects and includes the child within that scene exemplifying Jewitt's view that meaning comes through a range of different modes (see section 3.1.1 above). At the same time he uses the other performance features already mentioned above. Understanding is facilitated, even enabled, by an emotional experience of interpersonal involvement (Tannen, 2007, p.42). Not only does the Archbishop engage the listeners through the participation of the child, but he also enables them to participate for themselves by creating the scene. It is possible that he uses participation in what is set up as a pedagogic sequence to turn the whole sermon into a learning experience. Similarly the Archbishop begins using 'I' and then moves to 'you':

- 41.Now I have got some gold
- 42. I have got something here / gold
- 45.Can **you** hold it?
- 49. Have **you** ever touched gold before?

At this point in his performance the Archbishop is building the range of experiences for the child. The complex interplay of touch and feel opens up the possibility of an interface between the reality of the gold and the child's imagination. The observation of this scene by listeners blends the visual image, sound, and content of the event to provide them with enough information to evoke interpretation through their imagination

٠

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>42</sup> Wenger and Fairclough, Chapter 2

(Jewitt, 2009, p.10). <sup>43</sup> The Archbishop continually refers the story forward to the present so the listeners can recognize this service of celebration as the beginning of a new ministry just as Jesus began his ministry after his Baptism. He uses a phrase towards the end of the sermon:

- 166. You have understood that I am **celebrating the facts**,
- 167. The church has been massively restored and may be a symbol of all our lives being restored by the love of God

This suggests that the restoration of the church building may be a symbol to the community of their relationship with God being restored. Note the different tenses; 'has been restored' and 'lives being restored'. The word 'celebrating' may be a parallel to 'bring the best of ourselves' to enable the listeners to recognize the best of themselves and celebrate being drawn into a new life of relationship with God. During his performance with the child the Archbishop uses all the involvement techniques that he uses throughout his sermon. However there are some techniques that he uses more frequently with the child. For example, he uses the same style of rhetorical questions with the child (see Appendix 4, lines 35, 36, 44,45) as he does with listeners (see Appendix 4, line 10); he uses lexical repetition (see Appendix 4, lines 28,30) in clusters with the child (see Appendix 4, stanzas 9-12); he speaks in the vernacular using 'yep', 'gev' and 'yeh' which serves the dual purpose of relating to the adults at the same time (see Appendix 4, lines 53, 61, 67). The Archbishop refers to the child as 'wonderful lady' (see Appendix 4, line 67) later using lexical repetition of 'wonderful' to link listeners back to the child (see Appendix 4, line 79).

.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>43</sup> This activity demonstrates an application of semiotic theory.

#### 4.3.3.5 Parallelism

The Archbishop of York uses parallelism in the same way as the Dean, who finished his story by reiterating to his audience that God had used people through his Holy Spirit; and the Archbishop of Canterbury who reminds listeners about whom the service commemorates and in whose name he speaks. This parallelism is shown in the Archbishop of York's final bounding section in strophe 20 (see Appendix 4 lines 171-4). This links back into the frame strophe 1 (see Appendix 4, lines 8-10 above) by using the same language as his initial invitation:

- 171. So we are celebrating today on this feast,
- Which remembers how Jesus Christ was born
- 173. So that all may be drawn into a life of relationship with God
- 174. And with the communities of love and care

At the beginning of Part 2 of the sermon the Archbishop of York tells how the Wise Men travelled far to find the new king. Using parallelism (see line 24, stanza 6) he links back to the concept of '*Dr Who*', who travels through time and space in the '*Tardis*' on impossible journeys with impossible missions to accomplish. The Archbishop then links these two stories to the amazing journey of the church people in front of him and how far they have travelled to restore the church building.

In strophe 2 he continues using parallelism as he illustrates the restoration of relationships through the restoration of the church building. However, to demonstrate the gifts that the Wise Men brought to Jesus he uses the actual material of the gifts, which he shows to a child from the local school. As he shows her each item he gives

information about it, where it came from, how and why it is used. Having begun by thanking listeners for their hard work and encouraging them into an attitude of fun and celebration with a joke about Dr Who (see Appendix 4, stanza 1), the Archbishop creates the space for listeners and himself to meet and reflect on their achievement of restoration, both from the point of view of the church building and their own relationship with God:

#### Stanza 1

2. For **restoring** this church

#### Stanza 2

- 8. In the celebration of the life of Christ / who has come into the world
- 9. To restore our relationship with God
- 10. And your thanksgiving / for the **restoration** and **repair** / of your church building.

Through parallelism in stanzas 4 and 5 the Archbishop connects his personal gift of money to the building restoration fund to the work towards the completion of the restoration of humanity through God's gift of Jesus in stanzas 1 and 2 (see lines 2, 9and10 above). By using parallelism the Archbishop enhances the poetic nature of his sermon and creates coherence in the discourse and 'interpersonal involvement in interaction' (Tannen, 2007, p.101).

The Archbishop's building of a relationship creates the appearance of a more conversational view of his preaching at this point because the Archbishop seems to be closing the gap between him and listeners. However, separation still remains as he

continues to transmit information to listeners, gliding straight back into his theme of the Epiphany in line 23. In Part 2 of his sermon the Archbishop discusses the Epiphany of Christ and, during it, he establishes the shared universe of the discourse he has created by a regular interaction between him and the child. Having already established the parallel between the journey of the Wise Men and their costly gifts (see Appendix 4, stanza 7) with the journey of the congregation and their hard fund-raising work in raising money towards restoration (see Appendix 4, stanza 1), he then begins a didactic sequence through his performance with a child.<sup>44</sup>

#### 4.3.3.6 **Summary**

In his sermon the Archbishop of York develops a relationship with listeners, initially through his acknowledgement of the hard work that the church community has undertaken to restore the building. By using lexical repetition and resumptive parallels he makes a connection between the feast of the 'Epiphany' and the celebration of the work completed, while acknowledging that there is more work to do (see Appendix 4, line 2 and line 9). He further develops the relationship, firstly through humour and then through the involvement of the child. This illustrates Rose's point (1997, p.89) that if preachers and listeners are equal partners on their journey of faith then the gap between them is narrowed. By working with the child and through her developing a closer relationship with the rest of those listening, the Archbishop is acknowledging, at this point, a mutual need for the restoration of their relationship with God. At the same time the awakening of the sense of wonder in the child demonstrates the performance of the work of rebuilding of the fabric of the church. This is being enacted in front of the

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>44</sup> As noted earlier, Appendix 8 shows the structure of all four sermons through the overall stanza/strophe analysis.

church literally rather than metaphorically. The Archbishop is conducting a master class in ministry with the very young, which is directly linked with his main theme. However, transmitting information, in Rose's view, also illustrates the one-directional nature of transformational preaching, which is not evident in conversational preaching (Rose, 1997, p.78). The Archbishop uses other semiotic resources such as rhythmic synchrony and repetitions to re-involve listeners once the child has gone back to her seat.

The Archbishop maintains his position of authority throughout the rest of the sermon. Having established his approachability with the reference to Dr Who and also through his involvement with the child, the Archbishop holds his position of authority in the field through his language and his use of symbolic space, particularly in stanza 3 with the statement about the work not being complete. His authoritarian or perhaps assertive intonation on the personal pronoun in stanza 4 lines 14-15 makes clear his expectation that others will join him to ensure the work on the vestry is complete. This intonation carries on through the whole sermon, changing only into a more gentle tone with the little girl. His phraseology is informative rather than inclusive; for example in stanza 7 the Archbishop says 'these were rare and indeed costly gifts' repeating to emphasise the point 'these were very rare and yet were very costly'.

While Rose (1997, p.14) suggests that when the purpose of a sermon is to persuade it is a traditional view of preaching where the preacher is 'the authority figure whose main duty is to tell people what to believe and why they should believe it', the research here has shown that there are many other ways to persuade. The Archbishop shows one of these ways to persuade through his involvement with the little girl. He shows her what

each of the gifts looks like and tells her how to use them and what they mean. He does this through the child as a way of simplifying without patronizing to adult listeners, particularly when handling the gold, frankincense and myrrh (Appendix 4, stanzas 11-20). In stanza 21 the Archbishop uses triple repetition of 'to show'. He has just finished showing the little girl what the gifts look and feel like. He concludes this part of the sermon by relating the gifts to listeners by using the triplet to emphasise that he has shown how the Wise Men saw Jesus as a king and now he has shown them Jesus as 'prophet, priest and king' (see Appendix 4, lines 96,95,94). By using the story from Desmond Tutu and the interactive drama with the little girl, the Archbishop provides a much more hybrid performance than that the Archbishop of Canterbury and the Dean, showing switches in intonation and relationships with listeners.

# 4.3.4. The Bishop of Knaresborough

The Bishop of Knaresborough was born in the Eden Valley in Cumbria. He was a parish priest for 11 years and for four years he acted as Adviser for Ministry and was Director of Ministry Training Programme at Willesden. He then became Director of Ministry & Training for the Diocese of Ripon & Leeds and was also Residentiary Canon of Ripon Cathedral. Following that he was appointed as Director of Mission for the Diocese of Ripon & Leeds; and was consecrated Bishop of Knaresborough in 2007 (see Appendix 9 for further details).

The Bishop of Knaresborough preaches his sermon at Ripon Cathedral. The sermon is preached in the Maundy Thursday<sup>45</sup> Service of Renewal of Baptismal and Ordination Vows, with the blessing of the oils<sup>46</sup>. Those present are diocesan clergy; lay workers, members of the congregations of the clergy and general members of the public. The centre section of the cathedral is almost full which would suggest somewhere in the region of 200 people. The Bishop speaks from the pulpit situated high above the listeners at the front left side of the main body of the cathedral. The context of the service requires that the sermon concentrate on the clergy present. As will be discussed below the context is theological as well as biblical and therefore the delivery assumes a level of understanding in both these fields.

# 4.3.4.1 Discourse Topic and Main Line Material

Although the service is focused upon the ordained members of the congregation, the Bishop's sermon is also aimed at all the other listeners. The overall discourse topic of the whole text is 'A New Commandment'. The sermon falls into three parts: the first part focuses on the crises facing the church today. After listing the various crises that have arisen in the universal church, the Bishop recognizes that he is offering a depressing beginning to what he has to say. He moves fairly quickly into Part 2 of his sermon, which examines the new commandment that Jesus gives to his disciples. Prior

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>45</sup> Maundy Thursday is the Thursday before Good Friday in the week before Easter that commemorates the Last Supper of Jesus with his disciples. The word 'Maundy' is believed could come form the Latin 'mandatum' which is the first word of Jesus' phrase 'A new commandment I give unto you, that you love one another as I have loved you', (John 13:34) by which Jesus explained to his disciples the significance of his action of washing their feet.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>46</sup> The Diocesan Bishop blesses three oils; Oil of Baptism, Oil of Chrism, used at ordinations, for consecrations or for those making a profession of faith, Oil for Anointing of the sick and those close to death. The blessing of the oils and the consecration of the chrism are ordinarily celebrated on Maundy Thursday morning, in a service of Holy Communion. The service is one of the principle expressions of the priesthood of the bishop and signifies the close unity of priests with him.

to the giving of the new commandment Jesus has told the disciples that the two most important commandments are: 'to love God with all that you are (my précis) and to love your neighbour as you love yourself' (c.f. Mark 12:29-31). After Judas left the 'last supper' Jesus gives the remaining disciples this new commandment: 'A new commandment I give to you. As I have loved you, so you must love one another' (c.f. John 13:34). In Part 2 he also tells the story of 'Jean'. The Bishop sees the new commandment as the calling of the church and so he moves on to Part 3 which focuses on the church today, asking the question whether it is possible for the church to live within the new commandment.

Once the structure of the Bishop's prose is transcribed into lines, stanzas, strophes and parts, using Gees method of analysis, the focus of the material and the key images or themes, can be 'read' (see Appendix 7). The main line themes are clear and evenly distributed throughout the sermon. Part 1, containing two strophes, sets the context for the discourse topic: that the church, as seen in the media, is in crisis. The Bishop suggests that this might be a good thing as he moves into Part 2 in which he introduces the discourse topic 'A New Commandment'. He finishes in Part 3 with his challenge to the clergy as to what the church might become if it can give this 'new commandment' any kind of expression throughout its ministry.

A close reading of the Bishop's text identifies that the central focus of the main line material is the challenge to the listeners to reflect on their ministry and to decide whether they are following this new commandment. This is particularly apposite as in the next part of the service the ordained listeners are going to be asked to renew their

baptismal as well as ordination vows, both of which anchor them into the church as disciples of Christ. Throughout his sermon the Bishop makes the move from an understanding of 'love your neighbour as you love yourself' to 'love as Christ has loved' and he does that through the lyrical use of the word 'mandate'. His use of the word 'commandment' illuminates Fairclough's notion of language as a form of action. Speaking a word constitutes the performance of the word. In the case of 'commandment' the action is reported from the scripture as well as used directly by the Bishop who continues in strophe 4 with the following narrative to confirm this point:

31. Love one another as I have loved you / heard and taken to heart

## 32. These are converting words

- 33. I remember clearly the impact it made on Jean
- 34. It was Maundy Thursday evening

The sermon focused on the implications of the application of the new covenant In Bourdieu's view (1991, p.37-42) habitus identifies within each individual how they carry their history and how they bring that history into the present causing them to make certain choices and not others. The Bishop glides easily into a story about Jean, which must have had an effect on him because he chose to recount it at this point in the sermon to illustrate the point he was making. Perhaps his strategy is also to move the listeners through empathy to a place of recognition (Fairclough, 2001, pp. 8,9,14) and also to close the gap between him and his listeners by putting them all in the position of observers of the story (Rose). The story of Jean may perhaps also be a metaphor for the church: individual or institutional. Through 'Jean' he uses phrases like 'bitter resentment' and 'seeking reconciliation' that could be decoded to reveal the church's position today.

This positioning of the narrative in the sermon may be an attempt by the Bishop to link into the 'members' resources' of the listeners, enabling them to understand his views. At the same time as using narrative as a means to enable listeners to understand his point, the Bishop fuses together biblical language with the overall actual language of the sermon. For example, lines 22 and 24 are both Scriptural verses and they are interspersed with the Bishop's own words in line 23, 24 and 26. The Archbishop of Canterbury also uses this method of delivery with the phrases from the Scriptural reading made before his sermon with his own words by interweaving them one line with another.

# 4.3.4.2 Literary Language

The Bishop uses carefully chosen language, including poetic; repetition; and story to evoke the involvement of listeners. He focuses them on the reality of the world's view of the church today and uses for emphasis, the story of the response of Jean, a member of the congregation, to his discourse topic. As with the Archbishop of Canterbury, the Bishop assumes listeners to be highly literate, but, in addition, expects them to be theologically sophisticated.

In Part 1 of his sermon the Bishop sets the scene in terms of the crises that are facing both the church and the world. These early stanzas that are illustrating the problems that are facing the church today are likely to reflect the Bishop's views on the state of the world and the church. Each stanza represents a particular perspective. The Bishop uses the temporal phrase 'in this week of all weeks' to focus the listeners on a period of crisis

within the life of Jesus, in order to ensure that the perspective remains Christ centred. His language in stanza 1 is also authoritarian suggesting what is appropriate for reflection in Holy Week and this style carries on in stanza 2 with a supposition about what is meant by financial crisis being associated with spiritual crisis.

At the beginning of Part 2, strophe 3 he once again uses the overall discourse topic (A new commandment) to signal a border in the text and encourages rhythm in the text by repeating 'mandatum' along with 'new' and 'renewed'. Strophe 4 signals another change in perspective as the Bishop moves from a biblical stance to a practical outworking of that mandate. He tells a story to show how this can work in real present day lives if it is taken to heart 'costly, costly as that undoubtedly was'. Strophe 5 again switches perspective to look at how this 'new commandment encapsulates the calling of the church'. The Bishop uses the reference to 'mutual love', a repetition of the new commandment in a different form, to signal the switch in perspective. With this switch he brings in the concept of the Trinity and then leads the listener to the various views of scholars about this new commandment. In stanza 11 the Bishop uses lexical repetition to emphasise his point that mutual love reveals God in relationship.

Part 3 focuses on the church as it is today and strophe 9 returns the listeners back to the beginning of the sermon and the idea of 'Death of Christendom' by suggesting 'maybe we emerge from Christendom'. This strophe is not only a powerful image of the church rising from the death bed of Christendom but it also creates an important echo back to the beginning of the sermon when all was dark and depressing. It suggests that this might mean the church is now free to hear the message of mutual love in a way it never

has. In the same way strophe 10 echoes back to the beginning of the sermon to face the fact that crises do touch the church but a new culture can form out of the ashes that is relational and loving. Strophes 9 and 11 replicate the pattern in Part 2 of bringing forward a scholar to make the point and that point is emphasised with a lexical repetition in stanza 22.

Returning again to the discourse topic (New Commandment) and echoing back to the actions of Jesus in strophe 7, strophe 13 combines the ideas of society and relationships to ask what might be the equivalent in the church today. The Bishop uses a triplet in stanza 26 to bring the point out fully. In strophe 14 he is emphatic in making the final point by a lexical repetition of 'what' signalling a move to a questioning perspective near the close of the sermon at the beginning of stanza 28. His final words, while still in question mode, provide the challenge to his listeners by the repetition of the words 'can' and 'church'

## 4.3.4.3 Poetic Language and Repetition

In order to understand how the Bishop develops his sermon the details of poetic language and repetition now need to be examined chronologically. Unlike the other three sermons, the Bishop begins with lines that seem to be different from the rest of his sermon. The Bishop's 'preplay' is only one stanza, which appears to fall outside of the sermon proper (Goffman. 1990, p.24):

 You will be glad to know / that I have resisted the temptation / particularly to this day

- 2. so it isn't going to be a sermon on being fools for Christ.
- 3. At least I hope you will be glad to know that

This stanza tells the listeners what the Bishop is not going to do. His behaviour signifies certain social characteristics, projecting them in order to create a moral demand on the listeners, that they acknowledge a position of authority. He does that by telling us '*You will be glad to know*' (Muriel Saville Troike). The Bishop also uses phonological repetition, for example: '(h)elps us to (h)ear; (h)eard and taken to (h)eart; to contribute to the musical effect of the discourse recognizing that oratory is a kind of poetry (Tannen, 2007, p.88):

## Stanza 5 (Mandatum Novum)

- 21. And so to the theme of this day; a new commandment; a new mandate; mandatum novum
- 22. As we have been reminded, the traditional English name of this day
- 23. Comes of course from that **mand**atum
- 24. Love one another as I have loved you
- 25. Is the **new mand**ate; the ever renewed **mand**ate
- Stanza 6 (To love as Christ)
  - 26. Since there already was the commandment to love your neighbour as you love yourself
  - 27. It has been suggested that the novelty of this **mand**ate
  - 28. Was in the injunction to love one another as I have loved you
  - 29. To love as Christ has loved
  - 30. That's quite a development of, even a departure from, love your neighbour as you love yourself

In line 45 the Bishop uses the word 'demonstrate' rather than 'practice' for what the church exists to do. 'Demonstrate' and 'demonstration' (line 46) are the active words he uses when he puts before the listeners that mutual love as revelation of the Trinity. By using the word 'reflection' he links back to line 19 where he suggests crisis is possibly a good thing, if it encourages the church to reappraises itself and find that mutual love is the key. Here and elsewhere the Bishop uses repetition or partial repetition as a cohesive device<sup>47</sup> to make the discourse coherent, as well as using it as a rhetorical tool for emphasis:

# 48. The love of the disciples for one another is not merely edifying

#### 49 It reveals the Father and the Son

- 50. Love for one another is not merely edifying
- 51 It reveals the Father and the Son

Further into his sermon the Bishop uses lexical repetition to emphasise the point that mutual love of the disciples is revelation. He continues to use this technique to enhance his point made in stanza 12 and 13 by repeating words 'signs'; 'Christ'; and 'demonstrate'. Using the word 'reconciliation' he then refers back to Jean's story where she cries and realizes her need to be reconciled to another person with whom she has had a long standing bitter resentment (lines 39 and 60). Jean's actions might be considered by the world to be a loss of status. However, by using the same words to show that Jesus gave up any status that he should have in order to serve the disciples, the Bishop makes the point that Jesus had given up even more of his status than Jean (see Appendix 6, lines 76,77). The sermon continues with recognition that power can

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>47</sup> This device is common throughout all the sermons

cause crisis. This takes the listeners back to the beginning, the point of the new mandate, which is to renew human relations:

- 76. Love requires that we serve,
- 77. We **abandon status** and whatever else separates us from others
- **78.** One of those things of course is **power.**

In several places (see the different groups of lines below) the Bishop uses lexical repetition to take the listeners back to where he began, repeating the comments of 'crisis', 'who and how' and a 'new commandment':

- 79. Timothy Radcliffe reflects on this in the aftermath of **the crisis** caused by revelations of child abuse
- 80. His article in the Tablet is entitled 'Towards a Humble Church'
- 81. He says 'this terrible **crisis** of sexual abuse / is deeply linked / to the way that **power** can corrupt human relationships

With an increasing tone of frustration and playing on the repetition in the words 'recalling' and 'calling' he notes that this crisis is about recalling the Church back to Christ and that is the crisis which Timothy is addressing:

- 100. Like all the others is recalling the church to the calling of Christ
- 101. To **who and to how** Christ is
- 102. Which is the mandate for **who and how** we are to be.
- 103. Love one another as I have loved you. Cu:::k 48

121

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>48</sup> This is a sound that the Bishop made at the end of this sentence, which appeared to be a sound of frustration (See Jefferson conventions for talk, Atkinson and Heritage 1984)

He also repeats his body conduct in places. When he is speaking passionately about the commandment being new (see Appendix 6, line 47) he repeats the body movement (of lifting his shoulders, holding his hands together on the lectern and smiles at listeners) that he displayed before he began the sermon. Perhaps, as he reiterates the comment he leads listeners to the suggestion that the disciples' love for each other is revelation:

47. CK Barrett comments '**the commandment is new** in that it corresponds to the command that regulates the relation between Jesus and the Father'

The repetition of body movement is creating a moral demand on the listeners to hear him with all his authority (Goffman 1990, p.24). Movement can be a cohesive device linking the listeners back to the beginning through the repetition of the gesture.

# 4.3.4.4 Towards a Speech Community

Of all the sermons analysed the Bishop's is the most 'listener specific' in that he, more than the other three preachers, uses language that is overtly theological. For example, in line 2 he uses the phrase 'being fools for Christ', which is a direct reference to St Paul (1 Cor. 4:10). At the same time he uses literary references to books that are more likely to be read by clergy (see Appendix 6, lines 5, 47, and 62). Thus the first four lines of the sermon may function to unify the preacher and listeners into a single speech community. These lines assume knowledge of the Christian scriptures and, therefore, exclude outsiders from intragroup communication. This language immediately sets anyone without scriptural knowledge at a disadvantage, providing linguistic indicators used to reinforce social stratification, or to maintain differential power relationships between groups (Muriel Saville-Troike, 2003, p. 13) Perhaps this was an unconscious

action on the part of the Bishop but it serves to identify those who know and those who do not know. By doing this he is framing his speech with scriptural boundaries, establishing a characteristic footing with the listeners (Goffman, 1981, p.172)<sup>49</sup>.

Within this discourse there is an asymmetry of knowledge not only because the Bishop holds the text of his sermon, which is therefore 'hidden' from the listeners, but also because he has set a scriptural/theological frame:

26. The end of Christendom / characterised in the 'Death of Christian Britain' by

Callum Brown / and with it the loss of a guaranteed place in society

At the same time as making indirect reference to scripture the Bishop makes direct reference to books that he has read. He deals with scriptural references in very explicit ways and maintains this differential state of knowledge and the possibility of an authoritative position near the beginning of his sermon by these references. In the same stanza he uses this phrase:

27. **It seems particularly appropriate** / in this week of all weeks / to recognize the crises facing the church.

This may be a linguistic indicator of social stratification because it illustrates that the Bishop, is using his position of authority in the 'field' to tell listeners what is appropriate.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>49</sup> This links back to Bourdieu' linguistic capital, see note 4 in section 2.2

#### 4.3.4.5 Rhetoric

The Bishop preaches this sermon during Holy Week, the week in the Christian tradition when Jesus was crucified. He asserts that because of it being Holy Week, it is appropriate to recognize the crises facing today's church; paralleling what appeared to the disciples to be the crisis of Jesus' crucifixion with them. The Bishop does this through a series of triplets:

- 18. Crisis may strangely be a good thing; we do after all call tomorrow Good Friday
- 19. Crisis invites reflection on and reappraisal of who and how we are church
- 20. Perhaps **crisis** helps us to hear again who and how we are called to be.
- 21. And so to the theme of this day; a new commandment; **a new mandate**; mandatum novum
- 22. As we have been reminded, the traditional English name of this day
- 23. Comes of course from that mandatum
- 24. Love one another as I have loved you

## 25. Is the new mandate; the ever renewed mandate

The Bishop uses the repetition of crisis as a classic rhetorical, rather than a poetic, device, in order to move listeners from the negativity of crisis as portrayed in the world and which suggests the 'end of Christendom' (see Appendix 6 line 5), to the positivity of crisis as portrayed through Christ's love (see Appendix 6, strophes 3 and 4).

## 4.3.4.5 Metaphor and Metonymy

The Bishop utilizes a number of metaphors within his sermon particularly personification metaphors. He uses personification metaphors, for example: 'crisis' is a

person, facing the church (see Appendix 6, line 4), with hands and eyes (Appendix 6, line 9), can surround and harass (Appendix 6, line 16); Christian Britain is a person who will die (line 5); society is a person that can be violent (Appendix 6, line 90); the new commandment is a person that might look like something (Appendix 6, line 106). He also uses an activity metaphor 'run' (line 14) at the same time as spirits sinking like ships (Appendix 6, line14) and when he begins to talk about mutual love this is what he has to say:

- 44. Mutual love is fundamentally what the **church** is about.
- 50. What the **church** exists to practice; to **demonstrate**
- 51. That's because mutual love is the **reflection**, the **demonstration**, the incarnation of the **love** of the Trinity.

The Bishop also uses metonymy (see Chapter 5), by frequently using both the word 'church' to mean the people who go to church as well as the phrase 'the end of Christendom' to mean the demise of the institution of the church.

#### **4.3.4.6 Summary**

While all of the case studies examined here move from a Part 1 introduction to the main topic in Part 2, the Bishop is the only one that begins with a 'pre-pre-play' setting the tone of the sermon. He uses repetition for emphasis and challenging rhetorical questions to make what he appears to believe are expected answers (see Appendix 6, lines 54-56). His language is poetic to the extent that he faces listeners with what is the reality of the crises facing the church, and evocative since he uses an emotive piece of scripture to make his point. It could easily be suggested, therefore, that the Bishop's sermon falls

within the remit of Rose's conversational view of preaching in the sense that it is a conversation with other clergy. However, on closer consideration his language is dependent on listeners being theologically astute.

Notwithstanding the comment above, overall, the Bishop's sermon sits more easily into Rose's traditional view of preaching because he uses persuasive language mixed with his passion for the topic (see Appendix 4, line 104, a term of frustration; 1997, pp.14, 15). His passion becomes more evident as he uses emotive language for the servant hood of Jesus like 'self-humiliating' and 'social inferiors' (Appendix 6, line 67). This aids his ability to persuade because understanding the listeners and sympathizing with them (c.f. pre-pre-play) increases his persuasive power. Finally in strophe 14, stanza 27 the Bishop ends with several questions. He repeats the word 'what' for emphasis to move the listeners to the final stanza, which echoes the descriptive words, used for Jesus in order to end on a challenging question, which transmits the sermon's message. How do these linguistic strategies compare with those of the other three preachers? Chapter five looks at the range of strategies used by all four preachers.

## 5. Summary of the Four Case Studies

It has been demonstrated above that there are common strategies, which appear in each of the four case studies. For example, all of the preachers, in one way or other, have a poetic structure to their texts and use repetition, rhythm, metaphor and rhetoric as part of their strategy to involve listeners and create the possibility of their participation in the event. However there are individual strategies used by each preacher, which create the

differences that are evident. A key insight of this thesis is the role of parallelism, juxtaposition and metaphor in bringing together the human and divine in the sermon.

The Archbishop of Canterbury's sermon is a mix of poetic and authoritative language. It is syntactically complex relying on intonation to connect ideas that cross more than one sentence. Yet, with poetic language he opens the possibility of a connection to listeners. Using his rhetorical strengths to create a theological framework, he re-frames the political with the religious. By achieving this re-framing, he displays his institutional authority at the same time as creating an atmosphere of empathy for the protagonists in his sermon. The Dean's sermon, however, is more narrative and conversational. Setting a self-deprecating tone, he tells a true story to illustrate his view of the coming of the Holy Spirit at Pentecost, and uses that story to present his worldview and to challenge listeners to change theirs. Through simple story telling in the vernacular, the Dean interweaves present reality with past actions, to encourage listeners to participate in the story and experience the emotion of the scenes. By using metaphor and metonymy he creates an environment that listeners can empathise with and share in, so that they might learn to recognize similar situations in the future.

The Bishop's sermon is more theologically academic suggesting that his major focus is on the clergy. However, he does not exclude other listeners because he interprets the specific point the scholars were making for all to hear. However, he creates the possibility of an asymmetry between those who know and those who do not know. His sermon is overtly challenging, using rhetorical questions that appear to have specific

answers. He speaks with passion using emotive language to challenge and make his points, demonstrating his rhetorical skill.

While all of the sermons are performative the Archbishop of York's sermon has a greater emphasis on performance, drawing on the immediate as well as on his own habitus including his African background. His strategy is much more direct than the other three preachers. He is the only one to interact with listeners through a child, creating a performance within a performance. In addition, he uses rhythmic synchrony and parallelism to create a poetic style that connects with listeners through humour as well as a didactic approach. Because of his interaction with the child, his rhythmic style and his obvious delight in what the church members have achieved, he creates an emotional connection with listeners enabling them easily to participate.

# Chapter 5

# **Thematic Analysis**

The focus of this chapter is to discuss the involvement strategies used by all of the preachers and to discover the extent to which a coherent structure for the performance of a sermon can be identified. The results of the analysis of the four sermons in the previous chapter show that each sermon displays similarities and differences from the others in the structure of the discourse and the techniques. This chapter, using the analysis of each sermon, draws out what is common among the sermons so that the beginnings of a framework integrating these useful analytical tools can be established. The differences mentioned above have been brought together in the summary of Chapter 4 and are also discussed under some of the themes in this chapter. The aim is to gain information to facilitate an interpretation of the range of strategies, and the process, understanding and motivation used by the four preachers.

Gumperz and Cook-Gumperz claim that speaking is ultimately an interactive phenomenon, grounded in cultural conversations that require active cooperation of speakers and listeners in the production of shared interpretations. (Gumperz and Cook-Gumperz in Auer (ed), 2007, p.498). This does not always happen in many forms of institutional discourse, including those within the church, where there is a direct

relationship between status and role and discursive rights and obligations. Institutional exchanges, consonant with preaching a sermon, may be measured by role-structured asymmetries between participants in terms of the disparity between the distribution of knowledge and the right to participate in the interaction. These important asymmetries are between preachers and listeners and between their (preachers and listeners) capacities to direct the interaction (Drew and Heritage, 1998, p.49).

This chapter, therefore, will also discuss how each of the preachers manages the tension between these asymmetries in their sermon. There will be a particular focus on the overarching structuring principles as demonstrated through theological reflection and the stylistic principles. This latter will include the poetic, rhetorical, narrative structuring, and biblical influence.

# **5.1 The Overarching Principles of Structure**

Transposing all the sermons into lines, stanzas, strophes and parts exposed more clearly the structure and meaning of each discourse. This approach (according to Gee, 1991) cuts across the genre distinction within and among narrative forms. This can be seen particularly in the sermons of the Archbishop of Canterbury and the Bishop of Knaresborough. Neither the Archbishop nor the Bishop uses an obvious narrative form. However, once their sermons are re-analysed using Gees approach, their sermon strategy becomes more obvious.

Gee suggests that there are two different types of discursive language (1991, p.35): the images or themed type and the 'real' world type. The first type is used by the Archbishop of Canterbury, and is based on the organization of discourse to manipulate images or themes rooted in the worldview of the person using the language. From this listeners can reconstruct a certain part of the Archbishop's philosophy of life from his particular point of view. For example, in Part 1 of his sermon the metaphor of 'cost' in line 1 is linked to 'mattered' in line 8 (see Appendix 1), which illustrates his view that the cost of seeking justice matters.

Gee's other type of discursive language, found in the Bishop's sermon, does not invite thematic interpretation. Language is used as 'labels' for a particular model of a world often called the 'real' world. In strophe 1, for example, the Bishop uses the language of 'crisis' to describe what is happening in the church followed immediately by the idea: 'the end of Christendom' (see Appendix 6, lines 4 and 5). Gee maintains that when this type of language is successful, listeners can reconstruct the speakers' model of the world. While both the Archbishop of Canterbury and the Bishop, within their sermons, use the first of Gee's types (i.e. critical appraisals), they use it in different ways. The Bishop's sermon suggests a critical view of the church and the world, clearly challenging the listening clergy to make changes, whilst the Archbishop comments on the attitude of servicemen and women to their job.

The Dean and the Archbishop of York, however, do not fit easily into either of Gee's two types. The analysis shows that they have elements of each of these types of discursive language within the text in order to create the images that they want to

transmit. They are direct with their discursive language use, engaging with listeners through story and performance (as has been discussed in detail in Chapter 4) giving listeners clear indications of their model of the world. Despite these differences in use of discursive language, all the preachers base their sermons on the same fundamental concept, theological reflection. They all use this art of theological reflection as part of the core of their sermon structure.

# 5.1.1 Theological reflection

Theological reflection can be reproduced using any piece of scripture in any context where the following questions are asked: <sup>51</sup>

#### 1. What is the theme?

The theme for each of the sermons is analysed in Chapter 4 as the discourse topic with main line material: the Archbishop of Canterbury's theme is the 'cost of seeking justice'; the Archbishop of York's theme is 'restoration'; the Dean has a theme of 'the wonder of God'; whilst the Bishop's theme is 'a new commandment'. Throughout the sermons each preacher refers back to the theme in various different ways using it to create the framework for all that the sermon has to offer. The theme sets the 'register' of the sermon (see note 5 p. 32).

-

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>50</sup> 'Theological reflection is an activity that enables people of faith to give an account of the values and traditions that underpin their choices and convictions and deepens their understanding. Theological reflection enables the connections between human dilemmas and divine horizons to be explored, drawing on a wide range of academic disciplines and the arts. It asks the question about how to connect theological discourse about the nature of God to the exercise of faith. It is predominantly a critical, interrogative enquiry into the process of relating the resources of faith to the issues of life' (Graham, Walton and Ward, 2005, p.5, 6)

<sup>51</sup> The questions in the following side headings refer to the themes within each of the case study sermons

This notion of 'register' is illustrated by the way in which each of the topics the Archbishop of Canterbury discusses in his sermon is based upon the theme of 'cost'. This enables him to use syntactic parallelism such as 'generosity' in line 2; 'rash person' in line 12; 'share' in line 23 (see Appendix 1). Similarly the Dean's theme of 'the wonder of God' is mirrored by his use of 'wonderful day' in line 12; 'wonderful train carriages' in line 61; and 'suddenly I was aware' in line 7 (see Appendix 2). Each of the Dean's phrases is rooted with the idea of awe and amazement.

The Archbishop of York's theme of restoration is introduced in line 2 (see Appendix 4) and then, using lexical repetition, it is embedded in the next four stanzas so that by the time he comes to the seasonal<sup>52</sup> topic of Epiphany the idea of restoration is established in the text. In an entirely different way the Bishop, in Part 1 of his sermon, sets a register of '*crisis*' suggesting that it could be a good thing, before introducing his theme of 'a new commandment' in Part 2. The register of '*crisis*' persists through the sermon even though his theme is different.

# 2. Parallel with scripture: which scripture has a similar theme as that of the preachers' discourse topic?

All of the preachers refer to passages of Scripture that were read either before they started to preach or, in the case of the Dean, that he read for himself during the sermon. The texts bear the theme of their sermon, for example, the Archbishop of Canterbury uses two passages: one that refers to times and seasons focusing on the contrasts of 'killing' and 'healing', 'breaking down', and 'building up' which he initially connects

\_

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>52</sup> The liturgical cycle of the church year divides up the year into seasons. Each season has a theological emphases and mode of prayer. The liturgical year determines when feast days are to be observed, which portions of Scripture are read and the colour of the clerical vestments.

to his sermon by using lexical repetition; and a second text that he uses directly in Part 3 reworking it to demonstrate its relevance to the present day and interweaving it with the first text to reintroduce the discourse topic.

The Dean, on the other hand uses only two lines of Scriptural text, which he interprets himself. At first it is not clear how the story that he tells connects with the text but he introduces the connection with a question that he answers as the conclusion to the sermon, referring listeners back to the text. The Bishop and the Archbishop of York are more direct in the introduction of the text on which their sermons are based. The Bishop uses it candidly to challenge the listeners, whilst the Archbishop of York uses the text to initiate his performance alongside a child.

# 3. Parallel with tradition: what does the Judeo-Christian tradition say about the theme of each sermon?

The assumption here is that the tradition of the church will have something to say about any situation that humanity finds itself in. The Archbishop of Canterbury demonstrates that assumption by recognizing that biblical texts give essential advice on the recognition of invisible enemies to those caught up in military operations (see Appendix 1, stanzas 14-16) whilst the Archbishop of York suggests that ordinary people can know the love of God (see Appendix 4, stanza 28). Equally the Dean and the Bishop illustrate that the tradition has been expressing views on how the Christian life should be lived throughout the centuries. The Dean acknowledges that the expectation of discipleship is that gifts should be used to 'build up the body which is his church' (see Appendix 2, stanza 10) and the Bishop recognizes that 'the new commandment encapsulates the calling of the church' (see Appendix 6, stanza 9).

# 4. Parallel with personal experience: when have I/we/you expressed the self in a way that is significant and a moment of growth and maturity?

Though the stories that the preachers use often involve themselves, none of the preachers draw on their own personal experience for this question. They all use experiences demonstrated through narrative or the direct experience of another. The Archbishops of Canterbury and York, respectively, use immediate experiences of either the lives of service men and women in Iraq or of the child who comes to help him, whilst both the Dean and the Bishop use different levels of real life narrative. By connecting with the personal experiences of the people concerned the preachers open up the possibility for listeners to make a connection with the experience.

# 5. Act on a new insight: is there something different that can be done in the light of this learning?

In the coda of all of the sermons the preachers conclude by making the connection between all of the above questions for theological reflection and the lives of listeners. The Bishop concludes with a question; the Archbishop of Canterbury ends by recognizing what those whom he is commemorating have taught society; the Dean concludes with a challenge; and the Archbishop ends with a command. Each preacher uses a different style and they all conclude with making a specific point that brings all that they have said into an opportunity for listeners to reflect on the learning and transform their behaviour.

# **5.1.2 Stylistic Structure**

Preachers need to be clear about their purpose for preaching. One of the aims of preaching a sermon is to enable listeners to experience the mystery of the numinous by

engaging them below the level of the rational, drawing on the language and rhythms of scripture and the poetry of its words. Tannen maintains that if listeners do some of the work of making meaning they become profoundly and mythically involved and understand what is being said because they have worked to make its meaning (2007, pp. 29, 32).

The contexts of each of the sermons largely dictate the content and style. Since the venues of the four sermons and the reasons for each service are very different, the content and style of each of the sermons is also very different. However, there is a great deal of influence of biblical, poetic language from the King James Bible in each sermon text. Further, styles such as narrative, poetic, rhetorical, and parallel structures are used to reflect some of the most common scriptural genres. At the same time, rhythms and texts of the Bible frequently appear in the way that preachers speak. Poetry, narrative and rhythm are discussed in the sections below but all of them suggest the biblical.

All preachers face having to resolve the tension between equality and authority. The four preachers in this study all use different styles and yet they all use similar involvement strategies to relate to those listening to them. Underpinning all the sermons is the aim to influence the engagement, involvement and participation of listeners realized by the strategies that each preacher uses at a meta-level. Talk is interactive and participative at a variety of different levels and whilst the interactive purpose is at a sub-conscious level, it is a face-to-face task. In any kind of discourse there has to be a structure, which ensures that the process is carried out effortlessly. Boundaries are created so that there is a clear understanding for all participants when

the discourse has both started and finished. Engagement is a fundamental, yet underlying purpose. How it is sustained is determined by the strategies that each preacher uses.

Nearly half of the Archbishop of York's sermon is taken up by the interaction with a child called Katie and is particularly striking as an example of the phenomenon of engagement. He does this from the pulpit and invites Katie to come into the pulpit with him for the first segment of the interaction. There is no other connection between Katie and the Archbishop except for their meeting at this moment and yet through this interaction a connection is made. This notion of participation acknowledges the ability of the Archbishop and Katie to find a place of mutuality of thought process.

Equally direct in his approach the Dean interacts with all the listeners by constantly referring to them in his story telling and, the same way, he interacts with passers-by (see Appendix 2, stanzas 11-12). Further, he interacts indirectly with listeners when he says 'some of you may remember reading the news about that' as if having a conversation (see Appendix 2, line 53). The opening stanzas involve listeners on all levels so that when he reaches Part 2 of his sermon he completes the invitation to participate by engaging them below the meta-level. He uses the vernacular including shorthand phrases such as 'the 9.30am' (Appendix 2, also see Chapter 4). His strategy is to take listeners into the world of his true story and through that to demonstrate that they too can play a part in helping others to develop a relationship with God. The Dean begins

this strategy by using a specific translation<sup>53</sup> of the Bible that will resonate with the normal language of the listeners. This translation flows through his story as he connects with listeners using particular phrases that include the listeners and convey his feelings and emotions.

The Archbishop of Canterbury demonstrates the most indirect, subtle form of interaction. He reaches out to listeners by including them with himself and using lexical repetition to maintain that connection in Part 1 and using 'we' and 'our' in Part 2.

Through this poetic, evocative and personal language he demonstrates his understanding of the situation facing those involved in war and proceeds to initiate a shared interpretation (Appendix 1). The Bishop of Knaresborough, however, uses a more indirect strategy. Given that the bulk of his listeners are clergy, he uses the works of scholars to support his point and put forward a complex intellectual argument throughout his sermon. This is intertwined with persuasive language and a passion for his theme. His opening words invite listeners to participate and he infers that they have knowledge of scripture. This interaction is grounded in the theological culture of clergy therefore creating an asymmetry with those listeners who are not clergy (Gumperz, in Auer, 2007, p.498). The Bishop uses repetition as a rhetorical strategy and combines it with narrative and, in some cases, emotive language to emphasise his point ending with a rhetorical question that challenges listeners (Appendix 6).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>53</sup> 'The Message', E.H.Peterson (2004).

The remaining part of this chapter briefly discusses and illustrates the involvement strategies that each preacher uses to build the relationship between himself and his listeners.

# 5.2 Repetition

Tannen maintains that there are different forms of repetition. These vary from self-repetition and allo-repetition (repetition of others) at one end of the spectrum, to exact repetition and paraphrase at the other end. Between these two extremes are several variations of repetitions such as: questions transformed into statements and vice versa; repetition with a single word or phrase changed; and repetition with a change of person or tense, including patterned repetition in which different words are uttered in the same syntactic and rhythmic paradigm. All types of repetition have a temporal scale ranging from immediate repetition to delayed repetition. For example, with the spoken word it can be within a conversation or within days of the conversation (2007, pp.50-64).

As previously noted in Chapter 4, Tannen suggests that 'the most marked feature of poetry is surely repetition' (2007, p.34). She also argues that analysis of repetition illuminates our notion of language production and she further suggests that repetition is pre-patterned and a resource for creativity. She cites Proverbs, a book of the Bible, as an example of the use of pre-patterned expressions that very often fused to create a new form<sup>54</sup>. She believes repetition is at the heart of language and is an essentially poetic aspect of it (2007, p. 50). Repetition, therefore, contributes to the point of the sermon/

-

Tannen cites the example: 'up against the wire' as a phrase used to suggest struggling to get a project finished, which is a fusion of 'up against the wall' and 'down to the wire' (2007, p.52)

discourse in that it shapes the way listeners hear it as well as producing cohesion and pinning an argument together. All of these functions are present in all repetitions. Further, part of the effect of participating through repetition, both in sense making and of being swept up in sound and rhythm of language, is emotional. Emotion is a significant source of language's power because of its ability to fire the individual imagination (Tannen, 2007, p. 46). As a strategy repetition can work to communicate meaning and also to persuade, therefore, it can be both part of the poetry of the discourse and part of the rhetoric

# 5.2.1 Repetition as poetry

Repetition is used across all four sermons, both actual repetitions and repeated concepts and vocabulary but in different grammatical forms. By using repetition the preachers create a poetic foundation to their sermon, interweaving the present reality with a biblical reality. In this way they communicate ideas that might connect with listeners. The words that the preachers use to create culturally familiar scenarios are not spoken in isolation; they 'network' and 'intertwine' and this repetition contributes to the production and comprehension of their sermons, (Tannen, 2007, pp.54, 101). All the preachers use repetition for emphasis and as a cohesive device that maintains interest and indicates passion. Repetition is, therefore, one of their main involvement strategies.

The Archbishop of York uses repetition in all the forms mentioned above more frequently than the other three preachers. As the use of repetition in his performance is particularly striking, his sermon is used to exemplify repetition more than the other

three. The repetitions he uses are image-rich and sound-rich as he reaches the first of his rhythmic and rhetorical crescendos (see Appendix 4, stanza 21, stanzas 24 and 25); the second crescendo is found towards the middle of his sermon (see Appendix 4, stanzas 35 and 36) and the final one is at the end of the sermon using the structure that Tannen notes is typical of the '*African-American sermon*' (Tannen, 2007, pp. 88, 89, 161-168).

All of the four preachers do, however, use a repetition strategy in similar ways. In the beginning of his sermon the Archbishop of York uses the word 'restore' in one form or another six times (see Appendix 4, lines 2,9,10,15,17,22). This repetition of 'restore' opens the possibility for listeners to reimagine the restoration of the church building so that when the Archbishop introduces the notion of restoration of relationships they already have an idea of what that entails The Bishop uses repetition to reassure listeners of his motive as well as an emphatic device, whilst the Archbishop of Canterbury uses repetition to establish empathy (see Appendix 1: repetition of 'cost' in lines 1,2,3,). The Archbishop also repeats the language of the scriptures but not in an emphatic mode, more as a way of connecting listeners to the principle. He turns verbs into nouns and he re-contextualises them into more modern academic talk so that he connects them to the now. He lifts words out of biblical context without losing the biblical perspective, exactly repeating these words so that he can re-contextualise them to connect the listeners lexically (see Appendix 1, lines 32-35).

This is because the details and images that the Archbishop conjures up might inspire listeners to create meaning through the sounds and scenes in their minds (Tannen, 2007, p.42). The Archbishop's intonation is an indicator of the progress from one idea to

another. The space between one idea and the next creates an opportunity where listeners might recall their own experiences. Any notion of engagement or involvement is realized indirectly in a poetic/performance way on the assumption that listeners can respond to the poetry of the Bible in both the rhythm and, in terms of familiarity. All of the preachers, but most particularly the Archbishops of York and Canterbury, use synchronic repetition, a linguistic strategy of recurrence and re-contextualisation of words and phrases.

The Archbishop of York's use of restore/restoration and the Archbishop of Canterbury's use of the scripture links the work of the church to the work of Christ. This enables listeners to participate in theological reflection and thereby makes connections between their daily life experience and the mystery of God. This synchronic repetition used by the Archbishops creates interpersonal involvement in listeners by tying parts of the discourse together and linking them into conversation and relationship. This gives the impression of a shared universe of discourse (Tannen, 2007, pp.50-64) making them, in Rose's terms, equal partners on a journey to understanding.

As already discussed in Chapter 4, all of the preachers use immediate lexical repetition (see lines 17,18,19 Appendix 1; lines 13,15 Appendix 6; lines 94-96 Appendix 4; lines 74-76 Appendix 2). The Archbishop of Canterbury uses delayed repetition by framing his sermon with: 'In the name of the Father and the Son and the Holy Spirit. Amen' both at the beginning and the end of his sermon and the Archbishop of York uses grammatical parallelism to the same effect. The words that they use are not repeated because they mean the same thing. All of the preachers repeat words as a strategy to

create rhythm without changing the flow or meaning. This links repetition to Rose's conversational view of preaching because it enables listeners' participation, and it adds to the poetic nature of text as the preachers expand the theme (Tannen, 2007, p. 80,88).

In particular the Archbishop of York demonstrates rhythmic synchrony with his emphasis on repeating the same word to create rhythm:

106. Jesus comes to us as a king

107. Comes to us / as a one who prays for us

108. And stands between us and God

109. Comes as one / who has come to die for us.

## **5.2.2 Repetition as Rhetoric**

It has been suggested that conversational rhythm is composed of a pattern of beats and syllables or of silence per beat. Scollon (1982, noted in Tannen 2007)) calls this pattern 'ensemble' which is 'what holds participants together in a mutual attention to the ongoing situation'. All the preachers may be using this strategy to hold listeners into their rhetoric. The Archbishop of York demonstrates this in Part 3 of his sermon when he is moving on from his involvement with the child to what is perhaps more serious theology about the coming of Christ and his purpose. He needs to refocus listeners to his theme of restoration because they have been taken away from the main focus through his practical performance of showing the gifts from the Wise Men to the child. He does this through the lexical repetition, within a grammatical parallelism. In lines 94-96 he tells us who Christ is by repeating phrases beginning 'to show' and then he

repeats the concept in lines 106-109 by repeating the phrase 'comes to us' (see Appendix 4).

The first three parts of his sermon focus either on his performance with the child's participation or serious theology (discussed above). By the time the he reaches Part 4 it is possible to recognize the Archbishop's black African influence as he begins to build the rhythmic and rhetorical crescendo with a series of repeated phrases. The Archbishop uses self-repetition where words are repeated to emphasise a point, and not only to emphasise a point, but also to make a point through the emphasis. For example, he repeats 'rare and costly' as descriptions of the gifts of the Wise Men (see lines 27-30, Appendix 4) but by repeating the words 'rare' and 'costly' in relation to the gifts brought by the Wise Men, the Archbishop links the listeners back to their 'costly gift' of the restoration of the church building (Tannen, 2007, p.62). He also uses patterned rhythm more than the other three preachers. Different words may be used but with the same syntactic and rhythmic paradigm as a preceding utterance to encourage anyone to step forward.

ABY: 32. Now is there anybody among the children, is there anybody whose birthday is today?

- 33. Among you is anyone born in January?
- 34. Anybody? Born in January.

He repeats a phrase 'is there anybody' twice and then uses a different sentence altogether but it is repeating the same question. The question is asked in different ways to give the children or their parents the chance to take it in. The word 'anybody' has

more emphasis to it, intensifying the idea of the first time 'anyone' was used (Tannen, 2007, p.62). Also using syntactic and lexical repetitions, he repeats the word 'ordinary' in relation to the listeners as opposed to the wonder of God and then he uses the word 'simply' in respect of how Jesus comes without pomp and glory linking him back to the listeners through the word 'like':

ABY: 118. Ordinary lodgings, ordinary places like this one (for prayers)

122. You see he comes like one of us,

123. not in celebrity, or wealth or security or comfort,

124. but he **simply** comes just **like** a king

The simplicity of the phrasing enables involvement of listeners and builds up sense making through rhythm and repetition. Take for example the evocative language: 'he comes like one of us'. These words make it possible for listeners to respond emotionally as well as intellectually.

Embedded in the Archbishop of York's reflections are parallel constructions that refer listeners to the costliness of refurbishment, the journey that they have made to this point and his gift to their community. These all make the suggestion that gifts give a clue to the actual meaning of Christmas. He also uses phonological repetition, the repetition of sounds for example, repeating the initial [o], which contribute to the musical effect of the discourse (Tannen, 2007, p.83). In the example shown above the initial 'o' of ordinary is repeated and then continues with the rhythm through the 'o' of 'or' and 'one'.

Similarly, the Bishop of Knaresborough uses self-repetition as a rhetorical tool both at the beginning of his sermon to show empathy with listeners and in Part 2 of his sermon for emphasis (see Appendix 6). He uses it to emphasise his point that this new commandment of love is revelation at the same time as enabling listeners to make the leap from the 'old mandate' to the 'new mandate':

- 25. Is the new mandate; the ever renewed mandate
- 48. The love of the disciples for one another is **not merely edifying**
- 49. It reveals the Father and the Son
- 50. Love for one another is not merely edifying
- 51. It reveals the Father and the Son.

The Archbishop of Canterbury, on the other hand, appears to be using the repetition of the words of scripture to progress listeners through his sermon. Although this rhetorical strategy is used to compare the integrity and sacrifice of service men and women with Christ so that the Archbishop can connect with listeners and move them into an acknowledgement that scripture has something to say to the world today, the Archbishop's sermon lacks the 'muscular engagement' of the other sermons.

# 5.3 Metaphor

As previously discussed in Chapter 4, Lakoff and Johnson argue that metaphor is pervasive in thought and action as well as in conventional language and that the ordinary conceptual system that defines everyday reality is metaphorical in nature.

Metaphors that we live by are cultural and they structure the discourse actions we perform (2003, pp. 3-5). Because we reason in terms of metaphor, the metaphors we use determine a great deal about the way we think and how we live our lives. The types of metaphors used, therefore, are reflected in everyday language; they structure actions and how these actions are understood. Concepts are partially structured, understood and talked about in terms of specific metaphors and, if this is the case, then language is also metaphorically structured.

In the culture of the Christian tradition it is acknowledged that the Bible is full of metaphor. Powerful word pictures are used frequently in both the Old Testament and the New Testament. This is illustrated by an example of the piece of scripture used by the Dean in his sermon:

#### Stanza 10 (What St Paul Says)

- 17. 'Christ, Jesus Christ has generously divided out his gifts to us / you and me
- 18. So that his people would learn to serve / and his body grow strong'

To interpret this verse in plain prose loses the depth of the language. This suggests that if the interpretation probes below the poetic language it will find the 'real' meaning of the words. Another use of metaphoric language is to incorporate intense meaning into just a few words. Because metaphoric language appeals to the senses and emotions, it takes listeners below their different layers of experience and touches their imagination. Poetic, metaphoric language is not understood by 'extracting' meaning from it but by letting it develop meaning within the listener as they respond emotionally and imaginatively (Margaret Parker, 'The Richness of Biblical Metaphor', 1991 issue of Student Leadership Journal).

Lakoff and Johnson suggest there are different types of metaphor (2003, p. 14). For example, the Dean and the Bishop both use 'orientational' metaphors but in different ways. The Dean demonstrates the use of this type of metaphor to describe his journey 'on and upwards'. This metaphor puts him on the road, in a good place physically because of where he is on the village green in Bainbridge, and it implies he is in a good place spiritually because he is part of an 'open air service' (see Appendix 2, stanza 4). The Bishop uses orientational metaphor in a more evocative form. He describes the status of Jesus as 'highest' and 'lowest' in order to express what it might mean in the Christian tradition that Jesus conveys his lordship in 'self-humiliating service' for his social inferiors (see Appendix 6, stanza 15).

Ontological metaphors are a way of viewing events, activities, emotions, and ideas as entities and substances. The various kinds of this type of metaphor that there are reflect the kinds of purposes served (Lakoff and Johnson, 2003, p.26). The Archbishop of Canterbury uses an ontological metaphor to describe the place that people find themselves in when involved in the Iraq war. Here confusion is likened to a net in which people are caught up:

- ABC... 5. A time to reflect / on the unexpected qualities / of people like ourselves
  - 6. who, **caught up** in / the confusion / of a great international upheaval
  - 7. simply got on with / the task they were given
  - 8. because they believed that order and justice mattered

The Bishop, on the other hand uses this type of metaphor in a different way. He talks about an 'ageing congregation' (see Appendix 6, line 7) as if the congregation was a person who was getting older and 'crisis facing the church' (see Appendix 6, line 4) as if both the church and crisis were people. He uses metaphoric language all the way through his sermon and, unlike the Archbishop of York who uses restoration of the building as a metaphor for the restoration of relationships with God, he 'puts ideas (objects) into words (containers) and sends them (along a conduit) to a hearer who takes the idea/objects out of the word/containers' (Lakoff and Johnson, 2003 p.10). In a similar manner to the Archbishop of York, the Dean reads a piece of scripture and then 'tells a story'. He uses the story again in his summing up in order to refer back to the scripture that he started with and to demonstrate the process of how God works in day-to-day living.

The Dean refers to the church, using the 'church is a person' metaphor, as if it is a person testifying to the presence of the Holy Spirit at Pentecost or to the good news of the Gospel for the people of Bainbridge. He also uses the 'open air' as a container metaphor making the church also an object in the container of the open air (see Appendix 2, line 18,):

18. **The church** / on this particular day / witnessing **in the open air**The 'linguistic expressions are containers for meanings' aspect of the 'conduit' metaphor emphasises that words and sentences have meanings in themselves, independent of any context or speaker (Lakoff and Johnson, 2003, p.11). He also uses the container metaphor in other places. For example, to describe the number of people

who may attend the next Pentecost event; and also in beginning to read the Bible passage for the service

The everyday metaphor used by the Dean 'there's a thought' that refers to the idea of filling the whole green with people because of the witness of this group of listeners, is not remarkable until it interacts with the more biblical, container metaphor of opening the scriptures and dividing his gifts (see Appendix 2, stanza 8). The Archbishop of York also uses a container metaphor and an ontological metaphor to describe the celebration and of the life of Christ:

# 1. And I am delighted to be joining you

#### 2. In the celebration of the life of Christ

As shown by all four preachers, many primary metaphors are universal because most people have similar bodies and brains and live in similar environments from the metaphorical point of view. If metaphorical maps are part of the embodied, human brain and the mechanisms of metaphor are unconscious then, like the Bishop, people will speak metaphorically from their commonplace in the world. The Archbishop of Canterbury's sermon illustrates that the essence of metaphor is understanding and experiencing one kind of thing in terms of another and the heart of metaphor is inference (Lakoff and Johnson, 2003, pp.3-5). His sermon shows how this inference works by, for example, comparing the sacrifices of service men and women in Iraq to the sacrifice of Christ.<sup>55</sup>

-

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>55</sup> However, interpretation/understanding of the inference depends, to some extent, on the political and social attitudes of who is speaking and who is listening to the discourse.

Complex metaphors are, however, different because they are not only made up of primary metaphors but also of culturally based conceptual frames, which may differ significantly from culture to culture (Lakoff and Johnson, 2003, p.257). All four preachers use complex metaphors that are based on the culture of the Christian tradition. For example, the Bishop, in the section of his sermon where he speaks about Jean, uses the phrase 'these are converting words' and later 'those words of Jesus had moved her to lay aside....' (see Appendix 6, lines 32, 37, 38). The Bishop divulges something of his attitude through what he says.

Metonymy does the same things as metaphor, but it allows the focus to be more specifically on certain aspects that are being referred to. Metonymy uses one entity to refer to another that is related to it. It has primarily a referential function, in that it allows one entity to stand for another, but it also serves the function of providing understanding. Metonymic concepts are part of the everyday thinking, talking and acting. (2003, p. 37).

The Dean uses the 'synecdoche' metonymy (discussed in Chapter 4) as he refers to the people who attend the Cathedral for the service at 9.30 a.m., as the 'half past nine congregation'. In a similar way the Archbishop of Canterbury uses 'exercise' in relation to historians, moralists, and international experts (see Appendix 1, line 10) when what he means is that the conflict in Iraq will cause these people to reflect on it 'for a long time yet'. Likewise the Bishop uses the phrase 'the end of Christendom' to refer to the end of the influence of Christianity on society and he frequently uses 'church' to refer to a community of people rather than a building.

In the summing up of his sermon the Archbishop of York acknowledges he is using the restoration of the church as 'a symbol of all our lives being restored by the love of God' and continues with the metaphor through to the end (see Appendix 4, line 167ff). Similarly, the Archbishop of Canterbury ends his theological reflection with an acknowledgement of the comparison between the cost of love to Jesus and 'the same thing at work in any life dedicated to taking the world a little further out of barbarity and violence' (see Appendix 1 lines 69-71). In making the overarching metaphor explicit, these finishing comments are evaluating the whole sermon and anchoring it back into the listeners' present in the way that Labovian story structures do (Hymes, 2007).

Using these metaphors in their sermons can be effective because the substitution is based on some understood association and this stimulates the imaginations of listeners through their 'members' resources (see Chapter 2 references to Norman Fairclough). Using 'shorthand' suggests familiarity and assumes some understanding of the listener, as if preachers and listeners have intimate knowledge of each other, creating a comfortable atmosphere of belonging and shared discourse. As previously discussed, Rose suggests this conversational approach produces solidarity and connection, redefining the role of preachers and listeners as equal partners.

#### 5.4 Rhetoric

Some aspects of rhetoric have already been dealt with in a separate section above (see 5.2.2). The relationship between rhetoric and the poetic demonstrates how repetition is

one form of rhetoric and, as discussed in Chapter 2, how rhetoric is a persuasive style of speaking. Preachers who use this style are noted for their expectation of having an inspiring effect on their listeners. There are several rhetorical strategies that each of the four preachers use to connect with listeners, enabling their participation and, thereby, persuade them of the point of view being propounded. Preachers have to be clear about the context and the purpose of their sermon using persuasive techniques such as rhetoric that convey meaning.

#### 5.4.1 Features of Rhetoric

The Archbishop of York demonstrates different ways of arguing, persuading and involving the latter is shown particularly when he interacts with a child. He enables the other listeners to participate vicariously in his performance through this interaction in order that they can create the link between the rarity of the gifts of the Wise Men and their gifts given for the restoration of the church building and, therefore, indirectly for themselves (see Appendix 4, strophe 5). Another example of persuasion is when the Archbishop tells listeners that he is going to contribute to the finishing of the restoration by giving a cheque. This, he hopes, will inspire others to do the same (see Appendix 4, stanza 4). He also uses humour to engage initially with listeners, in order that they will pay attention, begin to understand, believe, and later remember the ideas that he communicated.

The Dean has a similar rhetorical skill. He demonstrates this skill at the beginning of his sermon through the use of self-deprecating language to create an atmosphere of

solidarity with listeners (see Appendix 2, stanzas 4 and 5). He then tells his story in order to ask '*if this is who I am, who are you*?' and using associations that he has created through the story, opens up the possibility for listeners to recognize that they can also be involved with others in finding a relationship with God. When the rhetoric is based around narrative it produces a more indirect, inductive approach to preaching.

The Bishop tells listeners what his aim is in order to clarify what he is going to focus on. In doing this he intensifies the subject to create an atmosphere that enables possibilities for listeners more easily to remember his ideas. He uses intonation to be persuasive, emphasising each word of a phrase to make his point (see Appendix 6, line 17). In a similar but more personal way the Archbishop of Canterbury tells people who he thinks they are. This is likely to help them recognize themselves in what he says and, by this association, he emphasises his point that scripture has something to say to everyone. Below are some examples of more specific rhetorical features used by all of the preachers.

#### **5.4.1.1 Structuring Around Contrast and Connections**

Making a contrast between two items is an adaptable and widely acknowledged technique for incorporating and delivering a message. It is part of the art of rhetoric. Contrasts arouse the interest of listeners giving them more incentive to listen carefully (Atkinson, 2005). This incentive happens because of the rising intonation in the first part, while the falling intonation in the second part means that listeners can be clear when the end will be reached. For example, the Archbishop of Canterbury uses

contrasts to make his point about the 'cost' of the 'time' it takes for 'reflecting' on 'justice' (see Appendix 1, line 1). He also relates 'killing' to 'breaking down' and 'healing' to 'building up' (see Appendix 1, lines 32, 33). He acknowledges that those who had fought in the campaign did so to redress the balance towards healing and building rather than breaking down and killing. This could be a comment either on the war itself or on the problems with Iraq that lead to war, or even on the authorised version of the Bible, which is full of such contrasts. It is possible that there is an underlying connection between the Archbishop's comment, that is not just about using contrast to keep the listeners' attention, but also about whether it is right to comment on a situation that is much more complex than it appears on the surface. To elaborate, he takes a verse from scripture to ask a rhetorical question about what has been learned through the experience of the war in Iraq and he then uses the contrasts in the Scripture to move from a commendation to a comment (see Appendix 1, lines 81-86 and lines 30, 31). The Archbishop commends the armed personnel whilst at the same time making a less than positive comment on the behaviour of the politicians and commentators. In this way he uses the rhetorical art of contrast to make his point.

Atkinson suggests that all successful public speakers use verbal and non-verbal techniques to hold the attention of their listeners (Atkinson, 2005, p.9). As an orator the Archbishop also uses particular verbal and non-verbal techniques. While it is likely that his listeners will be hardly, if at all, aware of those techniques it is also likely that they will respond to them as they listen to him. However, the Bishop's use of the verbal and non-verbal structuring is quite different but, nevertheless, he still makes connections for listeners by using stark realities:

- 92. **To allow oneself** to be carried away by modern attitude of conflicting concerns
- 93. **To surrender** to too many demands
- 94. To commit oneself to too many projects
- 95. To want to help everyone in everything
- 96. Is to succumb to violence, more than that, it is cooperation in violence'
  Together with lexical repetition, and by using structural parallelism such as repeating the structure from 'to... (see Appendix 6, lines 92-5) until he gets to 'violence' (see Appendix 6, line 96) he is encouraging his listeners to 'stay with him'. At line 96, the Bishop emphasises the point he wants to make about what clergy do to themselves by wanting to do too much for others. The Bishop is relating 'allow', 'surrender', 'commit', 'want to help' to 'succumbing to violence'. He continues by saying being involved at the extremes of these actions infects the lives of clergy and the consequences will emerge eventually. He is contrasting what might be considered to be good traits in clergy with cooperation with violence. The whole stanza is counter-intuitive which is used as a strategy to shock and, therefore, involve his listeners and provoke thought. This use of such stark contrast identifies one of the Bishop's main points, initiated through the acknowledgement of an article in a religious journal. The writer in The Tablet suggests that clergy need 'rest for their souls' rather than be involved in 'destructive activism'.

In a similar way, the Archbishop of York contrasts what he suggests that listeners might think that people need with what God has actually done for us.

- 119. Do you know what we need in the world is not knowledge
- 120. Because if it was knowledge God would have sent a teacher

- 121.It isn't money we need, God would have sent us ....you know ....a billionaire
- 122. If what we needed was happiness God would have sent us an entertainer
- 123. What we needed was forgiveness.
- 124. For giveness for past sins, new life for the present and hope for the future
- 125.And that is why he **sent his son, Jesus Christ** 126.So that you and I may be **forgiven**

#### 5.4.1.2 Lists of three

The use of three parts for any presentation or lecture or phrases within them is a fundamental structuring principle both in western language and in the Christian tradition. Homiletics is no exception and there is a tendency to preach three-part sermons for reasons of completeness. In the standard teaching of homiletics the recommendation is that preachers introduce their listeners to the content; then, in the central part, they tell them the details of the content; and, finally, they conclude with a précis of what they have told them.

In church services members of the congregation have few problems in saying 'Amen' together after the priest has said 'the Father, the Son and the Holy Spirit'. The three-part structure can help people to come in on time (Atkinson, 1984, p.57ff). One reason why

three-part lists provide a very suitable and adaptable method for packaging praise and criticism is that listing similar items can work to strengthen, underline or amplify almost any kind of message. Using a word three times helps to emphasise that word so that people hear it. This means that progressively through the sermon more emphasis is given to the unchanging views being spoken about. Speakers need to display a delicate sense of timing if the three-part list is to work effectively.

The Archbishop of York uses three sets of the triplets: 'us'; 'you'; and 'to show', three times in his sermon in order to emphasise his point and lead his listeners through to a rhetorical crescendo, which is the good news of the Gospel Appendix 6, lines 76-96). The general importance of intonation and associated variations in volume and rhythmic stress alongside a variety of precisely timed non-verbal activities shows the listeners that a change is about to take place:

ABY: 93. >they gave him gifts<

>Gold, frankincense, and Myrrh<

At this point in the Archbishop's sermon he has reached his rhetorical crescendo. He uses image rich and sound rich language to introduce the crescendo (Tannen, 2007, p.88) and he speaks these words faster as he moves into it. This phenomenon does seem to be evident only in the Archbishop of York's performance. The Bishop, and also the Archbishop of York sometimes use two triplets of words sequentially to emphasise their point (see Appendix 4, lines 153,154; Appendix 6, lines 18-25) whereas the Archbishop of Canterbury tends to use lists of one plus two rather than a list of three:

## 35. There are visible enemies; / a dictator, / a terrorist

- 42. **The invisible enemy** may be hiding / in the temptation to look for short cuts in the search for justice
- 43. Letting the ends justify the means
- 44. Letting others / rather than oneself / carry the cost

Resner suggests that St Paul, an apostle writing in the New Testament, used a theologically informed rhetorical category of speech called '*Reverse- ethos*'. <sup>56</sup> This category described the nature and function of the preacher's person in the rhetorical situation of proclaiming the '*good news*' of the Gospel (Resner Jr. 1999, p.4). <sup>57</sup> At the beginning of his talk, the Bishop exemplifies this suggestion when he tells listeners about his thought process while writing the sermon. He also admits to them that he had to resist a temptation when deciding on the theme of his sermon (see Appendix 6, lines 1-3).

#### 5.5. Narrative

Narrative discourse is, unquestionably a major part of our everyday social lives. Within narrative discourse, stories are fundamental in helping to organize and make sense of experience that, in turn, forms an essential element of everyday life. Narrative, therefore, is the encoding of previous experiences that took place at a specific point in a past-time story world. (Georgakopoulou, 2001, p.42-44) By beginning with experiences to which listeners can relate, they then can be drawn in to the main part of the sermon.

.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>56</sup> See 1 Corinthians: 1-4

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>57</sup> Because rhetoric is persuasive there is little point in using it if the speaker does not 'practise what s/he preaches' For example, if a murderer is speaking about the folly of murder then there is no credibility in those words unless s/he has repented from her/his behaviour.

Labov presented six categories as universal to narrative, which he suggests constitute a fully formed narrative (noted in Hymes, 2007, p.193).<sup>58</sup>

The six categories are listed below with short illustrations from each preacher:

- 1. **Abstract**: Summarises the story, and asks the question: 'what is it about?' Two of the preachers create the abstract early on in their sermons. The Dean interprets the scripture reading in Part 2 (see Appendix 2) of his sermon so that listeners can understand what his story demonstrates, whilst the Archbishop of Canterbury states the discourse topic in the first line of his sermon (see Appendix 1, line 1). The Bishop and the Archbishop of York, however, take listeners further into their sermons before they disclose the discourse topic using clear statements of intent (see Appendix 6, lines 22-25; Appendix 4, lines 8-10).
- 2. **Orientation:** identifies time and place, the participants and activity or situation, asking the question, 'who, what, where, when?' The Dean orientates his story at the beginning of Part 2 of his sermon whilst the other three preachers take much longer to orientate their sermons. The Archbishop of Canterbury reaches the coda before he orientates his sermon (see Appendix 1, stanza 26) and likewise the Bishop's sermon is in Part 3 before he makes its orientation (see Appendix 6, stanza 24). The Archbishop of York's sermon has four Parts to it and he doesn't orientate the performance with the child and the discourse topic until he reaches the middle of Part 3 (see Appendix 4, stanza 25).
- 3. **Complicating Action:** this need be no more than a second action following a first, asking the question, 'then what happened? Since the Dean's sermon is based in narrative it is the only one of the four that has complicating action. The Dean tells

160

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>58</sup> Though there has been some criticism of the claim that the categories are universally applicable to narrative.

listeners what happened after he had described the scene of the train wreckage and then continued the story and introduced the heroine:

DRC: 72. And this lady came out of the morning mist

73. and she simply kind of almost fell into my arms

74. and she said 'please, please, help me'

75. and I said 'what can I do'.....

He emphasizes the drama of the story by using lexical repetition at the beginning of each idea unit.

4. **Evaluation:** has to do with asking the question, 'so what?' All of the sermons have evaluation. The Dean, the Bishop and the Archbishop of Canterbury begin their evaluation with a question:

DRC: 153. Why am I telling you this story?

BK: 118. Have we got anything to show the world about mutual attention and regard?/ about forgiveness and restoration/

ABC: 82. Perhaps we have learned something?

whilst the Archbishop of York begins his with statement:

ABY: 171. So we are celebrating today on this feast

5. Codas: signal a closure and also may bridge the gap between time of the narrative and the present. The Dean and the Archbishop of Canterbury refer listeners back to the piece of Scripture upon which the sermon is based and then bring that into the present by using a temporal phrase (see Appendix 2, lines 160-164; Appendix 1, line 86). The

Bishop ends with a challenge to the listeners (see Appendix 6, lines118-122) and the Archbishop of York concludes with a humorous threat, taken from a film, to come back if they do not do what he wants them to (see Appendix 4, lines 176-178).<sup>59</sup>

## **6. Result:** asks the question, 'what finally happened?'

Because the Dean's sermon is based in narrative it is the only one to have more of the elements of a fully formed narrative discourse including Labov's six points. The Dean's sermon is the only one to contain 'complicating action' answering the question 'then what happened'; followed by the 'result'; then answering the question 'what finally happened'. The implication of using a story, as the Dean does, is that listeners become involved with the characters and, therefore, want to know the answers to the questions that are based on Labov's template.

However, the other three sermons have, to a greater or lesser degree, some parts of Labov's structure. They contain all the other elements of narrative structure apart from 'complicating action' and 'result'. These two elements are omitted, as these sermons are not 'stories' about characters with which listeners have become actively connected, whereas this is the case in the Dean's story. The other sermons each need the narrative structure to engage listeners, and to draw them into the sermon. This is achieved by using some elements of Labov's structure in order that listeners are better able to follow through the theme of the sermon. Their listeners still need a coda to signal the end and to bridge the gap between the discourse and the present. However, they do not need the emotional close of a story, as the Dean's sermon does, and so there is no requirement for them to have the 'Result' element.

<sup>59</sup> 'I'll be back' said by the main character in the 'Terminator' films

-

As noted earlier, within narrative, it is important to begin with experiences to which listeners can relate. Recognizing that the Dean's story is different from the other three sermons because it is based around an emotional story does not mean that storylines are not used in the other sermons. Both the Bishop of Knaresborough and the Archbishop of York use story to illustrate a point or to change approach. Stories are the means by which past experiences, beliefs, doubts and emotions are organised in the memory. Narrative is so powerful that it summarizes an individual's sense of the world around them. It is their subjective reality. Georgakopoulou states that the place where a story appears in the discourse is significant. The sooner the story appears, the greater the importance to the speaker. Recent research has demonstrated that narrative can be as effective as the more classic authoritative approaches of making claims about knowledge; presenting a viewpoint; and constructing and challenging theories about individuals (Georgakopoulou in Auer, 2007 p.412).

Stories are often told in the place of straightforward answers to questions about what a person knows about a particular topic. The Bishop tells the story of his experience with 'Jean' only fourteen lines into his theme of the sermon as an illustration of words 'taken to heart' (see Appendix 6, stanza 8). He then gives his opinion on the church, noting that mutual love is what the church is about. The story of Jean illustrates how the Bishop believes mutual love should be witnessed in the body of the church. It is possible he uses this story to reassure listeners that he recognizes how difficult and costly it is to seek reconciliation and to live by this new commandment (see Appendix 6, strophe 4). At the same time he may position the story near to the beginning of his sermon, to show the depth of his emotional attachment to this way of living. The Archbishop of York, on the other hand openly admits that he likes the story from

Desmond Tutu. He tells this story towards the end of his sermon (cf. strophe 17 appendix 4) suggesting that this story is more about a summing up his point than it is about his emotional attachment to it.

#### 5.6 Summary

This chapter has sought to determine thematically the involvement strategies used by each of the preachers, identified in Chapter 4. It identified how these preachers develop a relationship with their listeners and how they manage the tension between authority and equality. The range of strategies identified in this chapter are used, consciously or unconsciously, by the preachers who hope that their approach will encourage listeners to: hear and actively engage with what they have to say; become participants in the performance; and lead them to search for an encounter with God. Further, by undertaking this analysis, it has been possible to draw out themes that are useful in a very practical way to the art of homiletics. It is also important to acknowledge that each preacher uses these techniques in a way that is distinctive, so that even with the use of common strategies each preacher has maintained his own particular, personal style.

There are also examples of performative language in all sermons illustrating

Fairclough's notion of language as a form of action. All of the preachers demonstrate to

listeners linguistic indicators of position, regarding their status in the church. These

indicators reveal their identification within the institutional hierarchy. The overarching

structuring principles that they all use are based in theological reflection. The stylistic

structure of each sermon shows that all the preachers appear to have a similar purpose

for their preaching, that is, they fall into Rose's transformational view of preaching even though each preacher dips in and out of a conversational technique within the some part of his sermon. The overriding question to be answered in Chapter 6 is: can this understanding of the power of language, performance, biblical texts and rhythms, discovered in all three sermons by employing discourse analysis, be used to broaden the teaching of homiletics and to encourage the adoption of Rose's conversational approach in the delivery of a sermon. The next chapter will also seek to answer the question in the title of this thesis: 'Can Discourse Analysis Contribute to a Theology of Preaching?

# **Chapter 6**

## **Conclusion**

#### 6.1 Introduction

The major focus of this thesis has been to test the idea that Discourse Analysis can be used both to support the preacher in her/his desire to communicate more effectively, and to broaden the teaching of homiletics to include Rose's conversational approach. The material analysed in this thesis identifies a new approach to narrative within a sermon and uses discourse analysis in a different way. <sup>60</sup> By using this method, homiletics can move forward with the times and, hopefully, make a greater impact on church and non-church people in respect of the Christian message.

Initially a framework derived from secondary sources was established in order to provide the springboard for the research. This framework recognizes the importance of the connection between '*orality*' and '*literacy*' as well as the necessity for appropriate language use if listeners are to hear and understand the words that preachers say. The

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>60</sup> Other work in this field has either used linguistic methods on biblical texts or has been approached from a psychological point of view. For example, 'Linguistics and New Testament Interpretation' (ed. David Alan Black, 1992) has essays on new methodologies and their applications to specific texts while 'Before the face of God' (Louis Praamsma, 1987) is an interdisciplinary study of the meaning of a sermon paying attention to preaching as religious language and how it is heard.

key to the successful delivery of a sermon is found by acknowledging the importance of style and performance, where performance is understood as conveying ideas, feelings and concepts. One of the important features of this study has been the use of research findings from different disciplines and this has enabled a valuable new method for preparing a sermon to be demonstrated. Rose's work on the different types of approach to preaching opens up the relationship between discourse analysis, style and performance; Bourdieu's work identifies the importance of 'governing' the relationship between preacher and listeners, which establishes discourse analysis as a tool that enables both to interact with each other; whilst Tannen's work on style emphasises the importance of linguistic strategies All these elements are unearthed by the discourse analysis of the case studies used in this thesis.

Chapter 3 highlighted the fact that the works of Rose, Tannen, Bourdieu and Gee are the driving factors in the choice of methodology for the thesis and that discourse analysis provides the framework in which to discover the linguistic strategies of the four preachers analysed. Jewitt's work on multimodal perspectives used in teaching and learning informed the analysis of the videos and their value by demonstrating how different modes work together in the delivery of a sermon. Three different frameworks: theological; theoretical and participation frameworks facilitate and enrich the analysis of the data, whilst Gee's approach to narrative and the use of poetic structures provides a further dimension. By integrating all of the above it has been possible to discover the linguistic strategies used by all of the preachers and to fulfil the requirement for a common approach to the analysis of the sermons.

Consideration has been given to how preachers communicate and how they aim to engage listeners at a deeper level, as well as to how the framework provided by the work of Rose, Tannen, Bourdieu and Gee, mentioned above, illustrates the linguistic strategies used by the preachers studied to create a participation framework through their performance. Accessibility of sermons is one of the primary interests of the thesis. The notion of performance and how sermonic language enhances performance, alongside the relationship between preacher and listeners demonstrate this accessibility. The main analytic themes discussed in Chapter 4 are embedded in homiletics and its performance and these, together, evidence the rhetorical skill of the preachers to evoke the involvement of listeners through the use of their imagination. The aim of using the sermons of senior clergy is to demonstrate to what extent they bring these linguistic strategies into play.

The analysis of the four sermons established that there are common strategies as well as individual strategies. The common strategies show a poetic structure to each text, which lends itself to the involvement of listeners. Consideration of this structure, in part, facilitates an interpretation of the range of strategies evident in each sermon and an understanding of the power of language and performance. The involvement strategies that are used by the preachers to encourage listeners to hear and actively engage in the performance, hopefully, will lead them to look for an encounter with God.

The overarching structuring principle of all of the preachers is theological reflection and stylistic structure. They all have a poetic structure to their texts, and use repetition, rhythm, metaphor and rhetoric to enhance involvement and participation. In addition,

they reflect theologically on their theme and on the biblical passage upon which their sermon was based. They use linguistic indicators of position and performative language as a way of dealing with the tension between authority and equality and they also use similar linguistic techniques to develop a relationship with listeners. They all demonstrate movement between Rose's dominant homiletical voices. However, there are significant differences between the individual texts and performances. For example, on the one hand the Archbishop of Canterbury's sermon is syntactically complex relying on intonation to enable understanding. It illustrates an integration of religious with political language, and his performance displays institutional authority whilst creating empathy.

The Dean, on the other hand, uses the vernacular to tell a story, and this presents something of his worldview and conveys his situational feelings. This opens the possibility of a connection with listeners as he interweaves present reality with past actions to encourage listener participation. The Archbishop of York and the Bishop, however, both use persuasive language, overtly challenging listeners. The Archbishop achieves this through humour coupled with a poetic style and didactic approach and including direct interaction, whilst the Bishop uses emotive language and rhetorical questions.

Several questions arise from these findings. How can these significant similarities and differences between the texts and performances of the sermons analysed change homiletics today? What contribution does this unique use of discourse analysis make to

this change? And how will that enhance any understanding of God? The response to these questions will be dealt with in the following section.

#### 6.2 Discussion

The main thrust of this discussion is to discover if discourse analysis offers preachers the opportunity to use theology differently and whether by changing their approach preachers enable listeners to discover their own theology. The Archbishop of Canterbury<sup>61</sup> has observed that: what is going on in poetry and human language itself is the impulse to say more than is there. He suggests that human language has never been narrowly functional; it is imaginative and always pointing out beyond itself. Language is always attempting to rework what is in front of it, not just to reproduce it. The Archbishop believes that a common mistake made about liturgy is imagining that the point of it is to make things clear and to streamline the passage of information. He thinks that, actually, the point of liturgy is to look for a mode of thinking and speaking that says that there is more than is presented and there is something that continues to call out a response (see footnote below). It is not just evocative but exploratory. For the Archbishop, theology is a response to this and the development of liturgy, including homiletics, is the impetus for theology. Can using discourse analysis in a new way change the theology of homiletics? If using discourse analysis can change the 'how' of homiletics then how will that help people to understand God?

.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>61</sup> This is an excerpt from the discussion for the Royal Society of Literature. Rowan Williams met poet and critic Fiona Sampson to discuss poetic and religious language under the title 'Language Under Stress: Poetry and Faith' Wednesday 20<sup>th</sup> June 2012.

Alister McGrath's book '*Mere Theology*' progresses this discussion. In his book McGrath considers the transformative power of the gospel and the idea that we need to have our eyes opened to things as they really are by an act of divine grace.

He takes a particular stanza from George Herbert's poem, 'The Elixir' 62 that describes the role of theology in the Christian life, to demonstrate how words 'expressed and explored poetically' might help us to reflect on theology. He maintains that theology is an activity of the imagination that 'is a gateway to something greater' and, through a deeper mode of engagement, 'theology makes possible a new way of seeing things' (2010, pp. 29-35). McGrath's view of theology, therefore, suggests that, if a preacher is able to design a sermon based on the way that people listen rather than just because of the content, and also is able to capture the creative capacity of listeners and generate a spark of imagination to entice them to enter into the biblical world, then listeners might grasp something of the mystery of God.

The analysis of the four sermons demonstrates how this might be achieved. As previously discussed, by analysing each sermon using Gee's approach illustrates how, in Rose's terms, the four preachers use poetic, evocative language to stimulate listeners to participate in the sermon performance. Within these common strategies each preachers also demonstrates his individuality. This suggests that it is possible not only to identify a coherent structure that can facilitate an interpretation of the range of

. .

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>62</sup> A man that looks on glass

On it may stay his eye;

Or if he pleaseth, through it pass,

And then the heav'n espy

strategies, but also to recognize something of the process of their understanding of the theme and their motivation for preaching. Discourse analysis enables this possibility.

The ability to identify how preachers communicate and engage listeners on a deeper level and the strategies that they have used to do this provides indicators as to what is its intended purpose and why each sermon is delivered in the way that it is. At the same time it is possible to gain an understanding of the preacher's sociolinguistic and sociocultural contexts and of how preachers relate to those contexts and to their listeners. Use of the frameworks developed in this study can also reveal both the different layers of meaning that are able to form connections with the listeners and to recognize that language use; performance; and style cannot be separated but they do provide the preacher with a choice of expression. As discussed in Chapter 2 (see section 2.7) discourse analysis enables preachers to understand their own agendas when they come to write and deliver sermons and, therefore, are enabled more clearly to speak from a place of integrity.

Haugen argues that style is designed primarily in response to an audience. Tannen's work on involvement strategies agrees with Haugen's view on style. She suggests that these strategies make understanding possible and that the appreciation of written discourse is a matter of communicating a process of thinking, which in turn creates a partnership between preacher, listeners and God. If Bauman's view, that performance is a mode of speaking that involves an art form or text, listeners and setting, is accepted, then performance takes on an important role in the understanding of how to connect with listeners (see section 2.4). When performance becomes a conversation between

preacher and listeners it opens up the possibility of dialogue between them through the formation of participation frameworks. This, in turn, begins to develop into Rose's conversational approach to preaching where preacher and listeners become equal colleagues in matters of living and believing and also, as Wenger argues equal members in a community of learning (see section 2.5). This is not without its difficulties/problems. As noted earlier, preachers are faced with the tensions between their given authority from the church and their relationship with the listeners during their sermons. The Archbishop of Canterbury, for example, has to balance the historical authority of his role and his linguistic habitus as a highly educated man who has had the role of a teacher in the academy along with seeking a relationship with his listeners.

The analysis of the four sermons identified instances in the performance of all of the texts that revealed the possibility of dialogue. McGrath states that a 'preacher may act as a window through which God may be more fully known' (2010, p.35) and this research has demonstrated how each preacher attempts to do this. Discourse analysis, however, exposes the approach of the four preachers to be transformational, in Rose's terms, rather than conversational. All the preachers hold up the glass and invite listeners to look through it and see what they see. For example, the Archbishop of Canterbury describes his understanding of the lives of the service men and women in Iraq; the role they take in retaining a climate of trust, and their responsibility in maintaining military integrity in Part 1 of his sermon. In Part 2 he theologically reflects on their life in comparison to the life of Christ. In McGrath's terms he is holding up the glass of the situation and inviting listeners to look through it to see God as he sees God, through the life of Jesus. Likewise the Bishop holds up the glass as he describes the reality of the crises facing the church. He encourages listeners to recognize that crisis may be a good

thing and then he encourages listeners to look through the glass and see the church as Christ in the world. In a very different way the Archbishop of York uses humour and an interaction with a child to create the window; but he is essentially using the same maxim: to see the rare gifts, and through them he tells them how to understand who Jesus is. Equally different but yet similar, the Dean holds up the glass as he tells the real story of a train crash; then he invites listeners to look through and see God through his own reactions; the reaction of the heroine and the reaction of the people of the church she found.

In Rose's terms all the preachers maintain the gap between themselves and listeners. In McGrath's analogy the preachers invite listeners to see through the glass as they do; to understand the theology as they do; to encounter God in the same way that they do. In the conversational view they would use the same approach with poetic, evocative language but they would leave the question of what listeners might see through the glass to discover for themselves. The analysis of the four sermons has shown that performance is the key to enabling listeners to find their own theology. Rose's proposal to include at the homiletical table a conversational approach to preaching would give preachers the choice to participate with listeners in the discovery of a local theology. This thesis has shown that discourse analysis, at least partially, enables that inclusion.

Discourse analysis has revealed the strategies used by all of the preachers to involve listeners and to encourage them to participate in their performance. It has facilitated an examination of sermonic language to uncover the social and historical perspective of the preachers, which will enable them to recognize themselves in what they write and to

understand their own agenda when they come to deliver a sermon. The important contribution that this thesis makes is that it clarifies for preachers the 'why' and 'how' of preaching in such a way that preachers have the choice of which approach, in Rose's terms, they might choose. Discourse analysis also demonstrates the importance of performance to draw listeners into the sermon. This thesis has shown that discourse analysis, used in this unique way, does advance the understanding of the methods that can be used by preachers to communicate more effectively in order to enable her/his listeners to move forward in their faith. Using McGrath's analogy of the glass/window, discourse analysis also enables preachers to develop a theology of preaching and, by that, embrace Rose's proposed conversational approach to preaching among others. Through this they will enrich the art of preaching and engage in homiletics as a 'conversation' with listeners to discover new ways of understanding God.

# Appendix 1

# Archbishop of Canterbury's text as verse marked with lines, stanzas and strophes

In the name of the Father and the Son and the Holy Spirit. Amen

## Part 1 (The Message from Iraq)

**Strophe one** (cost)

Stanza 1 (seeking justice)

- 9. Today is a time for reflecting / on the human cost/ for seeking justice
- 10. On the generosity of so many people /young and not so young / facing / and meeting /that cost
- 11. and the countless, mysterious ways / in which such people / have been equipped / to meet the cost
- 12. through their relationships / through quiet support and inspiration / of those who love them / and have shaped who they are

#### Stanza 2 (unexpected qualities)

- 13. A time to reflect / on the unexpected qualities / of people like ourselves
- 14. who, caught up in / the confusion / of a great international upheaval
- 15. simply got on with / the task they were given
- 16. because they believed that order and justice mattered

## Strophe 2 (The Situation)

#### Stanza 3 (the conflict in Iraq)

- 17. The conflict in Iraq will for a long time yet
- 18. exercise the historians / the moralists / the international experts

## Stanza 4 (complicated world)

- 19. In a world as complicated as ours has become
- 20. It would be a very rash person / who would feel able/ to say without hesitation
- 21. this was absolutely the right / or the wrong thing to do
- 22. the right or the wrong place to be

# Strophe 3 (Obedience and responsibility)

#### Stanza 5 (service men and women)

- 23. The modern service man or woman will not be someone
- 24. who has accepted without question / a set of easy answers.

# Stanza 6 (obedience)

- 25. Their obedience is anything but mindless
- 26. But it is obedience all the same.
- 27. obedience that comes from recognizing / others have been given a clear responsibility for certain difficult decisions

Strophe 4 (Tough Challenges)

Stanza 7 (everyone knows)

28. What matters is not that there is no debate / disagreement / or uncertainty

29. simply that everyone knows / who has to answer which questions

30. this was a conflict / where some of the highest level questions were unusually

hard / and sharply argued over

31. But everyone had their share of the tough challenges

Stanza 8 (responsibility)

32. The responsibility of those on the front line remained / and remains the same.

33. Sustaining the climate of mutual trust and confidence / that allows decisions to

be implemented effectively / and behaving in ways / that maintain everyone's

trust in the integrity of the armed services.

Strophe 5 (Winning Trust)

Stanza 9 (demanding task)

26. The demanding task of winning local trust / in a chaotic, ravaged society

like

post-invasion Iraq

27. was one of the heaviest responsibilities / laid on armed personnel anywhere in

recent times

28. Many here will know just how patiently and consistently

29. That work was taken on

178

Stanza 10 (capacity of every serving soldier)

- 30. The moral credibility of any country engaged in war depends a lot less on the rhetoric of politicians and commentators
  - 32. Than on the capacity of every serving soldier to discharge these responsibilities with integrity and intelligence.

## Part 2: The Message of Scripture

Strophe 6 (Scriptural Resonance)

Stanza 11 (healing and building)

- 33. A time to kill / and a time to heal, / says our first reading
- 34. A time to break down / and a time to build up.
- 35. The healing and the building up / have been at the heart of those
- 36. We commemorate today

## Stanza 12 (special resonance)

- 37. No short term job / as those in Iraq / who are continuing to work / will testify
- 38. But this means that / for the modern armed forces
- 39. There is a special resonance / in some of the words of our second reading
- 40. Our struggle is not against enemies of blood and flesh, says St Paul

Strophe 7 (The Enemy)

Stanza 13 (visible and invisible)

- 41. There are visible enemies; / a dictator, / a terrorist
- 42. But there are invisible ones too.

Stanza 14 (hidden)

- 42. The invisible enemy may be hiding / in the temptation to look for short cuts / in the search for justice
- 43. Letting the ends justify the means
- 44. Letting others / rather than oneself / carry the cost
- 45. Denying the difficulties / or the failures / so as to present a good public face

Strophe 8 (St Paul's Advice)

Stanza 15 (remote ideals)

- 46. Against these temptations / St Paul tells us / to wrap ourselves round with the truth,
  - 47. to be defended by justice
  - 48. And to be impatient for peace
  - 49. These are not remote ideals for any religious minority

#### Stanza 16 (essential advice)

- 50. They are essential advice / for those caught up in the anxious / fast changing world of modern military operations.
- 51. With the intense / even harsh scrutiny / they get from observers and commentators world wide

#### Strophe 9 (Reflecting on the Cost of Justice)

## Stanza 17 (be grateful)

- 52. Reflecting on the years / of the Iraq campaign / we cannot say no mistakes were ever made / when has that ever been the case?
- 53. But we can be grateful for the courage and honesty shown in facing them.
- 54. Grateful too for the care taken to create an atmosphere / that helped people to struggle / against these invisible enemies.
- 55. And to keep their eyes on the task of healing and building.

## Stanza 18 (cost of justice)

- 56. Justice does not come without cost.
- 57. In the most obvious sense / it is the cost of life and safety.
- 58. For very many here today / that will be the first thing / in their minds and hearts;
- 59. Along with the cost in anxiety and compassion / that is carried by the families of service men and women.

Strophe 10 (Reflecting on the Individual Cost)

Stanza 19 (holding back)

60. But there is another sort of cost involved

61. In holding back the easy, instinctive response.

62. And checking that you are genuinely doing something

63. For the sake of long term building or healing.

Stanza 20 (Putting up with and setting aside)

64. A cost in putting up with boredom / or frustration / in the course of operations.

65. In setting aside prejudice / and resentment / to get to know a strange culture

66. And to feel for its people.

67. These are all part of the cost / the sacrifice involved in seeking a better and more secure life / for people who have suffered outrageously.

Strophe 11 (Reflecting on the Cost of Love)

Stanza 21 (sacrifice)

68. When we as Christians consider the sacrifice / that purchased peace and mercy for the whole world

69. We think not only of the death of Jesus on the cross / but also the cost of love and openness to the stranger / that marked his life

70. We can recognize the same thing at work / in a lesser degree

71. In any life that is dedicated / to taking the world a little further out of barbarity and violence.

## Stanza 22 (patient acceptance)

- 72. It is not only the moments of high tragedy that matter
- 73. But the patient acceptance of daily frustrations and confusions
- 74. And the need for painstaking attention / in every detail / to the work that there is to be done.
- 75. All of that too we commemorate and celebrate today.

## Strophe 12 (Reflecting on Realty)

## Stanza 23 (doubting)

- 76. Many people of my generation and younger grew up doubting whether / we should ever see / another straight forward international conflict
- 77. Fought by a standing army with conventional weapons.

## Stanza 24 (forgetting)

- 78. We had begun to forget / the realities of cost
- 79. And when such conflict appeared on the horizon / there were those among both policy makers and commentators
- 80. Who were able to talk about it / without really measuring the price
- 81. The cost of justice.

## Strophe 13 (A Time to Keep Silence and a Time to Speak)

#### Stanza 25 (learned silence)

- 82. Perhaps we have learned something?
- 83. If only that there is a time to keep silence.
- 84. A (toim), a time to let go of the satisfyingly overblown language
- 85. That is so tempting for human beings when there is war in the air.

## Stanza 26 (Coda)

- 86. But today is also a time to speak / although only briefly
- 87. To speak our thanks for those who have taught us / through their sacrifice the sheer worth of justice and peace
- 88. And who have shouldered some of the responsibility / for fleshing out the values / that most of us only talk about
- 89. In the name of the Father and the Son and the Holy Spirit; Amen

# Appendix 2

The Dean of Ripon Cathedral's text as verse marked with lines, stanzas and strophes

Part 1 (Pentecost on the Green) Strophe 1 (Going out for the day) Stanza 1 (At the Cathedral) 1. .....the 'er cathedral this morning 2. h. and was just there long enough 3. to greet the half past nine congregation. Stanza 2 (News) 4. h. and I said to them 5. I've got some bad news for you. 6. I'm going out for the day. Strophe Two (The Journey) Stanza 3 (Preaching) 7. I'm going to North Stainley

8. to preach this morning.

## Stanza 4 (Bainbridge)

- 9. Then I am going on
- 10. and upwards to Bainbridge / for an open air service
- 11. And they all clapped.

## Strophe 3 (Celebration)

## Stanza 5 (Pentecost)

- 12. Anyway I bring their greetings / what a wonderful day
- 13. And thank you / for giving me the privilege / and opportunity
- 14. To come
- 15. And share with you
- 16. And to celebrate Pentecost in this way

## Stanza 6 (Approval)

- 17. I think this is just what God would approve of.
- 18. The church / on this particular day / witnessing in the open air
- 19. (though a few of you have taken cover)
- 20. But witnessing

## Strophe 4 (The Challenge)

## Stanza 7 (Being talked about)

## 21. And people are stopping in cars

- 22 And there are others on the bank
- 24. And 'er' we are being seen
- 25. And talked about.
- 26. But that's only the start of it.

#### Stanza 8 (Double the number)

- 27. And here's the challenge / before I say what I have to say
- 28. You should book this for next year
- 29. Tell everyone how good i(t) is
- 30. And let's see / if we can double the number here / next year.
- 31. And then who knows / in about 'er' five year's time
- 32. You should have filled the whole green / there's a thought.
- Part 2 (The Story)
- Strophe 5 (The Scripture)
- Stanza 9 (Getting ready for St Paul)
  - 33. But let's open the scripture now / 'cos I / that wonderful 'er' few verses
  - 34. of St Paul writing to the Ephesians
  - 35. And here's a precise of it in my particular version

## Stanza 10 (What St Paul Says)

- 36. 'Christ, Jesus Christ has generously divided out his gifts to us / you and me
- 37. So that his people would learn to serve / and his body grow strong'
- 38. Learning to serve / so that the body / which is his church

39. the community of believers grows strong.

Strophe 6 (The Story)

Stanza 11 (In a field)

- 39. Let me tell you a story
- 41. And it actually takes place in a field / just like being on a green
- 42. But it was a different day
- 43. This particular day I find myself
- 44. Walking across a field / in the early morning

## Stanza 12 (Cold morning)

- 45. But it was different because-
- 46. I'll tell you the exact date
- 47. It was 28<sup>th</sup> February 2001
- 48. So a very cold winter morning

Strophe 7 (Telephone call)

Stanza 13 (Living in Selby)

- 49. Why was I walking across a field that day?
- 50. Because I had had a telephone call
- 51. This was when I was living in Selby
- 52. And working there

## Stanza 14 (Train disaster)

- 53. I'd had a telephone call from the police
- 54. Saying 'please can you go to Great (Heck)
- 55. There's been a train disaster
- 56. Some of you may remember / reading the news about that.

## Strophe 8 (One of the first)

## Stanza 15 (Never forgotten)

- 57. It became known as the Selby Train Disaster
- 58. And I was one of the first / along with one or two fire fighters and paramedics
- 59. To be on that field
- 60. Walking towards the tracks that day
- 61. I've never forgotten it

## Stanza 16 (Majestic, but made of matchsticks)

- 62. You know these wonderful train carriages / so majestic and large
- 63. that we get on at the train station
- 64. There they were in front of me / crumpled as though
- 65. they had just literally been made of match sticks

```
Strophe 9 (There were people)
```

Stanza 17 (God help us!)

- 66. And I remember
- 67. Walking across the field that day / right next to a big fireman
- 68. And he said 'God help us'

## Stanza 18 (The lady in the mist)

- 69. Because we looked at this wreckage and it was awful
- 70. and we just realised that / inside it all / there were people
- 71. So I walked across the field
- 72. And suddenly I was aware of someone walking towards me
- 73. And this lady came out of the morning mist

Strophe 10 (Wandering Aimlessly)

Stanza 19 (Please help me)

- 74. And she simply kind of almost fell into my arms
- 75. And she said 'please, please help me'
- 76. And I said 'what can I do?'
- 77. She said 'please help me'

## Stanza 20 (Shock)

- 78. Of course she was deeply in shock
- 79. She had managed to get herself out of the wreckage
- 80. and was just- you know- in the shock, wandering aimlessly

## Strophe 11 (At the Nursing Station)

## Stanza 21 (In the barn)

- 81. And I took her
- 82. And lead her to a barn / that even then / at the side of the field
- 83. Was being set up as a nursing station
- 84. And I sat with her on a bale of straw

# Stanza 22 (Not religious)

- 85. And then I think she noticed my dog collar
- 86. And as we sat there
- 87. And I just simply held her hand
- 88. She said 'You know I am not religious, but can you help me?'

# Strophe 12 (My name is Shirley)

## Stanza 23 (Can you find my husband)

- 89. I said 'what can I do?'
- 90. She said 'my name's Shirley
- 91. and my husband's on the train
- 92. Can you go and find him?'

## Stanza 24 (No coat on)

93. It was then that I noticed a couple of things about Shirley

- 94. One that she was wearing no shoes and she was shivering / not just because of the shock / but because she didn't have a coat on
- 95. An(d) I took my top coat off
- 96. And put it around her
- 97. And left her with a nurse
- Strophe 13 (A bit of the horror)
- Stanza 25 (The sheer force)
  - 98. It was only later, incidentally that I discovered / (and here's a bit of the horror)
  - 99. The sheer force of the impact of that crash / had thrown Shirley (and people like her) / out of their boots and their clothes
  - 100. She had been wearing boots / and she had been wearing a coat
  - 101. The sheer impact / which had thrown her across the carriage / had thrown her out of her shoes and her coat
- Stanza 26 (The last I saw)
  - 102. So I left her with a nurse
    - 103. And went back towards the wreckage to see if I could find her husband
    - 104. of course it was impossible
    - 105. And that was the last I saw of Shirley that day because she was taken off to hospital.

#### Strophe 14 (The Memorial Service)

## Stanza 27 (I saw her again)

- Then a few weeks later / we had a great memorial service / for those who
- tragically lost their lives / and Shirley's husband / had been one of them
- 108. And I saw her again
- 109. I saw this devastated person / well you can imagine, can't you
- 110. And she simply tried to thank me for what I had done that day

## Stanza 28 (After the service)

- 111. And after the memorial service we parted
- But I continued to pray for Shirley / because, you know even then, weeks after
- 113. And she had just gone through the funeral / the whole devastation / not just because she had lost her husband
- But her life had been turned upside down.

## Strophe 15 (Moving the story on)

## Stanza 29 (The scars)

- 115. And it was telling on her face and her body / the scars from the crash / of mind, of emotion.
- 116. All that was hers
- 117. She was devastated

## Part 3 (The Wonder of God)

Stanza 30 (One year later)

- 118. Then I want to take you on in the story / to the 28<sup>th</sup> February 2002 / one year on from the crash
- 119. When at the request of the families / we had another memorial service / in Selby Abbey / where I was working
- 120. And that day / I was just by the church door / greeting people as they arrived
- 121. And rather like on the first day on the field, I saw this lady come to me
- 122. And I recognized that this was Shirley

## Strophe 16 (What Happened next)

Stanza 31 (A Smile)

- But do you know / she was so different / she was actually radiant
- 124. She had a smile on her face / and she simply said to me 'It's so wonderful to see you.
- 125. Can we have a cup of tea afterward / I've got so much to tell you'
- 126. And so we did.
- Stanza 32 (Lost the will to live)
  - 127. And the story goes like this
  - 128. She said to me 'You know it was just so awful / I lost the will to live
  - 129. And she said 'There was many a night in the first phase of bereavement when I would just leave home; (she lived in Newcastle)

130. I'd leave home and I'd just wander up and down streets of Newcastle wondering whether life was worth living

Strophe 17 (The Church)

Stanza 33 (Open door)

- 131. And she said 'then one night / as I was wandering aimlessly because I didn't want to go home / there were too many memories / I passed a church
- she said, 'the door was open / and from inside I could hear music
- there were people playing instruments
- and there were other people singing'
- Stanza 34 (Going through the door)
  - 135. And she said, 'somehow I found myself going through the door
  - and having gone through the door / she said 'I just sat
    - and looked at the great beauty of the church
  - 138. and listened to the music'

Strophe 18 (God Takes Hold)

Stanza 35 (Wonderful people)

- 139. And then I don't know what happened
- 140. But God actually had taken hold of Shirley's life that night
- 141. And she found herself going back to the church on Sunday
- 142.And when she got through the church door / she found some wonderful people who were full of welcome / and they looked after her / and sat with her in the service.

Stanza 36 (Part of the community)

143. And having welcomed her

144.they said 'come and have a cup of coffee afterwards'

145. And before she knew it

146. She became part of that community

Strophe 19 (Growing in faith)

Stanza 37 (Joining in)

147. And a little later she was confirmed

148. And she started going to one of the house groups

149.And then she joined a group of volunteers / who were working in the local school / hearing children read

150. And Shirley has grown in her faith

Stanza 38 (Church warden)

- 151. And its great joy to me (I'm still in touch)
- 152.to let you know / that on the AGM / just gone this year
- 153. She became a church warden
- 154. Why am I telling you this story?
- Strophe 20 (This is what God does)
- Stanza 39 (God uses the people who are there)
  - 155.You know, I don't know what 'er' God was doing through me that morning on the field 28<sup>th</sup> February 2001
  - 156.But he used me to help Shirley / just by being there
  - 157.And then he used the people who were singers / and musicians in the church in Newcastle to be there for Shirley
  - 158.And then he used the people who were welcomers in the church / and those who made the tea and coffee
  - Stanza 40 (He uses those who serve)
  - 159.And then he used the members of the house group / and the clergy of the church to encourage her / and prepare her for confirmation
  - 160.And then he used those who serve with Shirley in the school hearing children to read.
  - 161. This is what God does

Strophe 23 (Gifts we can use)

Stanza 41 (Build us up)

162. And that's exactly what St Paul was talking about

163. Jesus Christ gives his gifts to us

164.So that his glory can be known

165. So that we and others can be built up

## Stanza 42 (Transformed lives)

166. And that's certainly what happened for Shirley

167. And when it does happen / as for her

168.whole lives are transformed and renewed

169. And what I have to say to you is / it doesn't just take a train disaster /

Strophe 24 (God gives us his gifts)

Stanza 43 (Wherever we are)

170. There are lots of people in our communities / wherever we live,

Bainbridge, Hawes / wherever it is, Askrigg, Ripon

171. There are lots of people in our communities / searching for a purpose

172. Just as though they were wandering up the street / up and down aimlessly

173. And God's desperate to use us to transform their lives

Stanza 44 (Be yourself)

174. And it's not difficult.

175. When he gives us the gifts of his spirit

176.it's not that you've got to become superhuman or desperately holy

177.you've got to be yourself.

Strophe 25 (God is Responsible)

Stanza 45 (Being there)

178. And it's just sometimes about being there / however inadequate you feel

179.holding someone's hand / making a cup of tea

180.telling them they are welcome / all that, because that is what our role is

181.And the rest is up to God.

Stanza 46 (Be yourselves)

182. So there's the challenge / be yourselves

183.rejoice in the people you are and in the spirit God gives each of us

184.and be there for others / so God can work through you and me

185.to renew his people / and to build up his body

186.for, for this he gave us the gift of his spirit

187. Thank you for listening

## **Appendix 3**

# The Dean of Ripon Cathedral's Sermon showing the mainline theme

Part 2 The Story

Strophe 5

Stanza 11 (line 43) the story begins

1. walking across a field

Stanza 19 (line 75)

2. what can I do?

Stanza 21 (line 83)

3. I sat with her on a bale of straw

Stanza 26 (line 102)

4. I went back to see if I could find her husband

Stanza 27 (line 107)

5. I saw her again

Stanza 28 (line 110)

6. After the memorial service we parted

#### Part 3

Stanza 30 (lines 117,120)

- 7. I want to take you on in the story
- 8. And rather like on the first day on the field I saw this lady come to me

Stanza 31 (lines 123,124)

- 9. It's so wonderful to see you
- 10. Can we have a cup of tea I've got so much to tell you

Stanza 33 (line128)

11. ....I passed a church

Stanza 34 (line 134)

12. somehow I found myself going through the door

Stanza 35 (lines 138, 139)

- 13. then I don't know what happened
- 14. but God actually had taken hold of Shirley's life that night

Stanza 36 (line 145)

15. she became part of the community

Stanza 37 (line149)

16. Shirley has grown in her faith

Stanza 38 (line 153)

17. Why am I telling you this story?

Stanza 39 (lines 154,155)

- 18. I don't know what God was doing through me
- 19. But he used me to help Shirley just by being there

Stanza 40 (line 160)

20. This is what God does

Stanza 41 (line 164)

20. So that we and others can be built up

# Stanza 42 (line 168)

21. It doesn't just take a train disaster

Stanza 43 (lines 169, 172)

- 22. ...there are lots of people
- 23. God's desperate to transform their lives

Stanza 44 (lines 173, 176)

- 24. and it's not difficult
- 25. you've got to be yourself

Stanza 45 (line 180)

26. and the rest is up to God

Stanza 46 (line 184)

27. to renew his people and build up his body

# Appendix 4

## Archbishop of York's Text as verse with lines, strophes and stanzas:

```
Part 1
            (Restoring the church)
Strophe 1
           (Celebration)
Stanza 1
           (Thanks)
1. May I also add my own thanks to all of you
2. For restoring this church
3. Who have worked so very hard
4. And I am very glad that / 'erm' you have a Tardis / which is over there.
5. Watch for you know / you never know / Dr Who who is settled there.
Stanza 2 (Celebration)
6. Now the first Sunday of Epiphany is a very, very rich feast.
7. And I am delighted to be joining you
8. In the celebration of the life of Christ / who has come into the world
9. To restore our relationship with God
10. And your thanksgiving / for the restoration and repair / of your church building.
Strophe 2 (The vestry)
Stanza 3
          (not complete)
```

- 11. The work is not completed yet
- 12. Because if you went into the vestry
- 13. That requires some attention.

Stanza 4 (Contribution)

- 14. And I can now guarantee you
- 15. That I am going to be the first / probably / to contribute to the restoration of the vestry
- 16. So a cheque will be on its way
- 17. And I hope / many of you are going to join me / to make sure that this vestry is restored
- 18. In the same extent / as this beautiful work that you have done.

Part 2 (The Epiphany of Christ)

Strophe 3 (Gifts)

Stanza 5 (Job done)

- 19. Is that alright?
- 20. Do you think you had finished your job?
- 21. Anyway, a cheque is coming on its way
- 22. The first of many / so that / that part can be restored as well.
- 23. Epiphany one and then the Baptism of Jesus

Stanza 6 (Meaning of Christmas)

24. The wise men have travelled far / and have finally found the king / that they were

seeking.

25. 'erm' they open up for us / the meaning of Christmas / by the three gifts they offer

to Christ.

26. Gifts, which indeed give us a clue actually to the meaning of Christmas.

Strophe 4 (Birthdays)

Stanza 7 (Three gifts)

27. Gold, Frankincense and Myrrh.

28. These were rare and indeed costly gifts.

29. The best that were due / of the three wise men could offer / a new born, great king.

30. These were very rare and yet they were very costly

31. And the three wise men bring these particular gifts. Gold.

Stanza 8 (Children's birthday)

32. Now is there anybody / among the children / whose birthday is today?

33. Among you / is anyone born in January?

34. Anybody? Born in January?

Strophe 5 (Gold)

Stanza 9 (Come up)

- 35. Can you come up here please?
- 36. You are going to help me quite a lot. Do you mind?
- 37. Come up here.
- 38. Carefully, carefully, gently, gently
- 39. And what is your name?

## Stanza 10 (Katie)

- 40. Katie / Katie come here.
- 41. Now I have got some gold
- 42. I have got something here / gold
- 43. Now that's what gold looks like
- 44. now / this is real pure gold, alright?

## Strophe 6 (The Wise men)

Stanza 11 (The first gift)

- 45. Can you hold it? / See how heavy it is?
- 46. That's pure gold
- 47. There is nothing in it / just pure gold
- 48. So that's the first gift the wise men gave Jesus
- 49. Have you ever touched gold before?

#### Stanza 12

50. No

- 51. There you are pure gold, absolutely pure, absolutely precious ok?
- 52. So they gave him a piece of gold.

```
Strophe 7 (Second gift)
```

Stanza 13 (Frankincense)

- 53. The second gift they 'gev' him was Frankincense
- 54. And I have got some frankincense here / now / this actually has come from Amman.
- 55. This grows on trees / and then you go and scrape it off.
- 56. Can you have a smell?
- 57. What do you think? Do you like it?

```
Stanza 14 (Charcoal)
```

- 58. Ok now / would you be so kind
- 59. Go down there / you will find some charcoal
- 60. And you are going to be the person who puts the
- 61. There, there / yep you've got the charcoal there / and charcoal over there
- 62. I want you to open that little bag / take it out / and put it on the first bowl here.

```
Strophe 8 (Fire)
```

Stanza 15 (Wonderful lady)

- 63. A bit of fire there / it won't burn you, but
- 64. Ok put some on / just rub it in

- 65. No rub it into the fire / and another,
- 66. Some more / dump it out, dump it all out,
- 67. Put some more / yeh, yeh, yeh / what a wonderful lady.

Stanza 16 (ahhh!)

- 68. Put some more, put some more
- 69. There she goes / now in a little while; ahhh
- 70. Did you see that?
- 71. I told you it was a Tardis
- 72. You know?

Strophe 9 (Jesus)

Stanza 17 (Prayers)

- 73. That is incense / So it goes out and smells like that.
- 74. And incense really was a symbol / for whoever come and prays for us.
- 75. You see when we pray / our prayers / like that incense rising before God.
- 76. So this Jesus / who came / given incense / to show he prays for us
- 77. He is a friend of ours / and guides us / and leads us / in what we are supposed to do.

Stanza 18 (Another gift)

- 78. He is what we mean by God / and what God means by humanity
- 79. But also these wonderful, wonderful 'er' people / gave gifts,
- 80. Another gift / and it was myrrh.

- 81. Now here is another bag I am handing to you / there you are.
- 82. Do you know what myrrh is used for? No

Strophe 10 (Another gift)

Stanza 19 (Myrrh)

- 83. Well Katie / myrrh is a very interesting thing.
- 84. It's rosin / and in the rosin / you extract a particular thing out of the rosin
- 85. And what you do, it actually helps to embalm bodies so that they do not smell.
- 86. Dead bodies are embalmed in that kind of thing.
- 87. Now that is safe, so can you empty it in the other pot?

Stanza 20 (Different)

- 88. It smells differently / but the rosin is extracted like that
- 89. Pour it on, pour it on, thank you
- 90. Get away from the smoke.
- 91. There you are / that's it / that smells slightly different from the other.
- 92. And again both come from Amman / you see that.

Strophe 11 (So Good)

Stanza 21 (New life)

- 93. So they gave him gifts / gold frankincense and myrrh.
- 94. To show that he was a king

- 95. To show that he is the one who helps our prayers
- 96. To show actually he has come to die
- 97. That you and I may be able to have new life.

#### Stanza 22 (Think about it)

- 98. Now / since you have been so good and so kind,
- 99. If you were a king / what do you think we should give you? Or a queen?
- 100. Why not think about it / and tell me afterwards, alright?
- 101. Had you better go and sit down / and think about it
- 102. And come / and tell me afterwards, alright?

## Part 3 (Jesus)

Strophe 12 (Comes as a King)

Stanza 23 (Appreciation)

- 103. Wonderful
- 104. Now give her a clap please
- 105. So

## Stanza 24 (Comes to us)

- 106. Jesus comes to us as a king
- 107. Comes to us / as a one who prays for us
- 108. And stands between us and God

- 109. Comes as one / who has come to die for us
- 110. And as somebody says / (the Calvery above which is the mother of all)

Strophe 13 (A place)

Stanza 25 (Consented)

- 111. So / you know/ not only did he consent to dying
- 112. he consented to coming
- 113. and he comes as one of us / so that he may lead us to the rightful God.

Stanza 26 (Tiny village)

- 114. Of course the wise men made a mistake
- 115. They went to the palace / thinking this was where a king would be born
- 116. Of course then they discovered / it was a tiny village called Paull;
  Okay!
- 117. It was just a tiny little village / not a big place / that was where he was born / a place like yours and mine / in order that we may know God.
- 118. Ordinary lodgings / ordinary places like this one / (for prayer)

Strophe 14 (The Love of God)

Stanza 27 (Never failed)

- 119. By the way / I want to congratulate you too as a church
- 120. You are one of those / who has never failed / to contribute to the

#### common fund of the diocese

121. So for that again I am grateful, in spite of all your many celebrations.

## Stanza 28 (Simply)

- 122. You see he comes like one of us
- 123. Not in celebrity, or wealth or security or comfort
- 124. But he simply comes just like a king
- 125. In order to show all of us a love of God
- 126. And all of us can be connected to God.

## Strophe 15 (Forgiveness)

## Stanza 29 (What we need)

- 127. Do you know what we need in the world is not knowledge
- 128. Because if it was knowledge God would have sent a teacher
- 129. It isn't money we need, God would have sent us ....you know ....a billionaire
- 130. If what we needed was happiness God would have sent us an entertainer
- 131. What we needed was forgiveness.

## Stanza 30 (Forgiven)

132. Forgiveness for past sins, new life for the present and hope for the

#### future

- 133. And that is why he sent his son, Jesus Christ
- 134. So that you and I may be forgiven.

## Strophe 16 (New Life)

#### Stanza 31 (Problem of the heart)

- 135. You know the greatest gift, the greatest miracle for all of us
- 136. Is a God constantly forgiving us.
- 137. And we need to be forgiven of the past, given new life in the present
- 138. Because humanity's problem is a problem of the heart, nothing else
- 139. And on that course he comes and gives us new life.

#### Stanza 32 (Beloved)

- 140. We also (learned at the beginning) Jesus Christ was also baptised
- 141. Was baptised by John the Baptist
- 142. And a voice said 'this is my beloved son'

## Part 4 (Child of God)

Strophe 17 (Story)

Stanza 33 (Behave like one)

- 143. I love that wonderful story / told by Archbishop Desmond Tutu
- 144. Written by a teacher in Soweto

145. Of a boy / who gave an interesting answer to a question / during an examination

146. And the question was 'what did John the Baptist say to Jesus when he came to be baptised by John'

147. And the boy said 'John the Baptist said, "now you know you are the Son of God start behaving like one"

Stanza 34 (The boy was right)

148. (I just thought that) lad very bright

149. (Remember at twelve years we hear that Jesus) outstands the teachers of the law

150. (and then for ten) years we don't hear anything from him until he is thirty.

151. So the boy was right, 'Now that you know you are the Son of God start behaving like one'

152. And then / of course / what happened, /the Holy Spirit descends on Jesus / and God says 'you are my beloved son'

Strophe 18 (The Best)

Stanza 35 (Great day)

153. And so dear friends this is a very great day, a great moment, a very

great time,

154. Where you and I give thanks for the restoration of this church, the restoration of the bell and soon the restoration of the vestry.

155. May we bow down and worship him as the wise men, for he is our God and saviour

156. May he cleanse us from all that (is) unworthy,

157. for we are baptised into his death and resurrection

Stanza 36 (Give ourselves)

158. And given new life, and we now live in the power of the Spirit

159. May we day by day continue in this place to be his presence and his love.

160. And may we also like the wise men bring him the best of ourselves

161. Because he is worth every bit of it

162. And the greatest gift you and I can give to Christ is, of course, ourselves

Strophe 19 (Restoration)

Stanza 37 (St Andrew and St Mary)

163. So I am sure that all of you here at St Andrew, by the way you are St Mary

- 164. Your church is dedicated to St Andrew and St Mary
- 165. Don't forget her
- 166. You have understood that I am celebrating the facts,
- 167. The church has been massively restored and may be a symbol of all our lives being restored by the love of God

## Stanza 38 (Wonderful Church)

- 168. Your building is now marvellous
- 169. May the interior of our lives be restored in the same way
- 170. And may this community go on from strength to strength, because you think it matters your centre to have a wonderful church.

#### Strophe 20 (Child of God)

#### Stanza 39 (Relationship)

- 171. So we are celebrating today on this feast,
- 172. Which remembers how Jesus Christ was born
- 173. So that all may be drawn into a life of relationship with God
- 174. And with the communities of love and care
- 175. Will you stand please.

#### Stanza 40 (I'll be back)

176. I will ask you to turn to the person on your left and your right

- 177. And say to them, 'now that you know you are a child of God start behaving like one'
- 178. And if you forget, I'll be back.

**Appendix 5** 

Archbishop of York's sermon: a 'reading' of the focused material for each stanzas

follows with material from different lines separated by cross hatch ('#'), while material

from different idea units in the same line is separated by a comma:

Part 1

Strophe1

Stanza 1: thanks # for the hard work # of restoration

Stanza 2: Epiphany is a very, very rich feast # celebration # restore our relationship with

God # restoration of your church building

Strophe 2

Stanza 3: work not yet complete

Stanza 4: I contribute # hope you will

Part 2

Strophe 3

Stanza 5: Job finished? # Cheque on its way

Stanza 6: travelled far # clue to meaning

Strophe 4

Stanza 7: rare and costly gifts

Stanza 8: Anybody?

Strophe 5

Stanza 9: you are going to help

Stanza 10: I have got some gold

Strophe 6

Stanza 11: have you ever touched gold?

Stanza 12: absolutely pure

Strophe 7

Stanza 13: I have second gift # do you like it?

Stanza 14: you are going to be the person

Strophe 8

Stanza 15: put some more, wonderful lady

Stanza 16: did you see? # it was a Tardis

Strophe 9

Stanza 17: this Jesus # guides us

Stanza 18: wonderful people, give gifts

Strophe 10

Stanza 19: Myrrh # helps

Stanza 20: different from the other

Strophe 11

Stanza 21: gifts # new life

Stanza 22: what should we give you?

Part 3

Strophe 12

Stanza 23: wonderful # give her a clap

Stanza 24: Jesus comes

Strophe 13

Stanza 25: he comes, lead us to God

Stanza 26: mistake

Strophe 14

Stanza 27: you, never failed

Stanza 28: simply # to show love

Strophe 15

Stanza 29: we need # forgiveness

Stanza 30: so that you and I may be forgiven

Strophe 16

Stanza 31:greatest gift # forgiveness # new life

Stanza 32: beloved son

#### Part 4

Strophe 17 Stanza 33: you are the son, behave like one Stanza 34: Holy Spirit descends Strophe 18 Stanza 35: you and I give thanks Stanza 36: given new life # greatest gift, ourselves Strophe 19 Stanza 37: our lives restored Stanza 38: marvellous # interior of our lives restored Strophe 20 Stanza 39: so we are celebrating Stanza 40: you are a child of God

This reading of the sermon is only partial and schematic

## Appendix 6

Bishop of Knaresborough's text as verse marked with lines, strophes and stanzas.

Part 1 (The Crisis Facing the Church)

- 1. You will be glad to know / that I have resisted the temptation / particularly to this day
- 2. so it isn't going to be a sermon on being fools for Christ.
- 3. At least I hope you will be glad to know that

Strophe 1 (The crisis)

Stanza 1 (Recognition)

- 4. It seems particularly appropriate / in this week of all weeks / to recognize the crises facing the church
- 5. The end of Christendom / characterised in the 'Death of Christian Britain' by Callum Brown / and with it the loss of a guaranteed place in society
- 6. The reduction of the numbers of stipendiary clergy / and the growth of the size of benefices
- 7. The aging congregations / and the alienation of young people
- 8. The financial crisis / which some would say is a spiritual crisis

#### Stanza 2 (Crises of the world)

- 9. I suppose they mean a want of generosity on the one hand / and the lack of vision on the other
- 10. Revelations of child abuse /which have been particularly devastating for the church in Ireland / and now in Germany
- 11. The list could go on / and include the crises of the world of which we are a part;
- 12. climate change, poverty, recession, terrorism

#### Strophe 2 (Crisis helps?)

#### Stanza 3 (Recognize)

- 13. The aim is not to depress you,
- 14. though I do, I do get a sense of sinking spirits as I run through that list.
- 15. The aim isn't to depress,
- 16. but to suggest that we need to recognize and be real about the crises that beset us
- 17. And hang on in there.

#### Stanza 4 (A good thing)

- 18. Crisis may strangely be a good thing; we do after all call tomorrow Good Friday
- 19. Crisis invites reflection on and reappraisal of who and how we are church
- 20. Perhaps crisis helps us to hear again who and how we are called to be.

#### Part 2 (To Love As Christ Loves)

Strophe 3 (A New Commandment)

Stanza 5 (Mandatum Novum)

- 21. And so to the theme of this day; a new commandment; a new mandate; mandatum novum
- 22. As we have been reminded, the traditional English name of this day
- 23. Comes of course from that mandatum
- 24. Love one another as I have loved you
- 25. Is the new mandate; the ever renewed mandate

#### Stanza 6 (To love as Christ)

- 26. Since there already was the commandment to love your neighbour as you love yourself
- 27. It has been suggested that the novelty of this mandate
- 28. Was in the injunction to love one another as I have loved you
- 29. To love as Christ has loved
- 30. That's quite a development of, even a departure from, love your neighbour as you love yourself

Strophe 4 (Converting Word)

Stanza 7 (Taken to heart)

31. Love one another as I have loved you / heard and taken to heart

- 32. These are converting words
- 33. I remember clearly the impact it made on Jean
- 34. It was Maundy Thursday evening
- 35. The sermon focused on the implications of the application of the new covenant

#### Stanza 8 (Jean)

- 36. Jean was visibly moved / she was crying
- 37. And later she said how the new commandment / those words of Jesus
- 38. Had moved her to lay aside / a long standing and bitter resentment of another member of the church
- 39. And to seek reconciliation
- 40. Costly, costly as that undoubtedly was.

#### Strophe 5 (Calling of the Church)

#### Stanza 9 (New commandment)

- 41. During the bible study at my bishop's cell group the other week
- 42. I was struck by Gordon Mercer's observation that the new commandment
- 43. Encapsulates perfectly the calling of the church.

#### Stanza 10 (Mutual love)

- 44. Mutual love is fundamentally what the church is about.
- 45. What the church exists to practice; to demonstrate

46. That's because mutual love is the reflection, the demonstration, the incarnation of the love of the Trinity.

Strophe 6 (Revelation)

Stanza 11 (Love for one another)

- 47. CK Barrett comments 'the commandment is new in that it corresponds to the command that regulates the relation between Jesus and the Father'
- 48. The love of the disciples for one another is not merely edifying
- 49. It reveals the Father and the Son
- 50. Love for one another is not merely edifying
- 51. It reveals the Father and the Son.

Stanza 12 (Signs)

- 52. So
- 53. Is the church church
- 54. If it lacks signs of mutual love?
- 55. What are those signs?
- 56. Surely they must be the marks of Christ?

Strophe 7 (Washing Feet)

Stanza 13 (His love)

- 57. In the Gospel Christ's love was demonstrated in advance of the new commandment
- 58. In the washing of the disciples' feet
- 59. His love would have the absolute and ultimate demonstration on the cross.
- 60. His love was also demonstrated, of course, in the forgiveness and reconciliation
- 61. Of those who had failed, misunderstood and denied him.

#### Stanza 14 (Servile status)

- 62. Of the washing of the feet / Richard Baucombe / in the excellent 'Testimony of the Beloved Disciple' says
- 63. 'Jesus / knowing that the Father had given him the –unite- uniquely divine Lordship of all creation / undertook the role of a slave
- 64. performing for his disciples' the act most expressive of servile status'.

#### Strophe 8 (A New Relationship)

#### Stanza 15 (Self humiliation)

- 65. The one who can claim the highest status; in all reality sovereign over all creation
- 66. Humbles himself to the lowest human status;
- 67. Expressing his Lordship in self humiliating service for his social inferiors.
- 68. A radical overturning of common cultural values with respect to status
- 69. Is applied.

#### Stanza 16 (Rejection)

- 70. He goes on to suggest
- 71. That mutual foot washing has clear meaning as a key to rejection of social hierarchy
- 72. And a new form of social relationship based on Jesus' example.

#### Part 3 (The Church)

Strophe 9 (Service)

Stanza 17 (More free)

- 73. Maybe as we emerge from Christendom
- 74. The church is better placed to hear this message than it has been for a long time.
- 75. More free to hear this message than it has been for a long time.

#### Stanza 18 (A humble church)

- 76. Love requires that we serve,
- 77. We abandon status and whatever else separates us from others
- 78. One of those things of course is power.
- 79. Timothy Radcliffe reflects on this in the aftermath of the crisis caused by revelations of child abuse.
- 80. His article in the Tablet is entitled 'Towards a Humble Church'

#### Strophe 10 (A New Culture)

#### Stanza 19 (Power can corrupt)

- 81. He says 'this terrible crisis of sexual abuse / is deeply linked / to the way that power can corrupt human relationships.
- 82. Which is why it touches all the churches / even if the Catholic Church happens to have it more in the spotlight recently.
- 83. We will not have a church which is safe for the young / until we learn from Christ
- 84. And become again a humble church / in which we are all equal children of the Father / and authority is never oppressive.

## Stanza 20 (The life of the Trinity)

- 85. He goes on / 'we need a new culture of authority from the Vatican to the Parish Council' / let the reader adjust as appropriate,
- 86. which is the life of the Trinity.
- 87. Radcliffe reaches this 'int', this 'er' interesting conclusion / worthy of reflection / as ministers reaffirm their commitment to their ministry.
- 88. He says 'Jesus promises rest for our souls. Often we priests are consumed by a destructive activism in the service of the people'.

#### Strophe 11 (Violence)

#### Stanza 21 (Hyperactivism)

- 89 Thomas Merton believed
- 90. this hyperactivism was a collusion with the violence of our society.

91. Quote: 'The rush and pressure of modern life are a form, perhaps the most common form, of its innate violence.

#### Stanza 22 (To succumb)

- 92. To allow oneself to be carried away by modern attitude of conflicting concerns
- 93. To surrender to too many demands
- 94. To commit oneself to too many projects
- 95. To want to help everyone in everything
- 96. Is to succumb to violence, more than that it is cooperation in violence'

#### Strophe 12 (Recalling the church)

## Stanza 23 (Infect)

- 97. If we let this implicit violence infect our lives
- 98. Then it will come out somehow.
- 99. Thought provoking, I hope.

#### Stanza 24 (Mandate)

- 100. That crisis which Timothy is addressing
- 101. Like all the others is recalling the church to the calling of Christ
- 102. To who and to how Christ is
- 103. Which is the mandate for who and how we are to be.
- 104. Love one another as I have loved you. Cu::k

Strophe 13	(New Form of Social Relationship)
Stanza 25	(What does it look like)
105.	The new commandment / is obviously begging to find expression / in
	the life of every local Christian community
106.	What does it look like when it does?
107.	Do we see, for example, a new form of social relationship based on
	Jesus' example?
108.	The washing of the feet is clearly culturally conditioned
109.	What might be the equivalent?
Stanza 26	(Is it possible?)
110.	Can it be practiced among a, across the 'den' denominational divides?
111.	Can it apply to the churches of a diocese?
112.	Can it find expression in the clergy of deaneries? Indeed of the
	diocese?
Strophe 14	(Can we become?)
Stanza 27	(What would be different?)
113.	What would it look like if it did? Or did more than it does now?
114.	What would be the signs of mutual love in the likeness of Christ?
115.	What would be different?
116.	What would things look like if it was the basis of the arrangements
	attending the ordination of women to the episcopate?

How would it shape the debate about sexuality?

## Stanza 28 (Coda)

- Have we got anything to show the world / about mutual attention and regard? / About forgiveness and restoration? /
- 119. About being in community
- 120. By this / shall everyone know / that you are my disciples
- 121. If you have love for one another.
- 122. Can we become Can we become more fully / a humble church and a sacrificial church /and a merciful church.

## Appendix 7

## Bishop of Knaresborough's mainline themes in his sermon

# Part 1 Strophe 1 Stanza 1: to recognize the crises, facing the church Stanza 2: the crises of the world Strophe 2 Stanza 3: the aim is not to depress Stanza 4: crises may be a good thing Part 2 Strophe 3 Stanza 5: a new commandment Stanza 6: to love as Christ Strophe 4 Stanza 7: converting words Stanza 8: to seek reconciliation

Strophe 5 Stanza 9: the calling of the church Stanza 10: mutual love Strophe 6 Stanza 11: love for one another # reveals the Father and the Son Stanza 12: signs Strophe 7 Stanza 13: love demonstrated Stanza 14: servile status Strophe 8 Stanza 15: self humiliating service Stanza 16: rejection of social hierarchy # new form of social relationship Part 3 Strophe 9 Stanza 17: more free, to hear this message Stanza 18: love requires that we serve # a more humble church Strophe 10

Stanza 19: power can corrupt

Stanza 20: new culture # life of the Trinity Strophe 11 Stanza 21: hyperactivism, a collusion with violence Stanza 22: to succumb to violence Strophe 12 Stanza 23: infect our lives Stanza 24: recalling the church Strophe 13 Stanza 25: the new commandment # what does it look like? Stanza 26: can it find expression? Strophe 14

Stanza 27: what would be different?

Stanza 28: can we become?

## Appendix 9

#### The Archbishop of Canterbury

Born in Swansea in 1950 the Archbishop of Canterbury is Welsh-speaking. He was educated at Dynevor School in Swansea, going on to study theology at Christ's College Cambridge. He studied for his Doctorate – the theology of Vladimir Lossky, a leading figure in twentieth century Russian thought – at Wadham College Oxford taking his DPhil. in 1975. The Archbishop spent two years as a lecturer at the College of the Resurrection in Mirfield near Leeds, after which he was ordained deacon in Ely Cathedral before returning to Cambridge. He was ordained priest in Cambridge and spent nine years in academic and parish work there. He considers himself a poet and translator. In 1991 he was consecrated Bishop of Monmouth and in 1999 he became archbishop of Wales, Primate of the Anglican Communion. In December 2002, he became the 104<sup>th</sup> Bishop of the See of Canterbury; the first Welsh successor to St Augustine of Canterbury and the first since the thirteenth century to be appointed from beyond the English Church. He is acknowledged internationally as an outstanding theological writer, scholar and teacher.

#### The Archbishop of York

The Archbishop of York was born in Uganda's Buffalo Clan in 1949. He was the sixth of thirteen children, educated by the English missionaries and teachers, and graduated in Law at the University of Makerere in Kampala. He is an Advocate of the High Court of Uganda. The Archbishop practiced Law at the Bar and on the Bench before he came to UK in 1974 when he read theology at Selwyn College Cambridge where he gained a

Masters and a Doctorate. He trained for the ordained ministry ate Ridley Hall

Cambridge and after his ordination in 1979 he served as an assistant chaplain at Selwyn

College; he was chaplain at HM Remand centre Latchmere House and curate of St

Andrew's Ham in the Diocese of Southwark. In 1996 he was consecrated Bishop of

Stepney and in 2002 he became the Bishop of Birmingham. It was in 2005 he became

the Archbishop of York; Primate of England and Metropolitan member of the House of

Lords and Privy Councillor.

#### The Bishop of Knaresborough

The Bishop of Knaresborough was born and bred in the Eden Valley in Cumbria. He was a parish priest for 11 years (with one mediaeval and two modern churches) and he was an Area Dean for three years looking after 30 parishes and 60 clergy. For four years he acted as Adviser for Ministry and was Director of Ministry Training Programme at Willesden. He then became Director of Ministry & Training for the Diocese of Ripon & Leeds and was also Residentiary Canon of Ripon Cathedral. Following that he was appointed as Director of Mission for the Diocese of Ripon & Leeds; consecrated Bishop of Knaresborough in 2007

#### The Dean of Ripon Cathedral

The Dean of Ripon Cathedral was born in 1954 and is married with two grown up children. Following his degree at Leeds University and further training at Lincoln theological College, he served in ministry for twenty-nine years in the dioceses of Lichfield, York and now Ripon and Leeds. The Dean served in major parishes as well

as serving as a Rural Dean and as a Prebendary of Lichfield Cathedral. In addition to his parochial ministry, he has also served as a theological college lecturer and as a non-executive director of the York Hospitals NHS Trust. He was appointed Dean of Ripon Cathedral in March 2007 having previously served as Vicar of Selby for the previous ten years.

## Appendix 10

## **Areas Covered in the DThMin Programme**

The DThmin programme offered an opportunity to discover whether there was any connection between the language used in preaching and society's sometimes negative attitude towards the institution of the church. Initially it was unclear how to make this connection in a way that was other than intuitive. The course kindled a hope that there was a more rational approach to discovering the connection.

The assignments in the first year of the course were possibly a means to re-introduce participants into thinking theologically. Choosing ethics, doctrine and education as subjects to focus on, at the time, appeared to be random choices made out of interest rather than design, but proved in hindsight to be instrumental in moving towards the ultimate goal. The Doctrine assignment looked at what kind of knowledge doctrine is and whether it needs to have a performative element to it to justify it by looking at the work of various theologians from a post-liberal context, accepting orthodox tradition as the base line. Having established an understanding of doctrine and what kind of knowledge it is, the effect that doctrine has on the belief system of the ordinary person in the pew was determined, using recent, not yet published research, to gain a feel for the effect it has on the fostering of the Christian faith today. Questions were asked about doctrine: What kind of knowledge is it? Can it be tested or compared with other kinds of knowledge? Is it a technical knowing or is it a knowing, which requires faith? Does knowing a doctrine have anything to do with knowing how to live out faith? Does it need a performative element in order to validate it? Having attempted to answer these questions this assignment concluded that for doctrine to be a resource not an obstacle to

fostering the Christian faith then presentation and listener participation are the key to doctrine to pass from 'savoir' to 'connaitre'.

The Education assignment looked at Freire's philosophy of education in relation to the Anglican Church to illustrate how the present mode of training clergy fell into the technique that Freire condemns as being oppressive, and as a result forces congregations into a similar oppression. The application of Freire's philosophy to theological education was examined and demonstrated the possible positive effect of changing the present approach to training by incorporating Freire's philosophy. In a similar way to the Doctrine assignment the Education assignment concluded that authentic ministry concerns dialogue and collaboration. In a very different way the Ethics assignment examined the question of Euthanasia and Palliative Care as responses to caring for the suffering-dying. Using an autobiographical approach of the style of Tania Oldenhage (2002) the assignment compared the two approaches to dying in order to discover a personal position in the light of parish ministry. The study of a particular point of view illustrated the view that death can cause a human being to become what he/she is called to become and demonstrated that to be fully human is paramount to good ministry. In each assignment the focus on language and its sermonic use kept emerging as being important alongside recognition that the socio-historical context of the preacher is equally significant.

The second year assignments were no less significant. The Christian Worship assignment argued that worship could be political from two perspectives; that it is political action because it causes those who worship to consider what is true

discipleship; it smashes and casts to earth every sort of barrier and prejudice. It focussed particularly on the effect of worship on the participants and the consideration of the space/time issue of worship recognizing the breakdown of those boundaries through Eucharistic worship. In a discussion on worship Ann Morisy was quoted as saying that apt liturgy is a way of providing a framework of understanding, which helps people to move beyond self-centred and narrow horizons. She maintains that the language of both modern and traditional liturgy can denote links with our forebears, as well as help us understand our relationship to the struggles being acted out in today's world Morrisy, 1998, p, 238). The assignment concluded that worship is a political act because: it encourages those who partake to reconsider lifestyle choices, attitude to God and neighbour and to transform their behaviour creating a community of witness. Similarly the Culture assignment focused on an embodied theology suggesting that theology, as a part of culture, became a way of talking about theology in terms of what it meant to be human. The assignment referred to Gordon Kaufman who suggests that focusing attention on the anthropological idea that culture was a human universal, a defining feature of human life. As a result, the meaning and significance of theology were primarily assessed with reference to the general features of some universal cultural enterprise, one that proceeded along much the same lines in all times and places (Kaufman, 1993, chps 1-5).

Both of these assignments preceded the Ministerial Focussed Study, which looked at the issue of language and whether language obscures belief. Each of the assignments that lead to the Empirical Research Project in the third year of study progressed the view that sermonic language is significant in its influence on listeners and their development of a relationship with God. The assignments in the three years preceding the Research

Based Thesis were all instrumental in clarifying the question that became the basis of the thesis. The Doctrine assignment recognized the importance of listener participation and presentation; the education assignment recognized authentic ministry is concerned with dialogue and collaboration; the Ethics assignment recognized the importance of sermonic language alongside the significance of socio-historical context; the Worship assignment recognized the involvement of listeners; the Culture assignment recognized the meaning and significance of theology is a universal defining feature of human life. Each section of the programme signposted the final Research Based Thesis question. But to fully understand the importance of sermonic language in homiletics it is, however, necessary to include the discipline of linguistics. By discovering, in a very minor way, the insights into language creation and use that linguistics offers linked together each point of the DThMin programme to formulate the idea of the research thesis.

# **Bibliography**

Allen, R.J., (2008), 'Thinking Theologically', Minneapolis, Augsburgh Fortress.

Atkinson, M., (2005), 'Our Masters' Voices', New York, Routledge

Atkinson J.M. & Heritage, J. (eds), (2003), 'Structures of Social Action: Studies in Conversation Analysis', Cambridge, Cambridge University Press

Auer, P., (ed), (2007), 'Style and Social Identities: Alternative Approaches to Linguistic Heterogeneity', Berlin, Mouton De Gruyter

**Bakhtin, M.M.,** (2008), 'The Dialogic Imagination: Four Essays', Austin, Texas University Press

Ballard, P. and Pritchard, J., (2001), London, SPCK

Barth, K., (1991), 'Homiletics', Louisville, John Knox Press.

**Bateson, G.,** (2000), 'Steps To An Ecology of Mind', Chicago, University of Chicago Press

**Black, D.A.,** (1992), 'Linguistics and New Testament Interpretation: Essays on Discourse Analysis', Nashville, Broadman Press

**Bosch, D.J.,** (2008), 'Transforming Mission: Paradigm Shifts in Theology of Mission', Maryknoll, Orbis Books

Bourdieu, P. (1998), 'On Television', New York, New York Press

(2010), 'Language and Symbolic Power', Cambridge, Polity Press

(2010), 'Outline of a Theory of Practice', Cambridge, Cambridge

**University Press** 

**Browning, D.S.,** (1996), 'A Fundamental Practical Theology', Minneapolis, Fortress Press

**Burke, K.,** (1968), 'Language as Symbolic Action: Essays on Life, Literature and Method', Berkley, Los Angeles, London, University of California Press

**Butler, J.,** (1997), 'Excitable Speech: A Politics of the Performative', New York, Routledge

Crossan, J.D., (1991), The Historical Jesus: The Life of a Mediterranean Jewish Peasant', Edinburgh, T&TClark.

Coupland, N., and Jaworski, A., (eds), (1997), 'Sociolinguistics: A Reader and Coursebook', Basingstoke, Palgrave Macmillan

Carlson, M., (2009), 'Performance: A Critical Introduction', London, Routledge

Cameron, D., (2004), 'Working With Spoken Discourse', London, Sage Publications

Ltd

**Connolly, B.,** (1996), 'Preaching: Problems of Communication', *The Furrow,* Vol. 17, No.2, pp.81-91, (February)

Day, D., Astley, J., and Francis, L.J., (2005), 'A Reader on Preaching: Making Connections', Surrey, Ashgate Publishing Ltd.

**Drew, P., & Heritage, J., (eds)**, (1998), 'Talk at Work: Interaction in Institutional Settings', Cambridge, Cambridge University Press

**Duranti, A., (ed)**, (2001), 'Linguistic Anthropology: A Reader', Oxford, Blackwell Publishing

Eckert, P., and Rickford, J.R., (eds), (2001). 'Style and Sociolinguistic Variation', Cambridge, Cambridge University Press

Edwards, O.C., (2004) 'A History of Preaching' Nashville, TN: Abingdon Press

Erickson, F., (2008), 'Talk and Social Theory', Cambridge, Polity Press

Fairclough, N., (2001), 'Language and Power', Essex, Pearson Education Ltd.

(2007), 'Discourse and Social Change', Cambridge, Polity press

(2009), 'Analysing Discourse: Textual analysis for Social

Research', London, Routledge

**Farley, E.,** (2001), 'Theologia: the Fragmentation and Unity of Theological Education', Oregon, Wipf and Stock Publishers

**Francis, L.J.** (2010), 'Five Loaves and Two Fishes: An Empirical Study in Psychological; Type and Biblical Hermeneutics among Anglican Preachers', University of Warwick

**Gee, J.P.,** 1991, 'A Linguistic Approach to Narrative' *Journal of Narrative and Life History,* 1.1, pp.15-39

**Gill, J.H.,** (1964), 'Wittgenstein and Religious Language', *Theology Today*, Vol.21, No.1, (April)

Graham, E., Walton, H. and Ward, F., (2005), 'Theological Reflection: Methods', London, SCM Press

Grice, P., (1991), 'Studies In The Way Of Words', USA, Harvard University Press
Goffman, E., (1981), 'Forms of Talk', Philadelphia, University of Pennsylvania Press
(1990), 'The Presentation of Self in Everyday Life', London, Penguin

#### **Books**

**Grenfell, M., (ed),** (2010), 'Pierre Bourdieu: Key Concepts', Durham, Acumen Publishing Ltd

Gumperz, J.J and Hymes, D., (1986), 'Directions in Sociolinguistics: The Ethnography of Communication', Oxford, Basil Blackwell Ltd.

**Georgakopoulou, A., & Goutsos, D.,** (2001), 'Discourse Analysis: An Introduction', Edinburgh, Edinburgh University Press

**Howden, W.D.,** (1989), "Good Sermon, Preacher": The Effects of Age, Sex, and Education on Hearer Response to Preaching', *Review of Religious Research*, Vol 31 No.2 (December)

**Hymes, D.,** (2007), 'Ethnography, Linguistics, Narrative Inequality: Towards An Understanding of Voice', London, Taylor and Francis

**Jewitt, C.,** (2009), 'Technology, Literacy, Learning: A Multimodal Approach', Oxon, Routledge

**Kaufman, G.D.,** (1993) 'In the Face of Mystery: A Constructive Theology', Cambridge Mass., Harvard University Press

Lackoff, G., and Johnson, M., (2003), 'Metaphors We Live By', Chicago, Chicago University Press

Levinson, S.C. 1979, 'Activity Types and Language' Linguistics 17, pp.365-399

Long, T.G., and Farley, E., (eds) (1996), 'Preaching As A Theological Task: Word, Gospel, Scripture', Louisville, John Knox Press.

**Long, G.,** 'The Use of Scripture in Contemporary Preaching' *Interpretation 44*, pp.341-355

Lowry, E.L., (1989), 'How To preach A parable: Designs for Narrative Sermons',
Nashville, Abingdon Press

(2001), 'The Homiletical Plot: The Sermon as Narrative Art Form',
Louisville, John Knox Press

Ludin, R., Walhout, C., Thiselton, A.C., (1999), 'The Promise of Hermeneutics', Michigan, Wm. B. Eerdmans Publishing Co., Paternoster Press

McGrath, A., (2010), 'Mere Theology', London, SPCK

**Morisy, A.,** (1998) 'Praxis, Prayer and Liturgy in a Secular World', *Urban Theology: A Reader*, (ed) M. Northcott, London, Cassell

**Nichols, J.R.,** (1980), 'Building the Word: the dynamics of communication and preaching', San Francisco, Harper and Row Publishers.

Pasquarello 111 M., (2009) on Kay, J.F., (2007), 'Preaching and Theology', *Theology Today*, 65:543

Peterson, E.H., (1994), 'The Message', Colorado, NavPress Publishing Group

**Praamsma, L.,** (1987), 'Before the Face of God: A Study of the Heidelberg Catechism Lord's Day 1-24', Ontario, Paideia Press Ltd.

**Resener**, **A.**, (1999), 'Preacher and Cross: Person and Message in Theology and Rhetoric', Cambridge, Eerdmans Publishing Co.

Reay, D., David, M.E. and Ball, S., (2009), 'Degrees of Choice: social class, race and gender in higher education', Staffordshire, Trentham Books Ltd.

**Saville-Troike, M.,** (2009), 'The Ethnography of Communication: An Introduction', Oxford, Blackwell Publishing

**Schlafer, D.,** (1995), 'Your Way with God's Word: Discovering Your Distinctive Preaching Voice', Maryland, Rowman and Littlefield Publishers Inc.

**Stillar, G.F.**,(1998), 'Analyzing Everyday Texts: Discourse, Rhetoric, and Social Perspectives', California, Sage Publications Inc.

**Tannen, D.,** (2007), 'Talking Voices: Repetition, dialogue and imagery in conversational discourse', Cambridge, Cambridge University Press

**Toulmin, S.,** (2003), 'Return To Reason', Cambridge, Mass., Harvard University Press (2008), 'The uses of Argument', New York, Cambridge University Press

**Volf, M., and Bass, D.,** (eds) (2002), 'Practicing Theology: Beliefs and Practices in Christian Life', Grand Rapids, Michigan, Eerdmans Publishing Co.

**Vygotsky**, **L.**, (1986), 'Thought and Language', Cambridge, Mass., The Massachusetts Institute of Technology

Walker, A., (2004), 'Telling the Story: Gospel, Mission and Culture', Eugene, Oregon, Wipf and Stock Publishers

Webb, J., Schirato, T., and Danaher, G., (2008), 'Understanding Bourdieu', London, Sage Publications

**Wenger, E.,** (2002), 'Communities of Practice: Learning, Meaning, and Identity', New York, Cambridge University Press

Williams, R., (2000), 'On Christian Theology', Oxford, Blackwell Publishing

**Wright, S.,** (2010), 'Alive to the Word: A Practical Theology of Preaching for the Whole Church', London, SCM Press.

# Appendix 8

ABC*	BJ**	ABY***	DRC****
Part 1:The Message From Iraq	Part 1: The Crisis Facing the Church	Part 1: Restoring the Church	Part 1: Pentecost on the \Green
Strophe 1: Cost	Strophe 1: The Crisis	Strophe 1: Celebration	Strophe 1: Going Out for the Day
Stanza 1. Seeking justice	Stanza 1. Recognition (5)	Stanza 1. Thanks (5)	Stanza 1. At the Cathedral (3)
Stanza 2. Unexpected qualities	Stanza 2. Crises of the world (4)	Stanza 2. Thanksgiving (5)	Stanza 2. News (3)
Strophe 2: The situation	Strophe 2: Crisis Helps?	Strophe 2: The Vestry	Strophe 2: The Journey
Stanza 3. The conflict in Iraq	Stanza 3. Recognize (5)	Stanza 3. Not Complete (3)	Stanza 3. Preaching (2)
Stanza 4. Complicated world	Stanza 4. A Good Thing (3)	Stanza 4. Contribution (5)	Stanza 4. Bainbridge (3)
	Part 2: Love as Christ Loves	Part 2: The Epiphany of Christ	
Strophe 3: Obedience and Responsibility	Strophe 3: A New Commandment	Strophe 3: Gifts	Strophe 3: Celebration
Stanza 5. Service men and women	Stanza 5. Mandatum Novum (5)	Stanza 5. Job Done (5)	Stanza 5. Pentecost (5)
Stanza 6. Obedience	Stanza 6. To Love As Christ (5)	Stanza 6. Meaning of Christmas (3)	Stanza 6. Approval (4)
Strophe 4: Tough Challenges	Strophe 4: Converting Word	Strophe 4: Birthdays	Strophe 4: The Challenge
Stanza 7. Everyone knows	Stanza 7. Taken to Heart (5)	Stanza 7. Three Gifts (5)	Stanza 7. Being talked about (5)
Stanza 8. Responsibility	Stanza 8. Jean (5)	Stanza 8. Children's Birthday (3)	Stanza 8. Double the Number (6)
			Part 2: The Story
Strophe 5: Winning Trust	Strophe 5: Calling of the Church	Strophe 5: Gold	Strophe 5: The Scripture
Stanza 9. Demanding Task	Stanza 9. New Commandment (3)	Stanza 9. Come up (5)	Stanza 9. Getting ready for St Paul (3)
Stanza 10. Capacity of every serving soldier	Stanza 10. Mutual Love (3)	Stanza 10. Katie (5)	Stanza 10 What St Paul Says (4)
Part 2:The Message of Scripture			
Strophe 6: Scriptural Resonance	Strophe 6: Revelation	Strophe 6: The Wise Men	Strophe 6: The Train Crash
Stanza 11 Healing and building	Stanza 11 Love For One another (5)	Stanza 11 The first Gift (5)	Stanza 11 In A Field (5)
Stanza 12 Special resonance	Stanza 12 Signs (5)	Stanza 12 Pure Gold (3)	Stanza 12 Cold Morning (4)

Strophe 7: The Enemy	Strophe 7: Washing Feet	Strophe 7: Second Gift	Strophe 7: Telephone Call
Stanza 13. Visible and invisible	Stanza 13 His Love (5)	Stanza 13 Frankincense (5)	Stanza 13 Living in Selby (4)
Stanza 14. Hidden	Stanza 14 Servile status (3)	Stanza 14 Charcoal (5)	Stanza 14 Train Disaster (4)
Strophe 8: St Paul's Advice	Strophe 8: A New Relationship	Strophe 8: Fire	Strophe 8: One of the First
Stanza 15. Remote ideals	Stanza 15 Self Humiliation (5)	Stanza 15 Wonderful Lady (5)	Stanza 15 Never Forgotten (5)
Stanza 16. Essential advice	Stanza 16 Rejection (3)	Stanza 16 ahhh!	Stanza 16 Majestic (3)
	Part 3: The Church		
Strophe 9: Reflecting the Cost of Justice	Strophe 9: Service	Strophe 9: Jesus	Strophe 9: People
Stanza 17. Be grateful	Stanza 17 More Free (3)	Stanza 17 Prayers (5)	Stanza 17 God Help Us (3)
Stanza 18. Cost of justice	Stanza 18 A Humble Church (5)	Stanza 18 Another Gift (5)	Stanza 18 Lady in the Mist (5)
Strophe 10: Reflecting on Individual Cost	Strophe 10: A New Culture	Strophe 10: The Last Gift	Strophe 10: Wandering Aimlessly
Stanza 19. Holding back	Stanza 19 Power Can Corrupt (4)	Stanza 19 Myrrh (5)	Stanza 19 Please Help Me (4)
Stanza 20. Individual cost	Stanza 20 Life of the Trinity (4)	Stanza 20 Different (5)	Stanza 20 Shock (3)
Strophe 11: Reflecting on Cost of Love	Strophe 11: Violence	Strophe 11: So Good	Strophe 11: At the Nursing Station
Stanza 21. Sacrifice	Stanza 21 Hyperactivism (3)	Stanza 21 New Life (5)	Stanza 21 In the Barn (4)
Stanza 22. Cost of love	Stanza 22 To succumb (5)	Stanza 22 Think about It (5)	Stanza 22 Not Religious (4)
		Part 3: Jesus	
Strophe 12: Reflecting on Reality	Strophe 12: Recalling the Church	Strophe 12: Comes as a King	Strophe 12: Shirley
Stanza 23. Doubting	Stanza 23 Infect (3)	Stanza 23 Appreciation (3)	Stanza 23 Can you Find My Husband (4)
Stanza 24. Forgetting	Stanza 24 Mandate (5)	Stanza 24 Comes to Us (5)	Stanza 24 No Coat On (5)
Strophe 13: A Time	Strophe 13: New Form of social relationship	Strophe 13: A Place	Strophe 13: Horror
Stanza 25. Learned silence	Stanza 25 What Does it Look Like? (5)	Stanza 25 Consented (3)	Stanza 25 The Sheer Force (4)

Stanza 26. Coda	Stanza 26 Is it possible? (3)	Stanza 26 Tiny Village (5)	Stanza 26 The Last I Saw (4)
	Strophe 14: Can We Be?	Strophe 14: The Love of God	Strophe 14: The Memorial Service
	Stanza 27 What Would Be Different? (5)	Stanza 27 Never failed (3)	Stanza 27 I Saw Her Again (4)
	Stanza 28 Coda (5)	Stanza 28 Simply (5)	Stanza 28 After The Service (4)
		Strophe 15: Forgiveness	Strophe 15: Moving the Story on
		Stanza 29 What we Need (5)	Stanza 29 The scars (3)
		Stanza 30 Forgiven (3)	Part 3: The Wonder of God
			Stanza 30 One Year Later (5)
		Strophe 16: New Life	Strophe 16: What Happened Next
		Stanza 31 Problem of the Heart (5)	Stanza 31 A Smile (4)
		Stanza 32 Beloved (3)	Stanza 32 Lost the Will to Live (4)
		Part 4: Child of God	
		Strophe 17: Story	Strophe 17:The Church
		Stanza 33 Behave Like I (5)	Stanza 33 Open Door (4)
		Stanza 34 The Boy Was Right (5)	Stanza 34 Through the Door (4)
		Strophe 18: The Best	Strophe 18: God Takes Hold
		Stanza 35 Great Day (5)	Stanza 35 Wonderful People (4)
		Stanza 36 Give Ourselves (5)	Stanza 36 Part of the Community (4)
		Strophe 19: Restoration	Strophe 19: Growing in Faith
		Stanza 37 St Andrew and St Mary (5)	Stanza 37 Joining in (4)
		Stanza 38 Wonderful Church (3)	Stanza 38 Church Warden
		Strophe 20: Child of God	Strophe 20: This is What God Does

Stanza 39 Relationship (5)

Stanza 40 Coda (3)

Stanza 39 People who are there (4)

Stanza 40 Those who serve (3)

#### Strophe 21: Gifts

Stanza 41 Builds us Up (4)

Stanza 42 Transformed Lives (4)

#### Strophe 22: Gifts

Stanza 43 Wherever We Are (4)

Stanza 44 Be Yourself (4)

#### Strophe 23: God is Responsible

Stanza 45 Being There (4)

Stanza 46 Coda (5)